Indigenous Policy (IPJ) publishes articles, commentary, reviews, news, and announcements concerning Native American and international Indigenous affairs, issues, events, nations, groups and media. We invite commentary and dialogue in and between issues.

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

ISN and IPJ information...................................................................................................................................................... p. 1
Upcoming Events...................................................................................................................................................................... p. 4

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE WESTERN SOCIAL SCIENCE ASSOCIATION 2018 MEETING AMERICAN INDIAN STUDIES SECTION**

Kayla DeVault. “The Energy Efficiency and Cultural Significance of Traditional Housing: Comparing the Navajo Nation and Pueblo of Acoma in an Effort to Reform Federal Indian Programs”........................................................................................................................................................... p. 22

Richard M. Wheelock, PhD, “Native and Indigenous Scholars and Journalists in the ‘Post-Truth’ Communications Environment” ................................................................................................................................................. p. 33

Stephen M. Sachs, “Learning in the Circle: Applying American Indian Ways To Improving Education in Contemporary Mainstream America” ...................................................................................................................................................... p. 57

**Articles:**

As IPJ is now a refereed journal, articles may be posted on a different schedule from the rest of the journal. We will send out an e-mail announcement when the next set of articles are posted, and can be downloaded as a pdf file. **Current articles are available with list on line at:** http://www.indigenouspolicy.org/ipjblog/.

Ph.D. Dissertations from Universities Around the World on Topics Relating to Indians in the Americas........................................................................................................................................................................ p. 103
Useful Web Sites...................................................................................................................................................................... p. 103

**Co-Editors:**

Phil Bellfy, American Indian Studies Program, Michigan State University, 262 Bessey Hall, East Lansing MI 48824, (517)432-2193, bellfy@msu.edu.

Thomas Brasdefer, thomasbrasdefer@gmail.com, Web Master.

Ted Cloak, tcloak@unm.edu, Environmental Editor

Thaddeius (Tad) Conner, Mexico State University: conner03@nmsu.edu.

Russel Diabo, rdiabo@rogers.com, Canada Editor

Jonathon Erlen, Ph.D., History of Medicine Librarian, School of Medicine, University of
Pittsburgh (412)648-8927, erlen@pitt.edu.
Lee Francis, IV, natiVEREALITIES@GMAIL.COM, Popular Culture Editor
Leo Killsback, American Indian Studies, Arizona State University, Discovery Hall, Room 356, P.O. Box 874603, Tempe, AZ 85287-4603, (480)727-0061, lkillsba@asu.edu, Editor
Moki Kokorisko, moki.kokorisko@gmail.com, Facebook Coordinator & Arctic Editor
Eileen Luna-Firebaugh, eluna@email.arizona.edu
Anne Luna-Gordinier, Assistant Professor, California State University, Sacramento, (916)278-7961, luna-gordinier@csus.edu
Paula Mohan, Political Science Department, 305 Salisbury Hall, University of Wisconsin, Whitewater, Whitewater, WI 53190 (262)472-5772 (o), (608)233-2812(h), paulamohan@gmail.com.
Teresa Lynn Newberry, 520-275-2855; terranewberry@gmail.com, Traditional Knowledge Editor
Michael Posluns, Daytime & Cell: (416)995-8613, mposluns@accglobal.net.
Steve Sachs, 1916 San Pedro, NE, Albuquerque, NM 87110 (505)265-9388, ssachs@earthlink.net, Senior Editor, Coordinator of Editorial Board.
Jay Toth, M.A., Professor of Anthropology, SUNY Fredonia, jtoth@atlanticbb.net.
William (Bill) Taggart, New Mexico State University, Department of Government, Box 30001, MSC 3BN, Las Cruces, NM 88003, (575)646-4935, witaggar@nmsu.edu.
Mark Trahant, Atwood Journalism Chair, University of Alaska Anchorage, marktrahant@thecedarsgroup.org.
David Weiden, Assistant Professor of Political Science and Native American Studies, Metropolitan State University of Denver, King Center 494, Campus Box 43, P.O. Box 173362, Denver, CO 80217-3362, 303-556-4914, dweiden@msudenver.edu, Media Review Editor
Richard M. Wheelock, Assoc. Prof. Emeritus of Native American and Indigenous Studies, Fort Lewis College, WHEELock_R@fortlewis.edu.
ISN:
Richard Witmer, Creighton University, RichardWitmer@creighton.edu, Chair.

Advisory Council:
Our thanks to all the members of the advisory council who review article submissions:
IPJ INVITES VOLUNTEERS TO SERVE ON ITS ADVISORY COUNCIL, REFEREEING SUBMITTED ARTICLES.
If you are interested in being a reviewer of submitted articles in the IPJ refereeing process, please contact Editor: Leo Killsback, American Indian Studies, Arizona State University, Discovery Hall, Room 356, P.O. Box 874603, Tempe, AZ 85287-4603, (480)727-0061, lkillsba@asu.edu.

Book Review Committee:
IPJ has a book review committee. People wishing to review books, often receiving a free copy to review, and those wishing to have a book review should send a copy, to David Weiden, Assistant Professor of Political Science and Native American Studies, Metropolitan State University of Denver, King Center 494, Campus Box 43, P.O. Box 173362, Denver, CO 80217-3362, 303-556-4914, dweiden@msudenver.edu.

DEADLINE FOR SUBMISSIONS FOR THE NEXT ISSUE IS December 8

INDIGENOUS POLICY PLANS FOR 2018-19
WE INVITE YOUR HELP AND INPUT

We wish you a fine summer. Indigenous Policy journal is available on the web with e-mail notification of new issues at no charge. Indigenous Policy puts out two regular issues a year (Summer and Winter), and since summer 2006, what is now a fall issue serving as the Proceedings of the Western Social Science Association Meeting American Indian Studies Section. We are seeking additional editors, columnists and commentators for regular issues, and editors or editorial groups for special issues, and short articles for each issue. We have via our web site, a regularly updated and searchable data base of Ph.D. Dissertations from Universities Around the World on Topics Relating to Indians in the Americas, compiled by Jonathon Erlen and Jay Toth from Dissertation Abstracts, with recent dissertations also listed separately in each of our regular Summer and Winter issues. IPJ is on facebook, including some important updates since the last issue, at: https://www.facebook.com/indigenouspolicyjournal.

As IPJ is a refereed journal, articles may be posted on a different schedule from the rest of the journal. New articles may go up either at the same time as regular issues, or be added to already posted issues, and may or may not remain up when issues change, until replaced by new articles. Notices go out to our list serve when new issues are posted, and when new articles are posted. To be added to the list to receive e-mail notice of new postings of issues, and new postings of articles, send an e-mail to Steve Sachs: ssachs@earthlink.net.

IPJ has been publishing special issues from time to time since winter 2002 and will continue to do so. These are usually on specific issues. In addition, the Fall issues of IPJ are devoted to carrying the Proceedings of the American Indian Studies Section of the Western Social Science Association Meeting held the preceding April. We invite articles, reports, announcements and reviews of meetings, and media, programs and events, and short reports of news, commentary and exchange of views, as well as willingness to put together special issues.
Send us your thoughts and queries about issues and interests and replies can be printed in the next issue and/or made by e-mail. In addition, we will carry Indigenous Studies Network (ISN) news and business so that these pages can be a source of ISN communication and dialoguing in addition to circular letters and annual meetings at APSA. In addition to being the newsletter/journal of the Indigenous Studies Network, we collaborate with the Native American Studies Section of the Western Social Science Association (WSSA) and provide a dialoguing vehicle for all our readers. This is your publication. Please let us know if you would like to see more, additional, different, or less coverage of certain topics, or a different approach or format.

*IPJ* is a refereed journal. Submissions of articles should go to Editor: Leo Killsback, American Indian Studies, Arizona State University, Discovery Hall, Room 356, P.O. Box 874603, Tempe, AZ 85287-4603, (480)727-0061, lkillsba@asu.edu, who will send them out for review. Our process is for non-article submissions to go to Steve Sachs, who drafts each regular issue. Unsigned items are by Steve. Other editors then make editing suggestions to Steve. Thomas Brasdefer posts this Journal on the IPJ web site: http://www.indigenouspolicy.org.

**Statement of Purpose**

*Indigenous Policy Journal Standards and Philosophy of Publication of Scholarly Articles*

In its publication of double-blind, peer-reviewed scholarly articles, the Indigenous Policy Journal aspires the highest standards of scholarly edification and discourse on policy issues facing Indigenous peoples. In doing so, the *IPJ* is informed by the important national and international policy goals of self-determination and continuance of cultural values of indigenous people. We advise those submitting their articles to be aware of the United Nations Declaration of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, which provides useful guidelines for scholarly inquiry and study of practically any policy issue that contributes to the continuance of indigenous peoples.

**GUIDE TO SUBMITTING WRITINGS TO IPJ**

We most welcome submissions of articles, commentary, news, media notes and announcements in some way relating to American Indian or international Indigenous policy issues, broadly defined. Please send article submissions electronically attached to e-mail to Editor: Leo Killsback, American Indian Studies, Arizona State University, Discovery Hall, Room 356, P.O. Box 874603, Tempe, AZ 85287-4603, (480)727-0061, lkillsba@asu.edu, who will send them out for review. All non-article submissions (including Research Notes, which usually are non-refereed articles) go via e-mail to Steve Sachs: ssachs@earthlink.net, or on disk, at: 1916 San Pedro, NE, Albuquerque, NM, 87110. If you send writings in Word format, we know we can work with them. We can translate some, but not all other formats into word. If you have notes in your submission, please put them in manually, as end notes as part of the text. Do not use an automated footnote/end note system that numbers the notes as you go and put them in a footer such automated notes are often lost, and if not, may appear elsewhere in the journal, and not in your article, as several writings are posted together in the same file. If you use any tables in a submission, please send a separate file(s) for them, as it is impossible to work with them to put on the web when they are an integral part of a Word text. Some other format/style things are helpful to us, and appreciated, but not an absolute requirement. As we publish in 12 point Times font, with single spacing, and a
space between paragraphs, it saves us work if we receive writings that way. Many thanks. We look forward to seeing what you send us.

UPCOMING EVENTS

**ISN PROGRAM AT APSA 2019**, August 29 – September 1, 2019, in Washington, DC

The Indigenous Studies Network (ISN) plans to put on one or more panels and a business meeting/networking session at the 2019 American Political Science Association (APSA) Meeting, August 29 – September 1, 2019, in Washington, DC. Deadline for panel, paper and poster proposals is January 15, 2019. For more information contact ISN Chair Richard Witmer, Creighton University, RichardWitmer@creighton.edu, or http://www.apsanet.org.

**WSSA 2019 AMERICAN INDIAN STUDIES SECTION PROGRAM**, April 24-27, 2019

The American Indian Studies Section of the Western Social Science Association, at its 61st meeting, expects to again have a full program of panels at the association's meeting at the 2018 conference in San Diego, CA, at the Manchester Grand Hyatt, 1 Market Pl. San Diego, CA 92101, on the marina, on the bay, and on the city rail system, April 24-27, 2019. Paper/panel proposals for the American Indian Studies Section can either be submitted on line by going to: http://www.wssaweb.com, or by sending them (preferably by E-mail) to AIS section coordinators: Dr. Leo Killsback: Leo.Killsback@asu.edu or Michelle Hale: Michelle.Hale@asu.edu. Deadline for proposals, including abstracts, is December 1, 2018. Information, which will eventually include the preliminary program, can be accessed on line at: http://www.wssaweb.com.

A list of Indigenous Language Conferences is kept at the Teaching Indigenous Languages website at Northern Arizona University: http://www2.nau.edu and among a large number of linguistic conferences of all types at: http://linguistlist.org/callconf/browse-current.cfm?type=Conf, and for bilingual education in the U.S. (and some beyond) at Dual Language Education of New Mexico: http://www.dlenm.org.

The D'Arcy McNickle Center for American Indian and Indigenous Studies at the Newberry Library, in Chicago, has an on-going Newberry Library Seminar in American Indian Studies on Wednesdays from 5:30 - 7:30 pm at the Newberry, 60 West Walton Street, Chicago, Illinois with a meal included. “We will pre-circulate papers to those planning to attend. If you cannot attend and want to read a paper, please contact the author directly. To receive a copy of a paper, email mcnickle@newberry.org or call (312) 255-3552. Papers are available for request two weeks prior to the seminar date. Please include your email address in all correspondence.” There are other occasional events. E-mail: mcnickle@newberry.org or call (312)255-3564 to receive a copy of the paper via E-mail. For more on this and other events at the Newberry Library go to: http://www.newberry.org/mcnickle/AISSeminar.html.

National Center for Great Lakes Native American Culture, Inc. P O Box 1063 Portland, IN 47371 Home: 4950 North 750 East Attica, IN 47918 765-426-3022, www.ncglnac.org,
kay.neumayr@ncglnc.com, holds events throughout the year, including: 2018 NCGLNAC Academic Conference: Great Principal Peacetime Chiefs, April 21, 2018, in the Bubp Building, Jay County Fairgrounds, Portland, Indiana.

The University of North Carolina Pembroke, Pembroke, NC runs an ongoing Native American Speakers Series, usually announced shortly ahead of time, and often at the Museum of the Southeast American Indian, University of North Carolina Pembroke, Pembroke, NC. Among the upcoming sessions in the speakers series is: Actress Diane Guerrero who is best known for her roles on the Netflix series Orange is the New Black and Superior Donuts on CBS, April 16, 2019. For more information, email ais@uncp.edu, or call 910.521.6266. Admission to the series is free, and it is open to the public.

~~~~

8th International Conference on Language Immersion Education may be in October 2018. For details visit: http://www.carla.umn.edu.

NAAS 2018 International Research Conference may be in October 2018. For details visit: https://www.naaas.org/.

14th Language is Life Biennial Conference may be in October 2018. For details, visit: http://www.aicls.org/.

The annual Friends of Uto-Aztecan Conference (FUAC) may be in October 2018. For details visit: http://www.ssila.org.

The 14th International MEDCOAST Congress on Coastal and Marine Sciences, Engineering, Management & Conservation may be October or November 2018. For details go to: conference.medcoast.net, or medcoast@medcoast.net, http://www.medcoast.net/.


NAFOA 2018 Fall Finance & Tribal Economies Conference is October 1-2, 2018 at the Hyatt Regency Tamaya Resort and Spa, Santa Ana Pueblo, NM. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.

AISES National Conference is October 4-6, 2018 at Cox Convention Center, Oklahoma City, OK. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.

Public Health Law Conference is October 4-6, 2018 in Phoenix, AZ. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.

The Indigenous Studies Area of the Midwest Popular Culture Association at the annual Midwest Popular Culture Association/American Culture Association conference seeks panel proposals and paper abstracts for the annual Midwest Popular Culture Association/American Culture Association conference to be held from Thursday-Sunday, 4-7 October 2018 at the Hyatt Regency Indianapolis, IN.

Abstracts may address any aspect of Aboriginal, First Nations, Maori, Sami, and other Indigenous popular cultures. In addition, the area highly encourages comparative papers between Indigenous and, say, Asian, Latin American, Pacific Islander, or African popular cultures. Topics might address, but are not in any way limited to the following:

- Film and Animation
- Television
- Popular Music
- Radio shows
- New Media
- Video Games, Blogging, YouTube
- Fashion
- Popular Literature
- Theater, Festivals, Spectacles, and Ceremonies

Panels should open with approximately 100-word theme before a 200-word abstract for each panelists. Individual paper abstracts of about 200 word should be submitted electronically before or by April 30, 2018 via the online submission system, https://submissions.mpcaaca.org.

Send questions and inquiries to the Area Chair, Anthony Adah at tony.adah@gmail.com.

For more information about the conference, including how to submit to a different area, please visit the conference website at http://mpcaaca.org/indy-2018/2017-cfp/. For information about the conference please visit the conference website at www.mpcaaca.org/conference.

American Indigenous Research Association Meeting is October 6-8, 2018. For details go to: http://www.americanindigenousresearchassociation.org/annual-meeting/.

44th Annual Honolulu Intertribal Powwow is October 6-7, 2018, in Honolulu, HI. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.

USET Sovereignty Protection Fund (SPF) Annual, hosted by the Seneca Indian Nation, is October 8-11, 2018 at the Seneca Niagara Resort and Casino, Niagara Falls, NY. For details go to: http://www.usetinc.org.

Annual, Sunrise Gathering on Alcatraz Island: Day of Solidarity with Indigenous People is October 8, 2018. For details go to: http://www.iitc.org/conferences-events/community-events/.

G2E Global Gaming Expo is October 8-11, 2018, at Sands Expo Las Vegas, NV. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.
National Indian Education Association Convention and Trade Show is in Hartford, CN, October 10-13, 2018. For details go to: http://www.niea.org/programs/convention-and-trade-show/.

USSET Annual is Oct 8, 2018 - October 11, 2018
Seneca Niagara Casino & Hotel Niagara Falls, NY. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.

American Indian Higher Education Consortium (AIHEC) 2018 Fall Meeting is October 8-10, 2018 in Hartford, CT. For information go to: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.cfm.

American Indian Higher Education Consortium (AIHEC) 2018 Fall Board Meeting is October 9-10, 2018 in Hartford, CT. For information go to: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.cfm.

2017 World Indigenous Business Forum is October 9-11, 2018 in Rotorua, New Zealand. For details go to: http://wibf.ca/.

The 2018 International Conference of Indigenous Archives, Libraries, and Museums (ATALM) is: Summits, tours and workshops - October 8-9, Conference - October 10-11, 2018 at Mystic Lake Casino Hotel, Prior Lake, MN. For information, visit: http://www.atalm.org. Please direct questions to atalminfo@gmail.com.

NIEA National Convention is in Hartford, CT, October 10-14, 2018. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.


Annual Conference for Community-Based Heritage Language School Representatives is October 13, 2018 at American University in Washington, DC. For details go to: https://www.american.edu/cas/education/iie/Annual-Community-Based-Heritage-Language-Schools-Conference.cfm.

Community-Based Heritage Language Schools meeting is October 13, 2018, at the National Heritage Language Resource Center at UCLA. For information go to: http://www.international.ucla.edu/institute/event/12505.
First Alaskans Institute’s 35th Annual Elders & Youth Conference (Elders & Youth) is October 15-17, 2018 with the “Warming of the Hands” pre-conference the afternoon of October 14 at the Dena’ina Center in Anchorage, Alaska. For information go to: http://www.nativefederation.org/annual-convention/.


UCLA IAC Fall Forum is October 18, 2019, 3–5 PM, James West Alumni Center, UCLA, Los Angeles, CA. For information visit: https://www.aisc.ucla.edu/events/iac_fallforum2018.aspx.


Third Basel Sustainability Forum is October 18, 2018, Alte Universität, Rheinsprung 9/11, University of Basel, Switzerland. For details visit: http://sciforum.net/conference/BSF-3.

Physicians for Social Responsibility (PSR) Join PSR Maine and Maine AAP in welcoming to Maine world renowned pediatrician & epidemiologist Dr. Philip Landrigan for a special event about pesticides and his new book, Children and Environmental Toxins: What Everyone Needs to Know, 5:30 - 8:00 p.m. at Innovation Hall, University of New England, 772 Stevens Ave., Portland, ME. For more information go to: http://www.psr.org/news-events/events/.

NCAI 75th Annual Convention & Marketplace is October 21-26, 2018 in Denver, CO. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.


Tribal Self-Governance Fourth Quarterly Meeting is October 23-25, 2018 in Washington, DC. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.

2018 Tribal Water Summit is October 25-26, 2018, at Wild Horse Pass Casino and Events Center in Phoenix, AZ. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.

The 50th Algonquian Conference is in Edmonton, Alberta, Canada October 25–28, 2018, on the University of Alberta’s North Campus, organized by Antti Arppe, Inge Genee, and others. It may be in October 2018. Information will eventually be available at: https://algonquianconference.atlas-ling.ca/eng/conference/.
Total Immersion Plus: Learning Language At Super Fast Speed Workshop is October 25-26, 2018, in Sana Fe, NM. For information visit: https://ilinative.org.

5th International Center for Ethnic and Religious Conflict Resolution and Peacebuilding (ICERM) International Conference is in New York City, October 30-November 1, 2018. Peace and conflict resolution scholars, practitioners, traditional rulers and leaders, indigenous leaders, policy makers, and students from many countries around the world are gathering for the first time in New York City to exchange ideas on the traditional systems of conflict resolution. For details visit: www.icermediation.org.

15th Annual Fatherhood is Leadership National Conference is October 30-November 1, 2018, We-Ko-Pa Resort & Conference, Fort McDowell, AZ. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.

The 10th Annual Honoring Native Foodways may be in November 2018 in the University Center Annex, University of North Carolina, Pembroke. For information go to: https://uncpphoto.smugmug.com/Events/2015/Native-Foodways/inics.wixsite.com/indigenousconference/2017-indigenous-mental-health-confe.


La Cosecha, 23rd Annual Dual Language Conference is November 14 - 17, 2018, In Santa Fe, NM. For details visit: https://www.lacosechaconference.org.


5th Annual International Conference on Poverty and Sustainable Development may be in December 2018. For information go to: http://povertyconferences.com.


FALCON Annual Conference is November 3-6, 2018, in Arlington, VA. For information go to: http://falcon.aihec.org/Pages/FALCONHome.aspx.

12th International Conference on the Environmental Management of Enclosed Coastal Seas (EMECS 12) is November 4-8, 2018, at Jomtien Palm Beach Hotel, Pattaya, Thailand. For details go to: https://www.emecs12.com.

TribalNet 19th Annual Conference and Tradeshow is November 5-8, 2018, in Las Vegas, NV. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.
10th Annual Tusweca Tiospaye 2018 Lakota Dakota Nakota Language Summit and First Nations Education Summit" is November 9-11, 2018 in Rapid City, SD. For details visit: http://tuswecatiospaye.org/.


Keres Children’s Learning Center (KCLC), Native Language Symposium: A Cross-Generational Model of Indigenous Education— Reclaiming the Education of Our Children: is November 14-15, 2018, at the Lodge in Santa Fe, Santa Fe, NM. There will be presentations and discussions surrounding various models of education, with the hope of connecting participants, providing resources, and furthering the movement toward educational sovereignty by redefining achievement within Indian Education. For questions or more information, please contact tracordero@gmail.com or trisha@kclcmontessori.org, or go to: http://www.dlenm.org/index.php/homepage/news.

Tribal Interior Budget Council is November 14-16, 2018, in Washington, DC. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-event.

La Cosecha 23rd Annual Dual Language Conference is November 14 - 17, 2018, in Santa Fe, NM. For details go to: https://www.lacosechaconference.org.


Indigenous Peoples’ Thanksgiving Sunrise Gathering is November 22, 2018, Alcatraz Island, 6:00-8:00 AM, Boats depart from Fisherman’s Wharf Pier 33. For information go to: https://www.iitc.org/save-the-dates-alcatraz-sunrise-gatherings-and-other-iitc-events-in-october-and-november-san-francisco/.


USHRN Bi-annual Human Rights Conference may be in December 2018. For more information and registration: http://www.ushrn.org/.

Washington Association for Bilingual Training (WABE) Dual Language/OCDE Project GLAD® Institute is November 30-December 1, 2018. For details visit: http://wabewa.org/events/.

First Nations Language Keepers Conference may be in December 2018 at the Saskatoon Inn and Conference Centre in Saskatoon, Saskatchewan, Canada. Details are available at: http://www.sicc.sk.ca/.
NICWA Training Institute is December 4-6, 2018, in New Orleans, Louisiana. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.

TERO 2018 Legal Update & Indian Preference Conference is at the Flamingo Las Vegas, Nevada December 5-7, 2018 Address: 3555 Las Vegas Boulevard South, Las Vegas, Nevada. For details go to: http://www.councilfortribalemploymentrights.org/2018-legal-update-indian-preference-conference/.

Intertribal Transportation Association Annual Meeting is December 6-7, 2018, at the Tropicana Casino and Resort, Las Vegas, NV. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.


The Society For The Study Of The Indigenous Languages Of The Americas Annual Meeting is in New York City January 3-6, 2019. For information go to: http://ssila.org.


Colorado Association for Bilingual Education (CABE) Professional Development Conference may be in February 2019. for details visit: http://www.cocabe.org.

American Indian Higher Education Consortium (AIHEC) 2019 Winter Meeting is February 4-7, 2019. For information go to: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.cfm.

NICWA Training Institute is February 5-7, 2019 in Palm Springs, California. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.

Seventh International Conference on Immersion and Dual Language Education is February 6–9, 2019 in Charlotte, North Carolina. For details visit: http://carla.umn.edu/conferences/index.html.

NCAI 2019 Executive Council Winter Session is February 10-14, 2019, in Washington, DC. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-event.
AIHEC 2019 Winter Board Meeting is February 11-14, 2019 at Holiday Inn Capitol (tentative), at Washington, D.C. For details visit: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.htm.

NAAAS & Affiliates (including the National Association of Native American Studies) 2018 Joint National Conference is February 11-16, 2018 in in Dallas, TX. For details visit: https://www.naaas.org.

World Sustainable Development Summit 2018: Partnerships for a Resilient Planet is February 11-13, 2019, at India Habitat Centre, Lodhi Road, New Delhi, India. For details visit: http://wsds.teriin.org.

Third International Conference on Heritage/Community Languages is February 16-17, 2019 in Los Vegas, CA. For details visit: http://international.ucla.edu/nhlrc.

The Native American-Indigenous Section of the Southwest Popular/American Culture Association 39th Annual Conference is as usual in Albuquerque, NM, February 20-23, 2019. For details go to: http://southwestpca.org/conference/call-for-papers/.


31st Far West PCA/ACA (Popular and American Culture associations), which likely has at least one American Indian section, is February 22-24, 2019, at the Los Vegas, NV. For information go to: http://www.fw pca.org/.


American Indian Higher Education Consortium (AIHEC) 2018 Spring Board Meeting is March 9-10, 2018 in Rapid City, SD. For information go to: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.cfm.

The Society for Cinema and Media Studies 2019 conference is in Seattle, Washington, March 13-17, with special events in partnership with local Indigenous media communities. For information visit: www.cmstudies.org.

AIHEC 2019 Spring Board Meeting is March 14-16, in Billings, MT. For details visit: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.htm.

American Indian Higher Education Consortium (AIHEC) 2019 Spring Student Conference is March 17-19, 2019. For information go to: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.cfm.

The 42nd Annual California Conference on American Indian Education is at the Hilton Sacramento Arden West, Sacramento, CA, March 17-19, 2019. For more information, contact: Achel McBride: (530)895-4212 x 110, Irma Amaro: (707)464-3512, or Judy Delgado at 916-319-0506, judelgado@cde.ca.gov, or go to: http://www.ccaie.org/.

Fifteenth Annual Southeast Indian Studies Conference is being held on campus at the University of North Carolina, Pembroke, Pembroke, NC, at the University Center Annex, March 21-22, 2019. Conference details will be posted to the American Indian Studies http://www.uncp.edu/ais/ and Southeast American Indian Studies http://www.uncp.edu/sais/ websites as they become available.


RES Las Vegas is March 25-28, 2019 at The Paris Las Vegas Hotel & Casino. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-event.

SWCOLT (conference on language teaching) is March 28-30, 2019 in Fort Worth, TX. for information go to: http://www.swcolt.org/.


Alaska Native Studies Conference 2018 may be in April 2019 at the University of Alaska Fairbanks campus. For information go to: http://alaskanativestudies.org.
National Center for Great Lakes Native American Culture, 2019 NCGLNAC Academic Conference may be in April 2019, in the Bubp Building, Jay County Fairgrounds, Portland, Indiana. For details visit: www.ncglnc.org.

The 13th Giving the Gift of Language: A Teacher Training Workshop for Native Language Instruction and Acquisition, SILC: Strengthening Indigenous Languages and Cultures: A Teacher Training Workshop for Native Language Instruction and Acquisition may be in April, 2019, at Missoula, MT. For information visit: http://www.nsilc.org/index.htm.

47th Annual Symposium on the American Indian may be at Northeastern State University, University Center, Tahlequah, OK, in April 2019. For details visit: http://www.cts.nsuok.edu/NSUSymposium.aspx.

NICWA Training Institute is April 3-5, 2019, in Albuquerque, NM. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-event.

Summit Series: Cultivating the Globally Sustainable Self is April 10-13, 2019 at James Madison University, Harrisonburg, VA. For details visit: www.jmu.edu/summitseries.

NAFOA - 37th Annual Conference is April 15-16, 2019, at the Marriott Downtown Waterfront Portland, OR. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-event.r

The 11th International Conference on Climate: Impacts and Responses is 16–17 April 2019, at Pryzbyla Center, The Catholic University of America, Washington, D.C. The Climate Change Conference is for any person with an interest in, and concern for, scientific, policy and strategic perspectives in climate change. It will address a range of critically important themes relating to the vexing question of climate change. Plenary speakers will include some of the world’s leading thinkers in the fields of climatology and environmental science, as well as numerous paper, workshop and colloquium presentations by researchers and practitioners. For details go to: http://on-climate.com/the-conference. For details visit: http://www.peace-ed-campaign.org/calendar.


The Western Political Science Association (WPSA) 2019, April 18-20, is at the Manchester Hyatt, San Diego, CA, and will likely include one or more Race, Ethnicity and Politics panels that could include Indigenous issues. For details go to: http://wpsa.research.pdx.edu/


10th Annual Unity Summit is April 23-25, 2019, at Oneida Indian Nation, Turning Stone Resort Casino, Oneida, NY. For information go to: https://www.usetinc.org/wp-content/uploads/bvenuti/WWS/2018/April%202018/April%202/Save%20the%20Date%202019%20TUS.pdf.


The 13th Annual Conference on Endangered Languages and Cultures of the Americas may be in May 2018. For details go to: http://www.cail.utah.edu, or contact Jennifer Mitchell: cail.utah@gmail.com.

22nd Navajo Studies Conference may be at Northern Arizona University, Flagstaff, Arizona, may be in May 2019. For details go to: http://www.navajostudies.org.

Affiliated Tribes of Northwest Indians (ATNI) Mid Year Convention 2019 may be in May 2019. For details go to: http://www.atnitribes.org.


The 8th Native American and Indigenous Studies Association Annual Conference may be in May, 2019, in Tucson, AZ. For more information go to: http://naisa.ais.arizona.edu/.

Annual Workshop on American Indigenous Languages (WAIL2019) may be in May 2019, at UCSB Department of Linguistics. For information visit: http://www linguistics.ucsb.edu or http://osl.sa.ucsb.edu/org/nail/WAIL.

CCERBAL 2019 Conference may be at Canadian Centre for Studies and Research on Bilingualism and Language Planning (CCERBAL), Official Languages and Bilingualism Institute (OLBI), University of Ottawa, in May 2019. For details visit: https://ccerbal.uottawa.ca/en/activities/conferences.


AsiaLex 2019 may be in June 2019. For information go to: http://www.adelaide.edu.au/australex/.

Breath of Life / Workshop for California Indian Languages may be in June 2019. For details visit: http://www.aicls.org.


Fostering Indigenous Business and Entrepreneurship in the Americas Conference: FIBEA 2019 may be in June 2019. For information and to make submissions contact fibea@mgt.unm.edu, or visit http://conferences.mgt.unm.edu/fibea/ or http://fibeamanaus.mgt.unm.edu/defaultENG.asp.

5th Annual Stabilizing Indigenous Languages Conference and 7th Western Symposium on Language Issues (WeSLI) may be in June 2019. For details go to: http://jan.ucc.nau.edu/~jar/AIE/conf.html.


UCLA American Indian Studies Center Summer in Montana may be in June 2019. For details see: www.aisc.ucla.edu/news/.../Summer%20in%20Montana%20flyer.pdf.

Dene Languages Conference may be in June 2019, and will likely be held in the Southwest, in Apache country. For information go to: http://www.uaf.edu/alc/.

SYLAP 2019 (Shoshonian language summer program) may be in June and July 2019 on the campus of the University of Utah. For details go to: http://shoshoniproject.utah.edu/.

The Northwest Indian Language Institute Summer 2019 may be in June 2019, at the University of Oregon, Eugene, OR. For details go to: http://pages.uoregon.edu/nwili/.

8th International Conference on Bantu may be in June 2019. For details go to: http://linguistlist.org/callconf/browse-conf-action.cfm?ConfID=190196.

2019 Dene / Athabaskan Language Conference & Workshop may be in June or July 2019. For details go to: http://www.uaf.edu/alc/about/.

6th Annual American Indian Higher Education Consortium (AIHEC) Behavioral Health Institute may be in June 2019. For details visit: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.htm.
10th Austronesian and Papuan Languages and Linguistics Conference may be in June 2019. For information go to: http://lacito.vjf.cnrs.fr/colloque/apll9/index_en.htm or https://www.soas.ac.uk/linguistics/events/apll8-conference/.

10th American Indian and Indigenous Education Conference may be in June 2019 at Northern Arizona University's College of Education at Northern Arizona University, Flagstaff, AZ. To get updated information on this conference visit: http://nau.edu/AIE.

OCDE Project GLAD® Summer Institute is June 4-5, 2019, at La Fonda on the Plaza — Santa Fe, NM. For details go to: http://http://www.dlenm.org/calendar-of-events.aspx.

The Native American Student Advocacy Institute is June 6-7, 2019, in Tulsa, OK. For details visit: http://nasai.collegeboard.org/.


Native American and Indigenous Studies Association Conference is at the University of Waikato, Hamilton, Aotearoa/New Zealand, June 26-29, 2019. For information visit: https://www.naisa.org/annual-meeting/.


9th Cambridge Conference on Language Endangerment: 'Language Endangerment: Language Contact and Language Change' may be in July 2019, at the University of Cambridge, Cambridge, UK. For information go to: http://www.mml.cam.ac.uk/.

CARLA - Center for Advanced Research and Language Acquisition - run a series of summer institutes for language and immersion teachers in July 2019." For details, go to: http://carla.umn.edu/.

10th International 3L Summer School: Endangered Languages: From Documentation to Revitalization may be in July 2019. For details visit: http://www.ddl.ish-lyon.cnrs.fr/.

NCAIS Graduate Student Conference at the Newberry Library in Chicago may be in July 2019. "The Consortium offers graduate students from NCAIS member institutions an opportunity to present papers in any academic field relating to American Indian Studies at the Graduate Student Conference. We encourage the submission of proposals for papers that examine a wide variety of subjects relating to American Indian and Indigenous history and culture broadly conceived. For details go to http://www.newberry.org/.
NCAIS Summer Institute, may be in July and August 2019. For more information go to: www.newberry.org/mcnickle.

Duel Language Education of New Mexico: Bueno Center 2019 Summer Institute, Two-day summer institute about the education of culturally and linguistically diverse learners, may be in July 2019. For information go to: http://www.dlenm.org/.

New Mexico Language Education of New Mexico: Paridad - Oaxaca (Language Arts Education) may be in July and August 2019. For details go to: http://www.dlenm.org/index.php/resources/calendar/21-paridad-oaxaca-language-arts-education.

The Southeast American Indian Studies (SAIS) Program at the University of North Carolina at Pembroke fifth annual Safeguarding Our Natural and Tribal Heritage Youth Program may be in July 2019. The program is sponsored by the U.S. Department of Agriculture’s Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service (APHIS) and hosted by SAIS. It is a free two-week residential program for 20 American Indian high school students who are rising sophomores, juniors and seniors that have an interest in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM), as well as agriculture, veterinary, plant, food, environmental sciences, and natural resources, wildlife biology, and related fields. For more information go to: http://www.uncp.edu/sonth or contact: Dr. Alfred Bryant (Lumbee), Founding Director, Southeast American Indian Studies Program, alfred.bryant@uncp.edu, (910)775-4009, Fax: (910)522-5795 or Lawrence T. Locklear (Lumbee), Program Coordinator, Southeast American Indian Studies Program, lawrence.locklear@uncp.edu, (910)775-4579, Fax: (910)522-5795.

14th Lancaster Postgraduate Conference in Linguistics and Language Teaching (LAEDG 2018) may be in July 2019. For details go to: http://www.lancaster.ac.uk/fass/events/laelpgconference/index.htm.

The 40th Annual General Assembly (AGA) of First Nations (AFN) of Canada may be in July 2019. For information go to: http://www.afn.ca.

NIHB - 2019 American Indian and Alaska Native National Behavioral Health Conference may be in July. For details visit: https://www.ihs.gov/dbh/bhconference/.

48th Annual Meeting & Health Conference may be in July 2019. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/national-events.

2019 National TERO Conference may be in July and/or August. For details visit: http://www.councilfortribalemploymentrights.org

National Caucus of Native American Legislators Legislative Summit may be in July and/or August 2019. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/national-events.

TCU Summer Meeting may be in July and/or August 2019. For information go to: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.htm.

Native American Journalists Association - 2018 National Native Media Conference may be in July 2019. For information go to: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/national-events.

TCU Summer Meeting at SKC is July 22-26, 2019, at Salish Kootenai College, Pablo, MT. For details visit: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.htm.

The 2019 annual meeting of the Linguistic Association of Canada and the United States, the 46st LACUS Forum will be held July 23-26, 2019, Sponsored by the University of Waterloo and St Jerome’s University Waterloo, Ontario, Canada. For details visit: http://lacus.weebly.com.

The Women & Water Symposium 2018 is July 29-August 2, 2018 at Lac Courte Oreilles Reservation, Hayward, WI. For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/national-events.

NAAAS (including The National Association of Native American Studies) International Research Forum may be in August 2019. For details visit: https://www.naaas.org/view-calendar/.

Syntax of the World's Languages IX (SWL IX) may be in August 2019. For details visit: http://swl-7.weebly.com/.


2017 WINHEC Annual Meeting may be on August 2019. For information visit: http://winhec.org.

American Indian Higher Education Consortium (AIHEC) Summer Board Meeting may be in August 2019. For details visit: http://www.aihec.org.

4th Indigenous People's International Gathering to Honor, Defend, and Protect the Salomon may be in August 2019. For information contact: Chicaloon Native Village (907)745-0749.

35th Summer School and Conference of Applied Language Studies may be in August, 2018. For details go to: http://www.aila.info.

The 19- International Congress of Phonetic Sciences (ICPhS 19) will take place in Melbourne, Australia on 5-9 August 2019. For information visit: https://www.ssila.org/conferences/call-for-papers-the-phonetic-structures-of-indigenous-languages-of-south-america/.

52nd Conference: ‘Broadening the Horizons of Applied Linguistics is 29-31 August 2019, Manchester Metropolitan University, Manchester, United Kingdom. For information go to: https://baal.org.uk/annual-conference/.

AIHEC 2019 Fall Board Meeting is October 7-9, 2019, in Minneapolis, MN. For details visit: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.htm.

50th Annual NIEA Convention and Trade Show is October 9-12, 2019, in Minneapolis, MN. For details visit: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.htm.

G2E Global Gaming Expo is October 14-17, 2019, at the Sands Expo Convention Center in Las Vegas, NV). For details visit: http://www.ncai.org/conferences-events/ncai-events.


AIHEC 2020 WINTER Meeting is February 3-6, 2020, may be at the Holiday Inn Capitol, Washington, DC. For details visit: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.htm.


AIHEC 2020 Spring Student Conference is spring 2020. AIHEC 2020 Spring Student Conference. For details visit: http://www.aihec.org/who-we-are/calendar.htm.


The 2020 Institute on Collaborative Language Research (CoLang) – held every two years = is at the University of Montana from June 15– July 17, 2020, and will be co-hosted by the University of Montana (UM) and Chief Dull Knife College (CDKC). For information about SSILA go to: www.ssila.org.

AILA (Association Internationale de Linguistique Appliquee) World Congress will take August 9-14, 2020, at The University of Groningen, in Groningen, The Netherlands. Visit the Congress website <aila2017.com.br> for more detailed information about the venue and the conference, or go to: http://www.aila.info.
Federal Indian programs are intentioned to promote tribal self-determination, yet they paradoxically serve a vast quantity of cultures through singular blanket programs. One example of a generalizing program structure is the US Department of Housing and Urban Development’s Office of Public and Indian Housing. This program works to provide housing to tribal members of various parts of the country; however, the housing provided is generic, does not serve the cultural needs of the individual, and is not tailored to the specific environment as a traditional home would epistemologically be suited for. The Navajo Nation is a prime example of a culture whose traditional housing is intricately designed to suit the spiritual and physical needs of the people and which utilizes available resources for construction.

As part of an ongoing series studying the thermal efficiency and cultural significance of such traditional housing, this paper discusses the hoogan nímaži. A design based completely
around the concept of sun cycles, hogans are traditionally constructed from sandy soil and logs to create a year-round home suitable to the Four Corners region. I examine several hogans to compare the energy efficiency of different housing materials commonly used in these traditional homes and their contemporary versions. I find the most traditional techniques utilized by the Navajo hogan builders (i.e., mud and log homes rather than imported brick and plywood) are the most thermally effective and best suited for life on Dinébikéyah. I also briefly cover the second part of this series that discusses Sky City at the Pueblo of Acoma. This comparison helps demonstrate why federal programs and policies must be reformed to adequately serve individual nations.

**Part 1: Navajo Hooghan Study**

Before understanding the needs of any given community, it is important to place it into historic and political context. For the Navajo Nation, a notoriously large and checkerboarded nation within a nation, land jurisdiction is to blame for many complications on the Reservation. Although the Treaty of 1868 and subsequent land transactions clearly define the tribal boundaries, the status of actual land parcels can fall into a number of categories. These jurisdictional nuances not only complicate the development of business by adding layers of red tape, but they also complicate housing procedures. Between grazing permits and home-site leases, Navajos have access to their land with an overwhelming number of conditions – many of which are imposed and enforced by the Federal government. As traditional Navajo housing never consisted of land ownership and written documents, this shift to a Western structure has caused numerous repercussions throughout both the housing and the economic departments.

To aggravate complication in housing programs on the Navajo Reservation, the Navajo Nation is also subject to a number of Indian programs managed by the overarching Federal government. Arguably, these housing programs – along with other programs established by the Treaty of 1868 – are subtle tools of assimilation. They range from promoting the construction of churches and the establishment of non-traditional jobs to the creation of an English-based education system and a money-based economy. Therefore, in a community that was once dominated by sheepherders inhabiting hooghan structures, a shift to Americanized, contemporary jobs and housing has occurred in the last century on the Navajo Nation.

The Office of Public and Indian Housing cites one of its roles as ensuring “safe, decent, and affordable housing” as part of the US Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) program. The Native American Housing Assistance and Self-Determination ACT (NAHASDA) of 1996 granted tribes the authority – despite their allegedly pre-established status as sovereign nations – to determine the housing programs they choose to fund. Yet, despite this influence from sovereign nations, the Federal program still identifies housing issues in Indian Country per Western standards and completely neglects the cultural loss perpetuated by programs that create accessibility to only Western-tailored housing and needs.

One classic example of housing complications exists in present-day South Dakota. The Pine Ridge Reservation of the Oglala Sioux Lakota has been cited for years as a great challenge to HUD, with many people living in overcrowded and under insulated homes, if not tents or cars. To tackle this issue, some groups have sought grant funds to build new and sustainable housing on
tribal land. [2] Put this housing predicament in stark contrast with the Lakota encampment currently expanding in a harsh winter environment at #NoDAPL and suddenly a disconnect between Federal programs and tradition becomes clear: Native peoples are fully aware of how to construct adequate housing for their indigenous environments.

Unfortunately, the approach of the federal programs regarding housing is not unlike the approach of many federal programs in Indian Country – and this concern should not be overlooked. In a 2013 report by the Housing Assistance Council, it was cited that 4.8% of homes in Indian Country “lacked complete kitchens” and that 5.3% “lacked complete plumbing”, versus national statistics of 0.07% and 0.05%, respectively. The standards used to define a “complete kitchen” or “complete plumbing” might reflect general American standards of living, but these definitions do not necessarily align with the traditional housing standards that might be defined by a sovereign nation, were that sovereign nation truly and uninhibitedly allowed to exercise its full rights and define a system that keeps its cultural identity intact. [3]

This is not to say tribal nations lack an interest in full plumbing for all their citizens as well as other amenities that add comfort and convenience to everyday life; however, it is critical to realize the solutions offered in place of traditional housing are often ill-suited for the local environment, require an import of materials not readily available to tribal members, and ignore the validity and epistemological knowledge embedded in traditional – and often ancient – housing designs.

In the case of the Oglala Sioux Lakota, modern housing challenges include the climate which “[ranges] from the arid desert to the frozen tundra”. [4] Yet, traditional Lakota housing was of course well-adapted to this kind of environment, optimizing the use of local resources such as animal hides and wood to create wind-resistant and thermally efficient tipis. These homes were also ideal for quickly dismantling, transporting, and reconstructing at new camps. Similarly, the Dine’é of the Navajo Nation have relied on the ancient technology of the hooghan (English: hogan) for surviving on limited resources in a similarly harsh and changing semi-arid desert climate.

The Navajo Housing Authority (NHA), established in 1963, is a tribally operated program carrying the HUD mission of Hooghandee ét Hahoozhoodgo Iina Sila dóó Anooseel – or “building sustainable, quality homes” for tribal members. [5] It operates under NAHASDA and utilizes funds from the Indian Housing Block Grant (IHBG) and Title VI Loan Guarantee, regulated by 24 CFR Part 1000. Yet, while NHA aims to assert the Navajo Nation’s sovereignty by directing a housing program for its Navajo citizens, the system and standards it utilizes are arguably adopted directly from the HUD program, a blanket program that fails to consider the individual housing needs of tribal citizens. The houses constructed are generic, American urban models that do not implement natural resources in the way the traditional hooghan does. The models, based on “full kitchens” and plumbing systems, are also useless if an individual’s home-site lease has no access to running water or electricity. Although many homes do have utilities today compared to in previous generations, sites without access to such amenities do exist. In these places, traditional hooghans would most clearly be an ideal housing solution.

So the disparage between promoted housing services and the cultural needs of the Navajo nation may be better illustrated, this research attempts to quantify the effectiveness of traditional
homes. It analyzes the thermal efficiency of Navajo hooghans by collecting data from three real models made with different kinds of housing materials. As suspected, the closer the hooghan design is to the traditional one constructed of local resources, the more thermally efficient it was. The closer the materials were to “contemporary” and “imported” materials, such as brick or particleboard, the less efficient the hooghan is and the least readily available its materials are for new construction. Although all models analyzed were in fact hooghans, the inefficiency of contemporary housing materials in traditional housing should be seen as a parallel to the negative impact non-traditional housing programs have on the self-determination, material availability, and thermal efficiency of housing in Indian Country and, in particular, on the Navajo Nation.

A theoretical model of a standard hooghan was created to analyze the thermal efficiency of real hooghan measurements. This model must take into account the amount of irradiation received on all surfaces of the hooghan through direct, reflected, and diffuse sunlight. The second key component to the model is the construction of the hooghan itself, from the materials used to the geometry of the structure. With this information, the amount of energy that does not pass through the materials and also the amount of energy lost through the materials with time can be approximated. Combined with an assumed internal base condition (to represent the quantity of heat retained from previous sun cycles), these components can help predict a hooghan’s performance under varying temperature conditions.

Before considering the specifics of the theoretical model, it is important to first understand the physical and spiritual construction details implemented in all Navajo hooghan designs. Navajo traditions are centered on the patterns of the sun, including the direction of the sunrise, the four phases of the day interpreted in Navajo philosophy, and the four seasons which are also dictated by the earth’s position in regards to the sun. Navajos orient everything to the east, so even maps are most accurately drawn with the east direction in what most printed maps would assign to the north. With so much emphasis put on the sun and the sacredness of the sunrise, all hooghans are constructed with an east-facing door.

The traditional female hooghan can be constructed with straight legs or with parallel logs and is always round. In general, the hooghan nimazí (or “round hogan”) is the female hooghan constructed with nine parallel logs stacked in eight faces. Four faces are in the cardinal directions, the door placed on the eastern face. The nine logs are meant to represent nine months of pregnancy. Windows are not traditional details to a hooghan, but today they tend to be placed in the south- and north-facing walls. All hooghans are constructed with a fire at the center, meaning the roof as an opening at the top where smoke can pass through. Since the introduction of a fire-burning stove, this opening is where the stovepipe exits.

The cultural significance of the hooghan is extensive. From a scientific standpoint and at a bare minimum, understanding the purposeful design of the hooghan is sufficient for modeling its geometry and position with regards to incident sunlight. As stated previously, there are two concepts which govern the majority of thermal energy transactions between the sun and the space within an unheated hooghan: Irradiation (Q_in) through the housing materials to the inside and Q_out from the interior which passes through the housing materials. First, we must consider how to quantify the Q_in by predicting the amount of sunlight incident on a Navajo hooghan.
The Navajo Nation consists of land in the Four Corners area that predominantly occupies northeastern Arizona. The capitol of the Central Agency, Chinle, is the approximate center of the nation and located at a latitude of about 36.1544˚N. The three hooghans measured for this project were located in Tse Bonito, New Mexico (35.6567˚N), Window Rock, Arizona (35.6806˚N), and Dilkon, Arizona (35.3853˚N). Based on the central latitude of the Navajo Nation and the latitudes of the three hooghans measured, utilizing solar data from the city of Albuquerque, New Mexico (latitude 35.0853˚N) is appropriate for both this project and as an approximation for the Navajo Nation in general. (Due to the data collection laws on the Navajo Nation and the lack of solar data collection resources, solar data is neither sufficiently collected nor readily available from the Navajo Nation itself.) Therefore, for the purpose of calculating irradiation data for the theoretical model in this project, solar data was used from the National Renewable Energy Lab’s Typical Meteorological Year 3 data for Albuquerque during the month the hooghans were measured (October).

The total sun energy incident on a surface (total irradiation, or \( I_T \)) at a given time is represented by the sum of \( I_B \), the beam (direct sunlight) component, \( I_D \), the diffuse (incident on surface after scattered from surrounding atmosphere) component, and \( I_R \), the reflected (from the ground) component. \( I_R \) can be broken down further as the sum of beam and diffuse irradiation multiplied by \( \rho_g \), the reflectivity factor of the ground. For these purposes, the reflectivity is estimated at 0.4, a value used for ground in a sandy desert. The \( Q_{loss} \) which describes the amount of energy (heat) lost from the inside of the hooghan and through surfaces such as the walls and roof can be calculated as a function of temperature and thermal mass. Newton’s Law of Cooling demonstrates the temperature gradient of the inside and outside atmosphere as being the driving factor in the calculation. Second, the thermal mass of the materials through which the energy passes must be calculated and multiplied by a resistance factor. The area for this thermal mass is the exposed surface area providing resistance. The resistance factor is a sum of the inverse of the wall’s materials R-values. The resistivity weighted by surface area for each Hogan was found to range between 1.3 and 2.5.

For an average temperature range of 17˚C (which was encountered during the project), the predicted \( Q_{loss} \) per day would therefore be 7340Btu for the semi-traditional hooghan, 7404Btu for the traditional hooghan, and 11822Btu for the contemporary hooghan. The inconsistency between the predicted losses and the actual losses indicate the challenge in accurately quantifying housing material’s thermal resistivity. Additionally, quantifying the amount of heat steadily retained in each hooghan proved challenging but necessary in order to predict what internal temperatures would be achieved during a 24-hour period. Now that the performance of the hooghans have been documented on a scientific level, it is important to comprehend how these ancient houses are epistemologically centered on more than just thermal design but also on hózhǫ́ and k’é.

Because Navajo philosophy centers around the idea of Mother Earth and Father Sky, the idea of belonging is also established by the hooghan. The earthen floor represents Mother Earth; the open air through the smoke hole represents Father Sky. At night, the Northern Star can be seen through the hole and therefore symbolizes the fire at the heart of the universe. The hooghan is a sacred symbol constructed with such purpose that even possessions inside the home have a particular place: Cooking items are kept in the southeast corner, bedding in the southwest, tools in the northwest, and religious paraphernalia in the northeast.
Even the Navajo Nation’s land base is represented symbolically as a hooghan, establishing that this is where the Dine’é belong. The four directions are marked by the four sacred mountains: Mount Blanca or Sis Naajiní (east), Mount Taylor or Tsoodzíł (south), San Francisco Peaks or Dook’o’oosliíd (west), and La Plata/Mount Hesperus or Dibé Nitsaa (north). These mountains also represent the four directions that orient the hooghan, based on the four sticks that were placed in the most ancient hooghan form: the male fork-sticked hogan. The two other sacred sites, Gobernador Knob, or (Dzil) Chʼóöl’į́ʼí, and Huervano Mesa, or Dzil Ná’oodílíí, are located more centrally in the original Navajo territory in present-day New Mexico. In the ancient hooghan design, these two additional mountains form the entrance to the home that extends beyond the eastern wall.

According to oral tradition, the Diyin Dine’é, or the Holy People, placed these mountains in order to provide a home for the Dine’é; therefore, the hooghan, representing these mountains and sandwiched between Mother Earth and Father Sky, serves as a reminder of this important relationship. The Navajo traditionally value the relationship they have with Mother Earth, Father Sky, and the Holy People as they value the relationships within their homes, clans, and tribe. These relationships are also known as k’é. K’é is a concept that is both intrinsic and key to Navajo worldview as it embodies the relationships between beings. These relationships extend to include the interrelatedness of the human race and the interconnectedness of all beings in the universe.

A second key concept is the idea of hózhǫ´. Hózhǫ´ is a Navajo cultural worldview that is generally understood as the balance or harmony necessary in our relationship with the natural world. This concept can be translated in many ways, from the responsibility of maintaining ceremony and balance in the natural world to the necessity of acknowledging the interrelations defined by k’é as a means of holding each other accountable for the aforementioned responsibilities. The hooghan not only embodies the ideas of hózhǫ´ and k’é, but it also represents positive environmental stewardship through the use of passive solar design in building and maintaining modest housing.

On October 22-23 and October 27-29, 2016, the three hooghans were visited for the purpose of taking temperature data and dimensional measurements. For each hooghan measured, 4 external and 5 internal temperatures were taken. This data was graphed so that the internal and external temperatures at each cardinal direction could be compared to one another with time. Next, the average internal and average external temperatures were calculated and graphed with time per hooghan. In addition to this information, trend lines were added to show a smoother representation of the temperature data. A sinusoidal line was also drawn onto the graph to roughly symbolize these average temperatures in relation to the daylight hours.

A miniature hooghan model was also built and measured, and two graphs were made to represent its temperature readings. Deciding to create the miniature model proved to be an important task in understanding the thermal trends inside a hooghan. Because the model created was placed on the ground after peak sunlight and immediately measured, the model was not able to receive and retain any heat internally. This meant the model’s internal temperatures were at or below the external temperatures as the night progressed. With a full day of sunlight to absorb, the model may have had a set of temperature data comparable to that of an actual hooghan of similar design. For the real hooghans and as suspected, the results obtained suggest that the more
traditional the hooghan, the more thermally efficient its design. These results are consistent with the belief that indigenous methodology, based on ancient principles and practices, produces solutions best suited for the indigenous group’s native environment. More sets of data collected more accurately and more completely could further demonstrate this theory.

In the future, not only could more hooghans be tested but potentially HUD or NHA-style houses could also be analyzed. The results from such experiments could be used to influence the housing programs utilized on the Navajo Nation and various other parts of Indian Country. Additionally, such analyses could be incorporated to greater studies related to energy consumption on the Navajo Nation, the cost to construct and maintain different kinds of housing, and even the effects promoting housing that is constructed with local materials and which burns woody resources have on controlling the brush and forest fires that have become more frequent in recent years. With more information to support theory, research of this nature could have a positive effect on the cultural relevancy and energy efficiency of homes constructed through the housing programs present in modern Indian Country.

Part 2: Sky City of Acoma

To reiterate, the cultural incompetence of services to the Navajo Nation is not a problem unique to that tribe. Many Federal services are obligated to Native American tribes as a condition of treaty rights and other international agreements. This means many programs, such those that serve as transportation, education, and housing, are either run by branches of the Department of the Interior or by tribes utilizing the assistance of federal funds and outside contractors. All of these programs are “blanket” services as they are chartered identically by the federal government to all 567 federally-recognized tribes in the U.S. There is no tailoring of a program to a tribe’s culture or geography location. In fact, the only tribe-specific detail that alters e.g. a transportation program is the population size of the community, and even that detail is only used to determine monetary delegations.

This lack of program modification means the cultural validation and self-determination the Federal Government is supposed to support is excluded. In contrast to the more remote traditional lifestyle of the Navajos, such insensitivity to cultural and geographical needs at the Pueblo of Acoma is evident by the construction of new, Western homes that displace a once tight-knit, ceremonial community. The Navajo Nation and the Pueblo of Acoma are geographically similar, but their cultural needs are worlds apart; therefore, in order to analyze the depth of this insensitivity, it is important to also consider the traditional way of life for H’aaku’me (Acoma people), the brilliancy of energy-efficient Pueblo blueprints, and proposals for how the Federal Government could serve tribal nations better. The summary of these findings is used to propose a model for quantifying cultural needs in site-specific services is created to suggest a way outside contractors can better meet the needs of tribal people.

Located just south of I-40 near Grants, New Mexico, the Pueblo of Acoma is one of 19 Pueblos in the state. The Pueblos trace their ancestry to the Anasazi who once occupied southwestern present-day Colorado. According to the legend told at H’aaku, the mesa where Sky City sits was originally discovered when Salt Woman led the people to the “center of the Earth” while spiraling inwards and anti-clockwise towards H’aaku. In fact, in the Keresan language,
H’aaku translates to “the place prepared” – implying that the mesa had everything the people needed in one place, awaiting their arrival as it was especially for them.

The mesas at and near Sky City have been occupied by the Pueblo of Acoma for hundreds of years. When the Spanish began arriving in the 1500s, the Pueblos became victims of harsh religious crusades and, eventually, slave labor. This is how the only church at H’aaku came to be built, using timber enslaved men were forced to bring down from sacred Mount Taylor and carry up the sides of the mesa. In 1680, the Pueblos successfully united to overthrow Spanish control and take back their communities. [6]

The Spanish had worked for generations to convert the Pueblos to Catholicism. Pueblo spirituality, however, runs very deep. In fact, the Pueblos are known to be some of the most religious of all groups in the present-day United States. Traditionally, these people lived in tight-knit communities. That is the reason why their legal name is not Tribe or Nation or Rancheria but Pueblo, as it means city in Spanish. Living in such a close community is critical to many aspects of Pueblo life, but it is especially necessary for two major functions: 1) the preparing and processing of community surpluses and 2) religious ceremonies. Not only did living in close community with one another mean processing food and participating in religious practices were easier, but traditional Pueblo homes were actually designed to facilitate such communal activities.

At the Pueblo of Acoma’s Sky City, also known as Haak’u, the homes hark back to the cliff-dwelling days of the Anasazi. Constructed out of adobe and mud, each house fits into one of three main rows of predominantly three-storey buildings. The northernmost walls contain the third floors. Both second and third floors are accessible only by ladder. The first stories, facing the south, are usually accessible by doorways that open to the street. In general, there are very few openings in the homes save for a few skylights and vents. [7] The specific engineering of these homes is critical to encapsulating their scientific success, but the functionality of the design is equally important. Because the two major functions of Pueblo life in a place like Sky City are traditionally centered around food preparation and ceremonial activities, it is important to note how these buildings facilitate such community engagement.

The flat roofs with complete sun exposure have always been ideal for drying things like corn kernels for storage. Inside the homes, certain rooms were dedicated to grinding corn. Women would kneel side-by-side and grind corn on stones, passing them between bins of varying fineness. The walls behind them were hollowed out to accommodate their legs and feet in such small spaces. Perhaps the most interesting piece to the corn-grinding process is that dried kernels were delivered directly to the grinding room via chutes built into the housing structure itself.

Pueblo homes are notorious for having poles that extend beyond the building’s walls. These play a role in hanging ristas full of drying chiles, or even strips of meat. Other foods, such as halves of peaches, could be dried on the roof alongside kernels. Prepared piñons were placed in dedicated storage rooms where cisterns were built into the walls. These cisterns could then be sealed with plaster. Various other vegetables, including squash, could be stored in these rooms as well. All in all, a Pueblo house could contain several years worth of stored food at any given moment.
The proximity of these homes made it easy to share resources as well as to participate in community events. Many religious ceremonies occur in the streets of traditional Pueblos, the citizens typically occupying the roofs as they would to observe nearly any street activity. At the Pueblo of Acoma, there were also dedicated fire-watchers and, during certain ceremonies, every woman in the village had to stoke a fire in the home. From the traditional, religious point-of-view, participating in these ceremonies is absolutely crucial for guaranteeing the well-being of the community and for maintaining a natural balance in the world. Of course, these beautiful homes also provide so much more to the world in terms of engineering brilliance. According to the tour guide at Sky City, the Spanish introduced the true adobe material, which contains straw. Previously, Pueblo construction very closely matched Anasazi work: peculiarly long, thin bricks of mud that were stacked with thick amounts of mortar between them. Walls are built against each other but not into each other, and bricks are placed in a honeycombed fashion that can be easily disassembled when a home is no longer occupied and used to build another home nearby.

The adobe in most homes is approximately two-feet thick. While some sources claim adobe actually has an R-value nearly equivalent to modern masonry or wooden-framed walls, other factors, such as thermal lag and air tightness, are what make adobe such a high performer in such climates as New Mexico. Add this factor to the tall, wind-blocking northern walls and sun-exposed southern steps and the result is a building that absorbs – and retains – a significant amount of incident solar energy. This particular design utilizes what is called the “solar envelope”. Many modern buildings and city planners have proposed adopting this concept as if it is novel. However, the Pueblo trace their use of the solar envelope back to the Anasazi days where they utilized both the sun and the protection of cliffs to live a comfortable life.

Due to certain walls in a housing unit being exposed to different amounts of solar radiation, the rooms on the uppermost section of each floor are the warmest. Therefore, the rooms below them are dedicated as storage rooms. The warmer rooms are used to prepare food on traditional, bee-hive-like ovens and as sleeping quarters. It takes only a slightly stoked fire to comfortably heat one of these rooms in the night, even in the coldest of New Mexican weather. This is due largely to the building’s orientation to the sun, its thick adobe walls, and the absence of other buildings overshadowing its solar envelope. An additional piece of traditional Pueblo housing that makes it so ideal is its roofs’ exposure to sunlight. These rooftops are in the perfect position to receive more daylight than any other part of the building, and they are also where food is dried and generally prepared. This means communities like Sky City were able to maximize their workdays without the need for any additional lighting to complete food preparation tasks.

As history indicates, a lot of change has occurred in Indian Country during the last few centuries alone. This change has typically meant an enormous shift in structure, values, and access to resources. It has created a dependency for many communities on Federal Indian programs. It has also created a number of community ills, most of which could be arguably traced back to systemic issues, or to policies which promoted assimilation and tribal termination. The Pueblos are no exceptions. Now that the traditional Pueblo home and the purpose of its design has been explained, it is necessary to circle back to the aforementioned blanket federal services that exist for this community.
The Pueblo of Acoma Housing Authority (PAHA) is to the Pueblo of Acoma what NHA is to the Navajo Nation. PAHA’s motto is “providing safe and affordable housing opportunities”, an expression that suggests dangerous communities and financial security are two categories of concern. Even Acoma’s housing entity fails to mention cultural needs in any of its motivators. If the tribe does not prioritize these needs, then it is certain the federal government does not either. In the meantime, families are placed into Western, cookie-cutter homes. These homes are made from imported materials, not thermally efficient, and fail to address any of the spiritual needs of the place like H’aaku Across the Pueblo of Acoma as well as across numerous other Pueblos, the displacement of families into distant, isolated homes has caused great distress on the community’s wellbeing. Elders describe what could be categorized as “cultural loss and damage” via this displacement.

Although PAHA has secured the funds for a new housing project, it has again hired outside contractors to design new buildings that match the aesthetics of Pueblo homes but which surely are not made of two feet of adobe or constructed with ladders to the second stories. This is because outsiders – whether contractors or federal agents – neither know about cultural needs nor are competent enough in them to adequately provide them. However, it could be argued such services are necessary for meeting the self-determination obligation agencies have to tribal nations and communities. [8]

**Conclusion: A Proposal Moving Foreward**

The questions then becomes: Is it possible to quantify the cultural needs of a community by the same means one would quantify thermal efficiency or cost in dollar figures? Should such a thing even be attempted? While some cultural processes have been created for communities such as the Maori of New Zealand, what could a process look like for something like the Pueblo of Acoma? [9] The Navajo Nation? Any and all sovereign nations resisting a colonial structure?

For the purposes of this ongoing project, answers to these questions were attempted by constructing two tables which demonstrate how one might attempt to quantify cultural competency success of services based on tribe-specific paradigms. These tables, which are provided below, are also used to demonstrate the stark contrast between the cultures used for this project: the Navajo Nation and the Pueblo of Acoma. Although these tables are merely drafts and should never be used in place of proper community consultation, such models offer hope to how outside contractors could better provide for tribal members.
Federal programs owe tribes across the country more cultural sensitivity and validation than they presently do. This is necessary for the promotion of self-determination and necessary for honoring culture and identity. If Indian housing programs could be more culturally competent, not only might they eliminate many social ills plaguing communities today but the homes would also be more energy efficient. Furthermore, the federal government has a responsibility to do better, the contractor has a responsibility to meet its client’s needs, and the tribe has the responsibility to prioritize cultural competency. While quantifying culture may be hard to do, it appears to be one step in the right direction for all the diversity of tribal nations. It will also assist in dispelling myths or stereotypes. By reviving the solar envelope techniques of ancient Pueblo buildings may also lead to better and more energy efficient cities. Reforming this system will not only save energy, but it will also help preserve the community’s culture and traditional way of life.

References


Since this paper is part of a panel of the AIS section dedicated to the memory and spirit of Vine Deloria, Jr., I will begin with a few observations I attribute to Vine about both journalism and scholarship. First, Vine seemed to have little regard for mass media as he experienced it in his lifetime. For him, the mass media presented an often-ludicrous reflection of US society, one filled with the stereotypic and myopic images of Native people continuously revivified in the news production of reporters and editors generally ill-equipped to cover even the most minor aspects of federal Indian policy. His frequent comments on the resultant ignorance of the American public on even the basic details of the Native experience were part and parcel of his writing and his public speaking. I do not have much to go on about his views on journalism as a profession or as a major strand of modern democracy and self-government in tribal communities. That fact has been a bit of a puzzle to me, since I know he regularly read newspapers and participated in debates in the media, frequently contributing his own articles for publication in print media, including in Native publications. Vine did, however, offer some telling critique of the mass media’s films, especially in its portrayal of Native people. His contributions to documentary films intended to challenge stereotypes of Native people remain an interesting part of his legacy.

I was a student in the University of Arizona’s American Indian Studies Master’s Degree program from 1982-1984, and I recall an article by Vine which was published while I taking classes from him with a cadre of graduate students who had been accepted to the program partly because of their backgrounds in Indian country. While the article did not focus upon journalism, it gave me some insight into approaches I would later apply to dealing with mass media portrayals of Native people and the resulting popular culture’s tropes of “Indians.” It appeared in the Native Nevadan’s December, 1983 issue. It was entitled “Why Me Tonto: The Latest Plague to our Red
Brother: Hippie Film-makers.” In it, Vine lampooned the then-rampant desire of film-makers to produce ‘The Film’ about Native people. They hoped to rely heavily upon Vine’s insights, which were so popular then in such writings as his Custer Died for your Sins and God is Red so they could get it right this time. As is obvious in the title of this informal article, his disdain for such projects was palpable in this short, cleverly-written article, which was passed among us students. The article is one of my favorite Vine articles, since it so clearly reveals his personality as a part of the fun as he attained popular stature in the in the 1980’s and it helped us put the popular culture’s fascination with “real Indians” into perspective as we worked to find avenues for our own desires to substantiate and make use of traditional values for our projects as graduate students.

As mentioned earlier, Deloria had already contributed to documentary films, despite his humorous jab at non-Indian documentary filmmakers in the “Why Me Tonto” article. The 1979 documentary film entitled “Reel Indians,” was hosted by actor Will Sampson and included an interview with activist Dennis Banks, along with footage of some of the early westerns that revealed a seemingly sinister intent on the part of early movie-makers in portraying the savage Indian stereotype. Those early westerns were supposed to make the American story of westward expansion a heroic saga as a basis for the development for the American character. In that documentary, Deloria made the telling argument that those stereotypes were harmful for Native people, especially children, who were subject to a spurious “second authority” that undermined their very identities by ubiquitous media stereotypes passed into the popular culture via these movies. It is no wonder that Deloria remained critical, even humorously so, in the article! It became a life-long campaign as Deloria continued his efforts counter the de-humanization of Native people so common in his times. He remained a vital spokesman and even a co-litigant against de-humanizing stereotypes in such efforts as opposing the NFL’s Washington professional football team’s mascot, as most people are aware. As many readers know, that struggle to supplant harmful stereotypes extended to his very serious efforts to substantiate traditional Native conceptions of reality and truth against the prevailing notion that Indian traditions are “primitive” and therefore not worthy of serious consideration as sources to be considered in modern intellectual development.

I think many of us who revered Vine’s sense of confidence in this glare of public interest were emboldened in our academic inquiry because of the way Vine wove us all into his endeavors with gusto in his amazing discussions with students during his office hours at the AIS office, then located in Harvill Hall at the U of A. I can honestly say my own meager later publications and those more voluminous publishing careers of other students in our program were shaped by Vine’s good-natured, spot-on repartee. His more serious informal discussions of political, historical and spiritual issues in Indian country were, of course, vitally crucial for many of us. Vine’s classes offered us all opportunities for more focused interactions that broadened our understandings of many aspects of Indian policy, including the very human side of the personalities he was familiar

with from his own experiences. His formal scholarship and writing remain inspirational for all of us.

But indigenous journalism, the field I was most interested in when I arrived fresh from my rather brief, but inspiring experience in Oneida as the editor of our tribe’s Kalihwisaks newspaper, was not a major topic that Vine commented upon. I was left to my own devices and some amazing Native people in the communications field as I continued my career-long fascination with the ideal of freedom of the press in Indian country and the hope of helping establish an effective information conduit among tribal members in the struggle of creating effective self-government in tribal communities. Vine provided a good model of self-confidence and an efficient work ethic to marvel at; one few of us former students is likely to match in our own careers.

In the other field of intellectual development and the communication of ideas I deal with in this paper, academic scholarship, Vine arguably had some much more incisive, profound comments, largely because his own intellectual quest was developed within the parameters of the academy from his “outsider,” indigenous perspective. His contributions to the pedagogy of Native education and indigenous studies have helped to forge a spirited development of both community-based tribal education projects and the continuing evolution of higher education in both tribal colleges and among other higher education institutions around the country and even in the more global context. In fact, his 2002 address to scholars at the WSSA annual conference’s plenary luncheon remains both a legitimate critique of today’s academic shortcomings and a challenge to Native scholars in achieving an ever more effective paradigm for indigenous development that maintains the values of our traditions.

As a part of other comments about the dangers of dogmatic processes that distort academic disciplines, the marginalization of Native scholars in academic departments and the subjugation of graduate students, Vine was very concerned about the way students and others made use of the internet in their research. He commented that “…we’re soon to be plagued with a generation of people who are being taught right now in middle school and high school that once you retrieve something from the computer, you’ve got the truth. I want you, as you go forward in your academic career, to watch how students are understanding what do with computers. We may be creating some zombies here…” Vine seems to have been prescient in his charge to the many scholars in attendance at the luncheon that day, since “post-truth” assertions today do require some intensive fact-checking, beyond what so many seem to be gaining from the “echo chamber” that information systems like Facebook and the mining of personal data to guide one’s searches online have created. That echo chamber effect that couples one’s personal data with a limited range of information and opinions online is one of the major highways of disinformation used by those who intentionally mine personal data for use in disinformation campaigns online. The recent scandal over Cambridge Analytica’s use of personal data its operatives gleaned from Facebook quickly

\[3\] Vine Deloria, Jr. “Reforming the Future: Where is the Academy Going?” Plenary Luncheon Address, Western Social Science Association annual conference, 11 April, 2002. Transcript provided by Dr. Nicholas Peroff, who was WSSA president that year.

\[4\] Ibid. p. 8.
comes to mind. Even searches in Google Scholar have been somewhat discredited, raising concerns about the processes of research many students rely upon in the academy.

“Truth,” what it is and how Native peoples regard it, was one of Vine Deloria, Jr.’s major philosophical pursuits. His remarkable books God is Red (1973), Metaphysics of Modern Existence (1979) and Spirit and Reason (short writings spanning his writing career and collected in 1999) are some of his most notable writings that rely upon his understanding of Native perceptions of reality, so frequently dismissed as “primitive” and therefore undeserving of serious consideration by science, theology or other disciplines of western academia. It is important to note that he used the actual term “truth” sparingly though, preferring instead the term “reality.” As Daniel Wildcat noted in the Forward to the 2012 republication of The Metaphysics of Modern Existence, Deloria’s quest “…was not seeking ‘the answer’ to the vexing problems facing modern humankind; rather ‘a search for the structure and meaning of reality.’” And, as Deloria wrote in this book, establishing truth is a process for all of us, one of searching. “The search must once again be one of seeking truth in a supracultural sense, examining the insights of many traditions, gathering what appear to be reasonable and reliable data from all fields of knowledge, and bringing about a systematic understanding of the total picture that emerges from such a quest.”

One can only imagine what Deloria would say today about the “post-truth” development in media and politics which seems bent on undermining the very foundations of such a search.

Deloria’s analysis of traditional conceptions about truth and reality remind me that America has long been involved in denial of some of the basic elements of its own experience as it championed a largely fictional story – perhaps historical fiction is a better term – that I have called the American Story in some of my other writings. Thus, the “post-truth” climate of political media today has a longer story of denial of the truth that makes many citizens of the U.S. especially vulnerable to the post-truth’s reliance upon a super-patriotic, unquestioned American identity.

For all his gifts to all of us, I remain in awe of Vine’s courageous and still-inspiring search for truth.

The “Post-Truth” Realm of Political Debate

When the Oxford Dictionaries chose the term “post-truth” as its new “word of the year” in 2016, it was actually acknowledging a concept that has long been recognized as a threat to public discourse and free speech in mass media. The publishers of this internationally recognized dictionary define the term as “an adjective defined as ‘relating to or denoting circumstances in which objective facts are less influential in shaping public opinion than appeals to emotion and personal belief’.” Since the very idea of public discourse relies so directly upon its adherents’ commitment to factual evidence in pursuit of the truth, the idea that individuals involved in public debates should be exempt from that standard because they advocate for a certain policy would seem to disqualify those individuals from serious policy debates. Scholars and journalists seem to share that value of truthfulness in their evidence even when they disagree among themselves in policy debates. Yet the post-truth approach is now common in political debates and news commentary, especially among right-wing politicos. Use of false evidence to support policy endeavors is nothing new, but the normalization of such a questionable practice in the highest levels of government would seem to undermine the very process of democratic policy-making. While truth may be in the eye of the beholder, public policy demands a measured standard of accuracy in order to protect what some call the “public good” from exploitive forces that have always threatened democratic society. The fact that even writing this analysis can now be considered by some as a political position demonstrates the dynamic power the term “post-truth” connotes in confounding the rational debate of public policy. Perhaps now is the time for scholars to review the history of the liberal, left-wing and conservative, right wing viewpoints as the public understands those political stances. For that popular culture review, the readers of this paper area encouraged to read about the basis for liberal and conservative agendas in public policy.

The Structures of Post-Truth: The Threat to Journalism in the Mass Media

As this paper is written, an intense attack is being waged upon journalism and journalists, whose responsibility it is to provide accurate, accountable information for the purposes of empowering citizens to participate knowledgeably public policy debates. Concentrated ownership of media organizations by huge international corporate entities, politically-motivated propaganda campaigns and new battles for control of the internet have combined to threaten the very existence of journalism as we have known it. In meeting their responsibility, journalists have always

---


“comforted the afflicted and afflicted the comfortable,” as they hold government and other powerful people and institutions accountable to the public good. Now, even the concept of the “public good” is under attack by those seeking control over the vast economic resources that new media like those the internet can provide. Instead, private, corporate ownership of all mass media combined with the reduction of funding available for public media has skewed the media and journalism itself toward the oligarchical priorities of finance and economics so endemic to giant corporations.  

The survival of journalism’s stated First Amendment goals of serving the public interest with well researched and accountable information and well supported editorial content is especially endangered. Adam Smith’s “invisible hand” that is supposed to be inherent in the economics of private enterprise to serve the public good seems completely absent in advancing that value. Since giant corporations are not democratic institutions, their nearly unregulated control over the processes that are supposed to lead to the informed consent of the governed undermines democracy in this country. Meanwhile, ongoing deregulation of nearly all aspects of corporate activity that might protect journalism and the public’s right to know and to participate knowledgeably in politics continues unabated. It is as if one of the dystopian sci-fi nightmares regularly portrayed in entertainment media has come true!

The current situation has been dubbed the “post truth” era of public information by many who recognize the intentional obfuscation of facts about public policy in today’s communications environment. Clearly, the process of rational consideration of reliable information in support of an ethical debate of policy issues has become steadily more endangered at a time when the danger to democratic principles of free press and a citizen’s right to informed participation in governance seems more pronounced than ever in US history. It is clear that the impacts of post-truth dynamics on public participation in policy debates are greatly accelerated by the current rapidly expanding control of all mass media by giant corporate media owners, whose financial priorities are not supportive of democracy.

In their extensively researched publications about the forces behind the decline of journalism and the corporate oligarchic take-over of mass media, Robert W. McChesney and John Nichols provide a startling picture of the dangers to U.S. citizen’s rights to informed participation in not only their own government, but when one also considers the oligarchical control of entertainment

12 Finley Peter Dunne is usually credited with this well-known quote in 1898 when he had one of the characters in his play “A Bartenders is Born,” a Mr. Dooley, utter the words as part of a long monologue.
media by these same vast corporations, to the very development of U. S. culture. One of their major findings is that the older commercial business model of newspapers and broadcast services are no longer viable in maintaining a vibrant free and independent media to serve the First Amendment rights of the nation’s citizens. In fact, they propose public funding and government oversight of at least a large segment of the mass media to fill the void of available economic resources to assure a Fourth Estate relationship between government and other powerful forces, and the people, whose rights are likely to be threatened by censorship or, in this case, by attacks from those who manipulate information for their own political interests in the post-truth era.

The Attack on Principles of the Free Press

Current policies of the Trump Administration, coupled with the president’s attempts to discredit media coverage that does not favor his program for “Making American Great Again,” have direct implications for the “free marketplace” of ideas, so essential to the need for diverse viewpoints and diverse sources of news that such a marketplace implies. For many years since the First Amendment to the US Constitution was included in 1796 in the Bill of Rights, the “free press” has blamed for creating both a quagmire of confusing viewpoints and revered as a clear advocate for the rights of the People. Taken as an institution for protecting the diverse viewpoints within the body politic so that the People could make decisions and direct their representatives in government, it has viewed for generations as a necessary though often-imperfect beacon for truth and justice. But the attack on those principles, now seen by many as a steady, undermining influence of unregulated corporate commercialism and as an offensive of today’s neo-Conservatives, has reached a critical juncture in the mass media. Liberals, too, are likely to continue to their own efforts to obscure their motives as public debates move toward future elections.

As the numbers of professional journalists plummet amid a new economic order dominated by corporate profit-seeking, the current danger to the media, including the internet journalism and the scholarship it supports, is shocking to many. The recent Federal Communications Commission’s decisions on media ownership that greatly favor large corporate consolidation of media and its current action to end net neutrality with a minimum of public debate and without congressional

18 Use of the metaphor “marketplace of ideas” carries its own baggage, as the idea that some form of “market” is the ideal to strive for. The idea that markets are the best way to serve the public good are increasingly suspect, since capitalist markets today are dominated by the philosophies of a neo-liberal reinterpretation of Adam Smith’s “unseen hand” that supposedly creates efficiencies that serve everyone. The “rising tide raises all boats” metaphor once attributed to John F. Kennedy is another expression of this spurious concept.
action or widespread public debate are seen by many as a threat to the public access to the internet and the right of the people to determine how the internet will be developed. In an era where “post-truth” political activity is in its heyday, such a concentration of ownership in the hands of a few massive corporations is likely to severely limit the ability of the public to monitor its own interests via the free press as it has in the past. Powerful commercial and ideological lobbying groups have seemingly usurped the public’s rights without congressional action or meaningful public debate.


In 2008 alone, some 5,900 reporters, columnists and editors lost their jobs in lay-offs across the U. S. newspaper industry, an 11.3 percent decline in newsroom employment. Those figures came from a survey of just 931 of 1,405 daily newspapers which responded to an American Society of News Editors survey that year, so the actual lay-offs were undoubtedly even higher. McChesney and Nichols also cited Erica Smith, who was a multimedia and print designer at the St. Louis Post-Dispatch, who has maintained a blog called “Paper Cuts,” which has become an almost real-time documentation of the crises in newspaper journalism, showing layoffs and newly “out of print” newspapers across the country. A Facebook page has taken up the “Paper Cuts” documentation since 2012 and followed the personal stories of some of those laid-off through 2013, reporting the human cost of the startling numbers of laid-off news staffers and closings of major newspapers.

Where newspapers have survived in print or online or in both media, as with the Denver Post, skeleton crews of journalists and production crews remain to cover the many news beats that were formerly handled with declining staff in recent years. In 2009, the other large daily in Denver, the Rocky Mountain News, ceased publication, laying off some 230 members of the editorial staff. As the last remaining large metropolitan newspaper in Denver, the Post announced on March 23, 2018 severe staff cuts – 30 of the remaining 80 staffers. In a CBS Denver Channel 4 TV broadcast, a laid-off reporter lamented that the new “hedge fund owners” of the Post were making the cuts. Nichols and McChesney reported in 2010 that the paper is overseen by MediaNews Group, but by 2018, another corporate owner, Digitalfirst had taken over and now seems intent on following the mega-corporate strategy of maximizing profit at all costs, then closing newspapers that do not meet their profit margin criteria, pocketing the proceeds of liquidation of assets. According to a Denver Channel 7 “News 360” report aired on March 18, of this year, in 2009, there were two newspapers in Denver with a combined 500 print journalists employed. After the 2018 layoffs at the Denver Post, there were 80. According to the Post’s 2018 Annual Report, the Post had a total of 200 employee, which includes those laid-off in 2018. The 2018 Annual Report is available online at https://transition.fcc.gov/osp/inc-report/INoC-1-Newspapers.pdf. Accesed 3.31.18.

3.30.18.

21 American Society of News Editors, as stated in McChesney, Nichols, 2010, p. 18.
Post and the 2009 closing of the Rocky Mountain News, there were only 70 newspaper journalists working in Denver. Since print journalists cover far more of the news environment than TV or radio broadcasters, TV channels like Denver Channel 7 partner with print journalists regularly to provide detailed, accurate information. One spokesman for the Denver Newspaper Guild commented on the situation on the Channel 7 broadcast March 18 by asking, “...Who will cover the school boards, the city council? Will shady business deals go unreported?” Several spokespersons for the Colorado Press Association featured in the Channel 7 broadcast expressed hopes that the remaining Denver Post staff can counter “fake news” with quality, incisive coverage. One wonders how they can accomplish that goal when, as Denver Channel 7 reports, the Denver Post has laid off three-fourths of its news staff just since 2011.

Nichols and McChesney’s list of newspapers that ceased publication by 2010 included some of the most recognizable newspapers in the West, including The Seattle Post-Intelligencer and The Tucson Citizen and the Albuquerque Tribune. One need only check the internet to see what newspapers in one’s home area are threatened by the corporate closings across the country in 2018. It is a truly shocking story to realize that newspapers throughout the country are closing as you read this paper. Journalists by the thousands are losing their jobs each year. Those who remain are stretched to cover so many beats that much of the public’s interests are simply not being scrutinized in daily coverage. One wonders how quality journalism can possibly counter the “fake news” that is widely circulated in this, the post-truth era.

Why the Internet does not provide the Answer for Declining Journalistic Coverage: An Analysis by McChesney and Nichols

One might ask, why citizens cannot rely upon internet websites in combination with “citizen journalists” using blogs and other avenues for news reporting to fill the void that newspaper-style journalism leaves as “old media” like print media, rapidly disappear? The existing business model for commercial news has been based only partly on subscription-based revenue and mostly on advertising sales. According to McChesney and Nichols, and the many sources they cite in their studies, newspapers have long included website news in addition to their declining hard-copy print publications. As those print operations fail under the twin pressures of rising production costs and the corporate priorities of often distant owners of newspapers, most news operations are now finding advertisers harder to attract with so many other options available to them on the internet. Further reductions in ad revenues results from businesses who have themselves created websites with “click through” sales technology included, greatly reducing the need for a “middle man” advertising campaign that could provide revenues to newspapers. While online newspapers can still attract advertising, substantially reduced revenues result from competing, easily available, demographically targeted, web operations that have begun to attract the bulk of advertising revenues.  

The idea of erecting paywalls in newspaper websites to gain revenues formerly paid by newspaper subscribers has also proven to be a false hope for sufficient revenues, at least in the

---


27 McChesney, Nichols, 2010, p. 67
short run. Competition from news operations and blogs that make their content available for free is just one of the major hurdles to those revenues. All news publications would have to erect paywalls to keep users from simply using their search engines to find free information from many other sources, even though those sources might not practice professional journalism. “News aggregators,” for instance, compile information from many sources, seemingly stealing the products produced by hard-working journalists. The resulting news items may not serve the entire range of readers’ news needs from the perspective of journalism standards, but most users find it satisfactory already from their Google Chrome or Microsoft Edge browsers or from Google News or the Huffington Post.

Another concern in erecting paywalls is that Blogs which make use of links to sites in their conversations with their users would be seriously compromised by widespread reliance upon paywalls. Since a user might wish to access many sites in one sitting, paywalls soon become expensive and unpopular, as today’s users are discovering. Rob Howard has analyzed the idea of paywall restrictions on news, finding that “The Internet business models reward future traffic rather than the authority and prestige that come from years of honest, serious reporting. They push for more news, trendier news and faster news, and they discourage calm, thoughtful, responsible journalism.” He goes on to write that in the editorial function of newspapers “the paywall has encouraged publications to become more opinionated and more extreme, in the hopes their readers will be more likely to subscribe to a paper that vehemently agrees with them.” So the results, Howard claims, are counterproductive, since users can always just click away from the paywall site rather than invest in numerous paywalls each day.

News production is expensive, as original news research requires on-going costs of salaried, professional journalists, trained in their profession to provide the accurate, accountable information citizens need to exercise their sovereignty knowledgeably. These costs do not go away because of the existence of the internet. Instead, today’s ever-fewer journalists are being forced to survive in an economy that does not reward their hard work with a decent livelihood. It is a vicious crisis that journalists face around the world as concentrated corporate ownership of media, new technologies that displace older newsroom models, and extreme online political information sources proliferate in the post-truth era.

Finally, McChesney and Nichols examine the proposed solution that “citizen journalism” and “crowd sourcing” will eventually replace the current market-based economics of newspapers entirely as those kinds of information options evolve into a form of technology that provides nearly omniscient-levels of information via some form of cybertech linkage to mobile devices. Such new technology will still not provide any revenue for full-time professional journalists, they believe,

leaving the basic problem of access to reliable, accurate and accountable information unsolved. Even relying upon non-profit organizations to fund whatever journalistic product emerges, which they find intriguing, is wanting, since the advocacy groups involved could not be counted upon to preserve free press guarantees to journalism."

McChesney and Nichols also document some other troubling issues facing news media that are related to concentrated commercial and corporate ownership of the mass media. Hyper-commercialism, advertising and concentrated public relations messaging, is another problem facing the public as it attempts to follow the news. Children, who “respond more favorably to commercials than any other age group,” are targeted by advertisers in attempts gain their loyalty to specific brands, for instance. “Guerilla Marketing” attempts to co-opt identifiable cultural trend-setting groups by actually sending out teams of people likely to be admired by these trend-setters into urban areas to recruit brand-loyal consumers. “The ideal is to have ‘potential buyers’ learn ‘about a brand from their coolest friends.’” One might question the social cost of seeking the news in the mass media dominated commercials and public relations advertising and even in-program messaging. It seems nothing is outside the ethical standards of commercial manipulation of messaging, raising further concern about the news media’s reliance upon private, rather than public ownership of news and other media. When one watches news programming on television, for instance, one is likely to be bombarded by commercial messaging and slanted public relations messages. When one couples that commercialism with advertising on the internet, which targets messages to those most emotionally vulnerable to its messages of fear and success via consumerism, the threat to the news media posed by its almost complete dependence upon advertising revenues becomes clear.

To transfer a vibrant journalism into the internet, McChesney and Nichols write “We cannot overemphasize how important a ubiquitous and open Internet, with guaranteed privacy, is to anyone’s vision of a free press or free speech in the future.” They then endorse net-neutrality in rather absolute terms, as a necessary precondition, and outline some creative methods for public funding of journalism into the future. Once again, very recent actions of the Trump Administration have trumped much of their strategy. On December 14, 2017 the Federal Communications Commission repealed its rules on net neutrality, opening the internet to corporate control. Congressional review of the FCC’s action is sure to reach a peak in the coming months over this issue, but the current administration’s willingness to reduce regulations in ways that favor huge corporate power over the direction of internet development is another very serious threat to the survival of vibrant journalism.

30McChesney, Nichols, 2010, p. 79.
33McChesney, Nichols, 2010, p. 201.
The Future of Journalism: A Bleak Picture

Since broadcast and internet journalism relies heavily upon the hard work of old media-style journalists for its major research of issues and events, especially for local news, the failure to find revenue options for journalists on the internet has trumped (no pun intended) the journalistic economic enterprise there. Against this economic reality, McChesney and Nichols advocate what many find an unlikely, some would say, unrealistic solution: Public funding of journalism. The existing model is the now-threaten Public Broadcasting system. In their extensive examination of this option, they remind us that public funding of news has always been a part of the equation, beginning with the Founding Fathers’ statements and actions, including postal waivers to meet the circulation costs of the print media and laws and regulations that protect journalists. As McChesney and Nichols make their arguments for this, the only viable option they see to commercial, now corporate control of news production, they make the case that only reliable funding, mostly or entirely from the federal budget, will create the conditions that allow a free and independent journalism to thrive.

As commercial journalism evolves toward a public relations-like model funded by corporations, they believe actual free press models of journalism can only be assured under some form of PBS-like model. Unfortunately, the Public Broadcast Service is currently threatened by the proposed President Trump budget, which advocates its complete defunding. The groundwork for the Corporation for Public Broadcasting which was created in 1967 by the Carnegie Commission in the original legislation for PBS, has anticipated Trump’s action by proposing another somewhat unlikely solution. Recently, “the Carnegie Commission proposed creating a tax on every new television set purchase that would fund the corporation and keep it out of the annual budgetary process.” While that strategy might not be viable in our current conservative policy environment, it reveals the ingenuity many are bringing to today’s challenges.

Thus, the future of journalism in the U. S. is in serious doubt. Despite McChesney and Nichol’s excellent research and analysis of the threats to the public’s right to exercise its sovereignty in public policy-making, their proposals for the future are quickly becoming moot in the era of post-truth information coupled with concentrated ownership of mass media. For indigenous Native Americans operating in Indian country, who have their own developing journalism institutions, the older model of the First Amendment and the substantial case law that supports it, has a unique set of variables owing to policies of Indian self-determination. As this paper will reveal, Native journalists are in a rather distinct news environment and may yet find creative ways to deal with the post-truth communications environment as they maintain their own concepts of sovereignty and peoplehood.

How ‘Post-Truth’ politics and Massive Corporate Control of Media Affect Native Peoples

36 Ibid.
As many indigenous authors have noted, intentional fabrication of the truth in public policy aimed at Native peoples is nothing new. Both in official federal Indian policy and in popular culture’s media, Native people and their concerns have long been misrepresented and trivialized as the “American Story” codified a legacy and identity for many Americans. For many Americans, a super-patriot identity has steadily formed around a narrative that glorifies and sanctifies a psychologically satisfying image of a flawless, God-given destiny for Americans. It is an understandably human response to today’s perceived threats to an identity many believe to be their birthright extending from their forebears’ intention in immigration to this country often generations ago. Such a worldview barely acknowledges the presence of other peoples, including the entire experience of Black people and other peoples of color. In the case of “American Indians,” a long history of the development of stereotypical “savages” or “noble redskins” has supported that American story for generations. That evidence reveals a long-term mass denial that underlies the “post-truth” phenomenon. For many of those empowered under the current post-truth policy-making position, a psychological state of mind one scholar refers to as “the rag doll” effect is evident. Like a rag doll, individuals recite a series of themes found in versions of the American Story in their own defense and in their justifications for future policy, thereby obviating the views of others in their own mind and in the minds of those who fall under their influence. It is an exercise in human identity, one which all peoples might be drawn into if they seek the comfort of a self-righteous, morally consistent destiny for themselves and their fellows.

In such a milieu, currently the supposed domain of right-wing apologists, only those that adhere to a right-wing version of the American Story are considered to be legitimate Americans. Thus, policies that recognize those “others” are subordinate to the needs of true Americans, despite the obvious conflicting reasoning involved. Those claiming the identity of “true patriots” in the extreme meaning of this term, remain a minority of American citizens, despite their current apparent empowerment in the post-truth era. Many citizens of the United States – a majority by any measure – do not base their very identity upon this system of denial. For that reason, the opportunity for Native people to participate in the society that surrounds them may sometimes be challenging, yet it survives in the policies enacted years ago.

The Intratribal Sphere of indigenous communications – Indian Country journalism

Because of federal policies and the on-going development of Indian self-determination, tribes’ internal communications systems would seem to be shielded somewhat from the current post-truth environment that dominates the mass media elsewhere. The long list of tribal news media is

substantial, indicating the importance Native people see in communications devices that serve their interests. In 2007, the Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development reported that there were “more than 600 tribal newspapers, approximately 40 tribal radio stations and a growing number of television programs created by and for Indian communities.” The economics of huge corporate media organizations has not yet heavily penetrated many rural systems yet and the unique conditions of internal sovereignty and the economics of tribal organizations have created a funding process for tribally-controlled media that already relies heavily upon government funding, in this case, tribal government funding, with all the issues that relationship implies for freedom of the press. It is important to consider the limitations in that arrangement in the ability for tribal media to counter fake news and other aspects of the post-truth environment, of course, but for the immediate future, it appears tribal communications have an opportunity to develop some very effective responses.

For the purposes of this paper, it is important to note that the basis of tribal communications policies within federally recognized tribal lands were codified in some tribal constitutions in the 1930’s and later that seem to have been intended to mirror the U. S. Constitution’s provisions of the First Amendment. In 1968, the federal Indian Civil Rights Act (ICRA) was enacted unilaterally by Congress to reinforce tribal constitutional provisions where tribes had made them a part of those constitutions and mandated them where they were not already codified for other tribes, with these words

“No Indian tribe in exercising powers of self-government shall—
make or enforce any law prohibiting the free exercise of religion, or abridging the freedom of speech, or of the press, or the right of the people peaceably to assemble and to petition for a redress of grievances…”

This short portion of the ICRA, then, seems to assure that tribal publications have the same protections as other media in the U.S. One can check tribal arrangements for specific tribes to assess how well a tribe’s media policies protect its members’ rights to know and to participate in their tribal government. The fact that tribes are not subject to many of the same precedents that have defined freedom of the press in the mass society of the U.S. makes it difficult to make generalizations about the status of free press provisions that might be helpful in dealing with the rising tide of post-truth politics have created a gap in public understanding of the nuances of tribal sovereignty and the long history that has led to the development of tribal self-determination policies in the U.S. since the 1960’s.


When most tribes adopted the constitutional form of governance, then, they often enshrined a formal communications system based upon, but not entirely restricted to, the now-celebrated First Amendment model of the U.S. Each tribal nation has been reserved the power and right to develop its own definitions and limitations, its own case law, on the free press that is mandated in the Indians Civil Rights Act of 1968 and its own tribal constitution and statutes, though those were to be approved by U.S. officials of the Interior Department. Consequently, scholars and journalists have developed the communications system in Indian country within the framework of tribal sovereignty, each publication or broadcast medium has had to pioneer its own relationship with tribal governments and powerful entities in the attempt to provide the accurate, accountable information so necessary for the People of tribal nations to participate meaningfully in their own governance. It has been a rocky road in many communities, but over the years since the Self-Determination policy of the 1970’s, some important accomplishments have been reached in that internal struggle over free press issues by a number of tribal nations. In the emerging post-truth era, which coincides with the decline of the long-standing business model for the free press in the US, Native peoples are in an unusual position to in their own developments in the policy arena they face, dominated as it is by the federal-tribal relationship and the difficult economic conditions many tribes face.

Media intended to serve the needs of today’s Native people are and have been economically stressed for many years. Depressed economic conditions have restricted one of the main sources of revenues for news organs of the mass media operating beyond tribal borders. Market forces, especially corporate economies of scale in media, have not been kind to media designed for smaller communities like tribal ones. Advertising revenue has been an especially scarce source of funds for tribal publications, so tribal government funds have filled the void in many cases. In those cases, tribal publications were until recently considered “in house” publications, expected to operate under the direction of tribal officials. While that relationship with tribal government was sometimes the only option available, many tribes, especially larger ones, have created legal protections for their tribal news staff so that they can assume the sometimes-adversarial relationship with government that seems necessary for the tribe’s citizenry to gain the information so crucial to their rights to control their own democratically authorized government.

The Cherokee Nation’s development of free press provisions is especially instructive. In a time of constitutional emergency in 2000, the nation enacted a law intended to make tribal government more transparent in its actions on behalf of the Cherokee people. In passing the Independent Press Act of 2000, the law restated a commitment to the Indian Civil Rights Act of 1968 for press freedom and shielded its news editor from influence by tribal officials. Section 4 of the law states

The Cherokee Nation’s Press shall be independent from any undue influence and free of any particular political interest. It is the duty of the press to report without bias the activities of the government and the news of interest to have informed citizens.

In 2005, the National Congress of American Indians was passed a resolution affirming the Cherokee Independent Press Act of 2000 as a model for all tribal nations for free press legislation.\(^4\) The NCAI resolution reveals that the sympathy for a free press in tribal affairs remains strong, despite the sometimes-testy relationship tribal leaders have had with their own tribal newspapers. It is a hopeful sign that tribal governments in the 567 federally recognized tribal entities\(^5\) continue their efforts to legally define what freedom of the press means in each community.

Most tribal publications, intended mostly to inform local communities of the actions of tribal government and cultural and social events in the area, including reservations, have been funded by a combination of tribal government funds, some advertising revenues and in a few cases, subscriptions. In most cases, tribal newspapers are owned by the tribal government, sometimes with shield laws that create a barrier between the publication’s editorial and news-gathering priorities and the influence of tribal officials. That fact has created some space for tribal publications to exercise at least some of the aspects of free press policies, though many journalists in Indian country still bemoan the fact that Native journalists have been occasionally been fired, publications have sometimes faced disciplinary funding delays from tribal councils and access to tribal information sources has sometimes been reduced when tribal news staff have offended tribal officials.\(^6\) The struggle for a free press in Indian country by Native journalists themselves continues.

For some tribes, isolated and rural in character, the current dangers to their internal self-government posed by the post-truth era of U.S. politics must seem a distant reality. For all tribes, though, the current presidential administration’s proposed budget is of great concern. As one national publication, the News From Indian Country reported in its March, 2018 edition, that budget has the potential to impose real harm to indigenous communities in the U.S.\(^7\) Major cuts proposed by the Trump administration in the budget for the Bureau of Indian Affairs include 37% reduction in Social Services, a 27% cut for the implementation of the Indian Child Welfare Act, 18% reduction in Welfare Assistance, 37% cut in Rights Protection Implementation and 35% cut to Job Placement and Training.\(^8\) In their relationship with the federal government, then, the 567

---


\(^8\) Ibid.
tribal entities need to be well informed about their interests in an era where post-truth may mean an era of neglect of the federal trust responsibility for Native nations is eminent. Nonetheless, if one factors in the struggles tribal people have taken on in the Self-Determination era since the 1970’s the survival of such media as tribal newspapers, Native independent films, tribal radio and internet sites that cover issues affecting Native peoples in policy realms, one can be hopeful that tribes can maintain the levels of the free press that are appropriate for them.

The struggle for the free press ideals many hope for in tribal affairs, then, is an on-going one, fought by individual tribal newspaper editors and reporters daily. Nonetheless, tribal governments have often found other avenues than publicly available newspapers to communicate with their citizens. In the case of the Oneida Nation in Wisconsin, for example, the tribal website includes a “members only” selection that links members to key documents and announcements so members can exercise their sovereignty knowledgeably. In this specific case, then, the Oneidas an open records approach that allows direct access for members, thereby replacing one free press measure with an alternative information conduit. Since this tribe’s government includes a general tribal council of tribal members over 18 years of age which reviews the actions of its business committee, some hope that the evolution of tribal government will provide the needed checks and balances on the daily actions of tribal governance.

To really document the current internal communications conditions in the post truth era across today’s Native indigenous communities, one would have to evaluate individual tribal situations. For now, one can hope that current federal policy developments and budget actions, deeply flawed in the past by inaccurate assumptions that come from generations of mis-portrayal of Native peoples and their concerns, can be countered by such groups as the National Congress of American Indians and other groups and individuals who have influence in federal policy.

The Intertribal and Interethnic Spheres of Native American Indigenous Communications: Some Small, but Significant Developments in the Post Truth Era

The intertribal sphere of communications exists where tribal organizations have found ways to create alliances around their common policy interests, or where individual Native journalists have focused their efforts on coverage of the policy concerns that affect many tribes or even off-reservation Indian people. In these spheres, journalists provide their services to people involved in shared values and policy concerns that affect indigenous peoples of many tribes. The intertribal sphere often overlaps to a great degree with the interethnic sphere of indigenous communications, where Native journalists participate in mass society’s news organizations, like urban newspapers, or as special sections of print and online publications as in the High Country News’ newly created “Indian Affairs” section.49 News from Indian Country, a publication with national impetus, could also be of great value in challenging “fake news” about Native people and the issues they face. Its strategy of including new media, like online video/TV, has proven especially appealing for internet users.50

---

50 News from Indian Country, Paul DeMain, publisher and CEO. http://www.indiancountrynews.com/, accessed 3.27.18.
Many, if not most, intertribally targeted Native publications also delve significantly into the interethnic sphere of communications, where the civil rights of indigenous people are part and parcel of the larger rights of all citizens in the mass society. In the interethnic sphere, the arena where Native journalists and scholars aim to communicate across the mass media, Native journalists often hope to contribute to the larger public’s understanding of and sensitivity for indigenous peoples and the issues they face. Of course, Native journalists who work within the mass media intended for national audiences also contribute to the diversity of viewpoints mass media publications can offer their readers.

The communications initiatives of the National Congress of American Indians and a number of other regional and nation-wide organizations operate in both the intertribal and interethnic spheres, developing their own communications networks to gain mandates for their publicly-announced nation-wide policy resolutions. But the struggles for a free press that serves the needs of today’s Native peoples in the U.S. and could be of great value in fending off the impacts of the post-truth media environment can be sampled by the experience of a of case study, which is provided by a very recent example of one Native newspaper which serves the nationwide audience of indigenous people and the many others who have great interest in Native issues today.

**Indian Country Today: the on-going struggle of the free press in intertribal news**

In the past year, one of the most recognizable of all Native commercial publications, the award-winning Indian Country Today, survived a near-death experience when it was announced it would cease publication in September, 2017. Its publisher, Ray Halbritter, CEO of the Oneida Nation in New York, wrote that it would take a hiatus from publishing to “seek an alternative business model.” Halbritter blamed the internet for making its existing model, based upon advertising revenues and contributions and subscriptions from readers and organizations, unprofitable.

The ICT, as it is sometimes designated, has quite a history, one briefly documented by the publication’s founder, Tim Giago, in a 2011 article that critiqued the paper’s operations long after Giago sold the paper to Halbritter in 1998. In his critique, Giago accused Halbritter, CEO and publisher if the ICT, of censoring letters and articles from the ICT that were critical of Halbritter or of his role as publisher. Giago founded the publication as the Lakota Times in 1981, dedicating it to the principles of the free press in Indian country and eventually sold the publication to the Oneida Nation in New York, where Halbritter is Oneida Nation Representative and Nation Enterprises CEO. Giago still supported the publication in its move in 2011 to become a “magazine,” but voiced his opposition to what he saw as a censored publication. Giago is credited as the founder of the Native American Journalists Association and continues his work in journalism with the Native Sun News. Thus, the story of the ICT’s development into a national

---

publication for Native people demonstrates the on-going controversies that maintaining a free press in Indian country generate.

Despite its hiatus, though, the Indian Country Today is not dead. The National Congress of American Indians announce on February 28, 2018 that it would take over the publication of the ICT, and named well-known Shoshone-Bannock journalist, Mark Trahant as its editor. Trahant, whose impressive credentials in Native journalism were outlined in the NCAI announcement, had worked with Halbritter to make the move happen. His personal dedication to the principles of the free press in Indian country are clearly stated in the announcement:

“Even though ink has been replaced by pixels, the task remains the same – to publish an informative daily account that’s comprehensive and adds context to the stories missing from the mainstream media,” Trahant said. “We have so many stories to tell. Our mission is simple but important: Solid, factual reporting. Great writing. Photography that inspires and records. Provide a real service to readers across Indian Country’s digital landscape.”

In that NCAI announcement, the organization’s CEO says that the online publication “plans to share content to tribal newspapers, radio stations and websites at no cost with proper credit attributions.” So a major crisis in the publication of national Native American news appears to have been averted and the ICT seems to have survived in a new form, funded by an intertribal organization’s revenues, at least for now. It seems to have escaped what McChesney and Nichols have documented as a dangerous oligarchical economic environment dominated by corporate media, as described earlier in this article.

NCAI’s continued commitment to the survival of an independent press in Indian country is also demonstrated in its occasional partnership with the Native American Journalists Association. NAJA plays an ever more important role in the post-truth crisis as is documented in this paper. Indigenous scholars and other scholars who support tribal self-determination, trained as they are in Tribal Colleges and Universities and in the many other institutions of higher education across the country, have a vital role to play in reflecting factual, accurate information in this time of crisis as well, as they attempt to convey indigenous viewpoints into the mass society and into the public policy realm. According to their mission statement

NAJA recognizes Native Americans as distinct peoples based on tradition and culture. In this spirit, NAJA educates and unifies its membership through journalism programs that promote diversity and defends challenges to free press, speech and expression. NAJA is committed to increasing the representation of Native journalists in mainstream media. NAJA encourages

---


55 Jacqueline Pata, NCAI Executive Director, Ibid.

both mainstream and tribal media to attain the highest standards of professionalism, ethics and responsibility.57

Their individual and coordinated efforts with organizations like NCAI have helped establish some important bulwarks against the dangers of a post-truth, fake news attack on Native American tribal continuance.

The UN and the Declaration of the Rights of Indigenous People – another bulwark against post-truth attacks on indigenous peoples and their rights

Because so many Native American people in the U.S. now live outside reservations and federally-recognized land areas, concerns of off-reservation Indian people as individuals, including their civil rights under state and federal laws and policies are also a large audience for communications in this sphere. The intertribal and interethnic spheres are dynamic communications spheres which have seen a number of notable developments in Native media over the years. In terms of the post-truth communications era that has resulted from a combination of fake news, oligarchical corporate economics and the now-common misinformation campaigns in U.S. politics, these developments should be evaluated, at least partly, for their fidelity to the goals of Native self-determination and inclusion in the politics of the surrounding society, as the United Nations Declaration of the Rights of Indigenous People has stated them.58

The UNDRIP has set some vital goals and limitations for the recognition and protection of the rights of indigenous peoples based upon a rather long historical development of international human rights standards. They are aspirational minimum standards, which reflect some of the greatest concerns of indigenous peoples around the world. Of course, the United Nations is itself a controversial organization, especially in light of the current right-wing politics that have developed as an international movement as this paper is written. While some might decry a perceived undermining of U.S. sovereignty in the actions of the U.N., the emergence of the Declaration of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples has gained widespread support from groups like the National Congress of American Indians and many tribal governments. A number of highly-regarded indigenous scholars and political leaders from the U.S. were instrumental in its development, along with indigenous people and their supporters from around the world.

Some key provisions of the UNDRIP reflect and impact the communications systems of Native American people, both as members of their tribal nations and as individuals within the overall society of the U.S. and in other nation states. Those provisions of UNDRIP are likely to be useful standards as elements of post-truth communications dynamics continue their rapid expansion into U.S. Indian policy. Two of those are of interest for this paper, dealing as it does with “post-truth” and indigenous rights to a free press that expressed their own interests. Article 15.2 includes one important provision against the kind of attack that might occur in the post-truth environment of communications in the near future

2. States shall take effective measures, in consultation and cooperation with the indigenous peoples concerned, to combat prejudice and eliminate discrimination and to promote tolerance, understanding and good relations among indigenous peoples and all other segments of society."

While it is not clear how the U.S. might exercise its trust responsibility to protect tribes from attacks from those who oppose their continued survival as sovereign peoples, this provision may help give some support for Native people who come under attack simply because right-wing political agendas may evolve to oppose tribal sovereignty directly.

Another key provision of the UNDRIP is Article 16, which states that “Indigenous peoples have the right to establish their own media in their own languages and to have access to all forms of non-indigenous media without discrimination.” In this provision, tribes are encouraged to maintain their own voices in the media, a key right for all peoples, it would seem. In the post-truth era, even this right seems threatened, given the supposed right of others to use misinformation campaigns to subvert long-standing treaty and legal relationships that tribes in the U.S. rely upon. One can hope that these provisions are so much a heritage of all citizens of the U.S., including Native peoples, that they will never have to be called into a future debate about the rights of tribal nations in the U.S.

**Indigenous Scholarship and Journalism in the Post-Truth Era**

Indigenous scholars play a vital role in the development of communications and education in the movement of indigenous sovereignty and cultural survival. In concert with indigenous journalists and with those willing to support the efforts of intercultural communications, Native scholars and their fellow cooperating non-Indian scholars provide not only the kinds of data and information crucial for policy developments across the indigenous U.S., but also offer a nuanced viewpoint that is sometimes difficult for other scholars to comprehend. Unfortunately, in the present atmosphere of fake news, the two perspectives have not fared well in confronting the post-truth juggernaut, according to Kalev Leetaru, a highly respected internet developer and a senior fellow at the George Washington University’s Edmund A. Walsh School of Foreign Service. He has found that online scholarly journals have become particularly vulnerable to a kind of corruption of their mission as they seek funding from those submitting articles for review. Thus, scholars, who may themselves be phony sources, can buy their way to publication. Poorly substantiated research that is being published online, he says, may well be cited by journalists without proper fact-checking, contributing to the atmosphere of fake news. It is a serious problem that strikes at the very heart of scholarship’s high standards. Scholars, too, have a very threatened position in the information and education process as a result.

---

59 Ibid.

As the peer-review editor of the online Indigenous Policy Journal for the past two years, ending April, 2018, the writer of this article has had the good fortune to be involved directly in the processes leading to publication of important articles pertaining to Indigenous policy around the globe. I have been busy receiving submitted articles, scanning them for appropriateness to the IPJ mission, then finding appropriate reviewers from a substantial list of eminent academic and organization scholars. Once articles are reviewed, they are usually returned to authors for revisions, if they are not rejected by reviewers. Then, the final versions of these articles are published online twice a year, Winter and Summer. In addition to the peer reviewed scholarly articles that pass through this process, an impressive number of research notes, other articles, announcements and news is published as well, giving the IPJ a dual purpose of publishing cutting-edge research and providing timely, vital information.

The IPJ fills an important niche in the scholarly journals, many of which have an even longer history of publication. Journals like the Wicasa Sa, the American Indian Culture and Research Journal, the American Indian Quarterly, the Journal of American Indian Education and a number of others have provided a focused platform for the study of indigenous history, culture and political issues. The Indigenous Policy Journal, with the United Nations Declaration of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples as a stated guiding document, maintains a focus upon policy development. That means that policies formulated for indigenous peoples by the other governments that surround them and their own governing bodies are the journal’s domain. In the two years this author has been peer-review editor of the journal, articles have been submitted online from around the world, featuring policy issues facing indigenous peoples from North and South America, Australia, New Zealand, and Nepal. Authors writing about the Sami peoples of Scandinavia and indigenous peoples of India have inquired about how to submit their work. The opportunity for global discussions based upon these scholarly articles is an exciting development in indigenous communications. As I complete my two-year commitment as the peer-review editor, I hope to continue my association with the publication as a former editor, contributing to the success of future editors and, perhaps, submitting articles like this one for publication. I sincerely hope that the IPJ can remain a beacon of truth in the post-truth era!

There are ominous forces at work in the scholarly world that appear to work for the post-truth political and economic agenda. For indigenous and other scholars, for instance, the attack on the funding of public and university libraries and the efforts to skew their mission toward authoritarian, right-wing goals should be of great concern. The current efforts to marginalize state institutions of higher education and reduce the value of the “liberal arts” should awaken us to a new sense of urgency. The diminishing commitment to diversity in areas of race and ethnicity and the very idea of civil discourse about civil and cultural rights of minorities should jar scholars of all disciplines. For Native American and Indigenous Studies programs in higher education everywhere, the proposed federal policies of privatization and commercialization of much of the education system of the U.S. seems ominous indeed. Private funding for higher education from powerful economic interests that skews the mission of the free and open “marketplace” of ideas on campus and the renewed presence on campuses of thinly veiled hate-speech should remind us of the breakdown of public debate principles so vital to the mission of higher education in general. The threats to the right to even seek the truth is not a passing social fad. It is a real and present danger to our shared

human need to fulfill our purposes on this planet. With great good luck, rational and respectful principles in intercultural and political discussions can be revitalized, if scholarly organizations use their influence to publicize their support for those values.

**Climate Change Denial: A Key Issue in the Post-Truth Era**

Perhaps the best illustration of the dangers of the current post-truth communications campaign is the attack on the earth itself. That attack is of immediate concern for many tribal nations which remain in both spiritual and economic relationships with their homelands. Despite clear evidence produced by scholars in the sciences of climatology and life sciences in general and journalism that shows the impacts of on-going pollution and human-caused degradation of the environment, the current efforts to end almost all regulations and even efforts to find solutions to the problems are now under attack by the right-wing climate-change deniers. Amazingly, the post-truth vision of reality is one that simply denies the human reliance upon the planet that sustains life. Only economic values are considered in this strange, anti-life viewpoint.

Some have said that journalism documents events and advocates for the rights of the people, sometimes against the powerful officials and forces of society that endanger the civil rights and needs of the People they serve. Scholarship, in its broadest sense, is often thought of as the effort to provide information and ideas among those most involved in the highest levels of study about all aspects of the human experience, from “hard” sciences to the social sciences to the arts and literature. In both journalism and scholarship, truth is the primary means of finding the proper, ethical relationships that humans must attain, both among themselves and from the indigenous perspective, with the cosmos as well. In the post-truth era of communications, the obvious shared mission today seems overwhelming. Concerted efforts between scholars and journalists, especially in indigenous affairs, is crucial to the survival of the democratic societies much of humanity has staked its survival upon. As the post-truth, fake news campaign of extreme the right-wing continues, most notably in internet communications where rumors and intentionally targeted campaigns have become common, truth-seekers in both fields must redecommit themselves to the sometimes-perilous search for the truth in an emotionally laden, complex communications environment where seemingly irreconcilable differences are the order of the day. Preparing ourselves as truth-seekers for the on-going fray over “truth claims” so that we are not simply annihilated by those most in denial would seem to be among our highest priorities. So – how can we unite in the fight for truth and accuracy, for the widespread acceptance of the great value of diverse opinions and tolerance in an atmosphere that seems so bent upon the values of autocracy? It is a conversation between key professions that ought to begin here and now, journalist and scholar.

**Conclusion: What Would Vine Say? The Post-Truth environment and the Duty of Scholars and Journalists to find Wisdom**

The experiential background of Native people involved in media is often quite distinct from other Americans. The goals of tribal self-determination and cultural continuance for Native peoples can only be served well by a strong cadre of Native and other scholars who are dedicated to research, writing and publishing in support of those goals. The common ground shared by indigenous journalism and scholarship in indigenous studies seems to mandate a greater awareness
of and cooperation between the two professions. Ideally, they both make their work available to each other and to the reading, viewing and internet-using public and, especially, to those most interested in the well-being of indigenous peoples. Vine Deloria, Jr.’s legacy as a scholar sets a very high bar for today’s scholars in indigenous studies and for journalists who hope to assure accurate, corrective information in support of the self-confidence of today’s indigenous peoples and in challenging the widespread misinformation and ignorance about Native people and their rights.

Vine offered many ideas that can be of value in this time of crisis. I find two of them especially powerful and elegant in their simplicity. First, Vine is often quoted as saying, “Every society needs educated people, but the primary responsibility of educated people is to bring wisdom back into the community and make it available to others so that the lives they are leading make sense.” The quote needs little explanation, since the challenge today is to actually approach a sense of wisdom, not just to accumulate data. It seems only actual wisdom can really overcome the post-truth juggernaut that has arisen among us. Can we bring that reliance upon wisdom back to our indigenous communities and to the fractured society that seems bent on autocracy and consuming the planet’s resources without any sense of balance?

The other idea that Vine offered that I have selected for this moment in our human experience is also straightforward but requires scholars to face the complexity of our current crisis with a sense of humility. In Vine’s luncheon address at the WSSA Conference in 2002, mentioned in my prologue for this paper, Vine suggested that teams of scholars might “commit themselves to explore an idea over a period of years. Hopefully, it would be a radical and contemporary idea, something of interest and importance to ordinary people.” He went on to say that several scholars might “commit themselves to come to WSSA over a period of time producing some kind of collaborative effort that could be published on a particular topic.” That strategy might lead not only to expanding one’s scholarly career, but would also be “...taking a step in bringing academia closer to the man in the street by dealing with topics relevant to our social needs.” When scholars can lay aside their individual scholarly goals, let their guards down a bit and really focus in a collaborative project such as Vine suggests, perhaps wisdom can arise from shared efforts that can really meet the immediate challenges we face. In the opinion of this author, dealing assertively with the structures and human causes behind the “post-truth” phenomenon ought to be among our first collaborations. Perhaps some Native journalists could collaborate with Native journalists in such an endeavor! Perhaps solving the interpersonal, human problems surrounding post-truth will allow us to turn to the extremely pressing problem of the improving the human relationship with the earth.

LEARNING IN THE CIRCLE: APPLYING AMERICAN INDIAN WAYS TO IMPROVING EDUCATION IN CONTEMPORARY MAINSTREAM AMERICA

Stephen M. Sachs

Section 1: Introduction: The Educational Needs of a Participatory Society And The Problems of Mainstream Education

Education is crucial in any society, all the more so in a democracy. It provides the cultural basis for living well, including for decent social interaction, with a proper politics and a well working economy. Education is more than formal education. It begins with child rearing and extends throughout life. Indeed, one can say that life is education. But in a post-modern society, formal education is extremely important.

Mainstream education in the United States has been in turmoil for many years, and clearly has not been serving many of its students well, though there have long been some excellent examples of broadly successful education in the U.S. that are quite consistent with American Indian ways and values. The problems begin with the fact that too much of U.S. mainstream schooling teaches all students the same way, failing to understand that each person is unique and that different persons learn differently, with different learning styles requiring different teaching methods. Indeed the mainstream approach has often been to treat students primarily as empty receptacles in to which must be poured cultural values, information and techniques. There has been an emphasis upon rote memorization, with insufficient opportunities for active creativity, participation in learning, and development of deep thoughtfulness, understanding and critical thinking. Along these lines, critics have complained that American education is too often overly concerned with control - rather than growth of the person. It is hierarchical, bureaucratic and based upon "right answers" as presented by the teacher and the text. Students regularly do not have the opportunity to question the correctness of assertions. Thus, even if a teacher's assertion is correct, students do not have the opportunity to understand what is involved, and thus why, and how it is correct, and what the real meaning is. This most often is necessary to apply knowledge appropriately. Teaching this way creates a separation between book learning (or the classroom) and the world. Similarly, there are complaints that mainstream education tends to be overly competitive in arriving at the "right answer." This undercuts cooperation that leads to better understanding and deeper learning, as well as fostering caring and more supportive human relations.

To put in other terms, most mainstream education fails to assist in the development of the whole person: Following a general trend in western society, which has been slowly changing for over 100 years, there has been a tendency for schools to stress intellect over intuition, sensing and feeling, with focus on basic knowledge and skills in English, mathematics and history, plus some science, and, with some notable exceptions, at the expense of the arts. Teaching has tended to focus on the left brain over the right, when human beings are whole brained, and many are right brain dominant. The combination of the above tendencies has made school boring for some brighter students, difficult and tedious for many, contributing to low achievement and high drop out rates.
Related to the problem of hierarchy, there have been continual complaints that funding for, and the quality of education, are often unequal in the United States, with lower economic and less favored groups having worse educational opportunity. In a nation that claims to foster equality of opportunity, this contributing to higher drop out rates and lower achievement for young people in those groups. Indeed, conditions in some low income minority schools have been reported as appalling.

Moreover, the top down passive learning approach is inconsistent with the needs of representative democracy in the United States, much less what is required for a fully participatory society. The initiators of the public school system, though urging it in terms of democracy, established it primarily in terms of the factory assembly line, and the perceived needs of business, did not think of the public school as a self governing community of free men. Teaching remained in their thought as an act of indoctrination by authority, learning a submission in the correct, the desirable ancient "liberal arts."

A major problem with this was pointed out by Harold Rugg,

Instead of constituting an informed thinking citizenry, cognizant of public questions and critically observant of the acts of their elected representatives, the youths turned out from our schools are merely fit subjects for systematic propaganda.

All of these problems became worse in the early Twenty-First Century. By then there was an increasing focus on just teaching the basics of reading and arithmetic, increased with the enactment of the No Child Left Behind Act, with a heavy emphasis on multiple choice exam testing, forcing many teachers to teach the tests rather than students needs. An ongoing move in many places to privatize education through the establishment of charter schools, has been reducing the resources and conditions at many public schools. The great recession and the privatization movement cut education as well as other budgets. All of this contributed to cutting back on creative activity such as the arts, while civics and practical life skills and knowledge have become rarely taught. Further, even in the best conventional schools and among students who obtain good grades there have been serious stress related problems have been reported from the pressures to do well in a narrowly focused system of “learning.” This led one school district superintendent to call for a holistic, “whole child” approach to schooling that respects “social-emotional development” and “deep and meaningful learning” over academics alone.

In addition, the tendency of traditional western thought to focus one at a time on narrow concerns, in a reductionist thinking, fragments knowledge and understanding, at the higher education level, shattering universities into multiversities of too often disconnected disciplines. The development of the computer and the internet have achieved a small part of their capacity to connect people and fields of knowledge. The larger result has been further fragmentation moving the intellectual focus of too many people away from knowledge, to information, rather than to wisdom, of which first information and next knowledge should be building blocks. All of this has been met by resistance, adding to a variety of already existing movements for education reform,
and alternative approaches to education, some of which have Native American roots, as is
developed below.

Learning from Indigenous Education

American Indian, and more broadly, Indigenous, approaches to education from upbringing
through life provide a far better basis for the development of people from birth to death, both in
existing U.S. semi-democratic society and in a fully participatory nation. American Indians begin
with respect for the spirit of each person. Each child, is unique, and is born with the potential of
positive qualities that parents, grand parents, and other adults in the community need to facilitate
developing well in the child's own terms. The ultimate aim is empowering the child to become
who s/he uniquely is, with good character, as a fine member of family and society. Upbringing and
education are not centered on control, but rather aim to free the person to become his/her best, both
within and in a social context. To achieve this, guidance must also be provided to protect the child
from physical, psychological and spiritual dangers, and from falling into negative ways.\footnote{5}

Each person is understood to be multi-dimensional, with many aspects to develop in
coming to understand and function well in a complex world. Since each person is born in but one
place in the circle of life, with its own way of seeing, to live well one must do what one can to
come to understand all the places: all the view points on life in general, and on any question in
particular. When this holistic approach to life and issues is achieved, the result is a much more
inclusive, comprehensive and nuanced understanding than is normally achieved in standard
western thinking. Indeed, traditional Indian thinking and decision making functions at a much
higher level of complexity, than does most mainstream western thinking and deciding, because the
Indigenous approach is to include all the related factors over time, and all the interests and concerns
involved in any situation or issue.\footnote{6}

This requires a holistic process of learning in which the teacher is primarily a guide and
facilitator, guiding the student in learning, while providing protection from dangers of various
kinds. This is primarily an experiential process. While some information needs to be provided and
learned by memory, most learning takes place participatively, by doing. Over all, this engages the
whole brain as the learning process extends to all realms of activity from the physical to the
spiritual, which traditionally are viewed as interconnected aspects of the whole of life. It also
involves all the ways humans perceive and process information (in Jungian terms, through
intellect, feeling, intuition and sensing). Achievement in the process of doing tends to be self-
rewarding, but traditionally, progress is praised. This is especially so for major achievements. The
Lakota, for example, like a great many tribes, would hold a feast in honor of a young boy who had
achieved his first kill in a hunt, with giveaway in his name to less well off people in the village.
This would often include his sharing some of the game he had brought in, as well as his father
giving away a horse. In addition, there were rights of passage, ending with ceremonies, marking
the attainment of a young person to the next stage in life. Some of these are still enacted, such as
the Apache puberty ritual for a girl becoming a woman.\footnote{7}

Honoring, and preserving honor, out of respect, were very important. If someone, including
a young person, did something improper, the first step was not to admonish them, but to engage
them with a question, usually so they could see the error for themselves, or explain themselves
without being accused if the perception of their being in error was incorrect. Thus, the dignity of the person was preserved. For example, at evening song practices outdoors on the Southern Ute Reservation a fire was usually lit as the evening became cool. Author Stephen Sachs was present at an early practice when two young people started a fire when it was still warm. An elder asked, "Why did you start that fire?"

Similarly, if it was thought that some one was engaged in improper behavior, a story might be told illustrating that such behavior was wrong. Indeed, telling of stories was an important way of teaching, particularly of moral values, as well as of history and passing on important information. In oral societies, the repeated telling of tales, joining in singing songs and attending and playing a role in dances and rituals, provided essential learning - memorizing from experience - through observing and doing. Since the learning was in the context of its application, how to apply knowledge was abundantly clear, if indirect methods of correction - leading a person to correct themselves - were not effective, then more direct admonishment would take place, and after that, if needed, punishment.

Being a careful observer was a value that was taught. This developed good perception of the environment and ongoing events, as well as enhancing the development of self, and - along with achievement through learning by doing - self-confidence. Since observation was stressed, and achievement and living according to the major values was honored, those who achieved and lived admirably - elders (who were not just older, but lived admirably) were highly respected role models. Elders did supplement participatory learning and teaching through storytelling at appropriate moments; by exhorting people to act properly; and pointing out when something needed to be done. As, for example, author Stephen Sachs often experienced elders exhorting dancers and the people to act in a good way between the rounds or songs of Lakota and Ute Sun Dances, and if someone fell or had difficulty, elders would call out "help her".

One aspect of this in Native societies, where honor and shame were important, is that public opinion was a very important director and restrainer of behavior. Moreover, since everyone in a community was considered related, with responsibilities to everyone else (and everyone to them), the whole community, and particularly all adults, played a role in guiding a child, and overseeing their behavior. This is something that has been considerably reduced in the fragmentation of life in much of the contemporary United States, but would be likely to take place in a highly participatory community with close interrelationships.

Because young people observed, and as they became old enough, participated in all aspects of life, over time they learned the ways of the community. This included learning inclusive participatory decision making through regularly observing it and then taking part in it. Overall, the duel emphasis on the individual, being one's own person, while identifying with the community and caring for everyone in it, tended to develop people as strong individuals standing up for their own principles and perceptions, whose values and behavior were communal. Thus as good citizens in a participatory society, they said what they thought in public discussions, with a focus on what was good for the community and its members.

Child Rearing in a Participatory Society
The basic principles of Indigenous education and human development are applicable to contemporary society, and for building participatory relations, if adjustments are made for differences in culture and the developing conditions of current life. In bringing up children, parents, and other guides and teachers, need to relate with a child appropriately for her or his stage of development. This can be undertaken, for example, following Erick Erikson's theory of stages of human child development, completed in the 1950s, from observing Oglala Lakota and Yurok child rearing practices, or consistent with Piaget's independently formulated stages of human development. In general children need to be treated respectfully, and lovingly, emphasizing positive rewards in the course of encouraging them to develop all their faculties, according to their own individual nature, while socializing them to be family and later community members, interacting well with others. Compassionate correction is necessary. When the child is old enough, this can be undertaken first through engagement, to determine his or her state of mind and perceptions, while empowering the young person to think for her/his self what is right. If that is not enough, then direct instruction with explanation to develop the child's understanding likely is necessary. Appropriate punishment, when warranted, should be the last option. All of this needs to be clear and consistent.

Generally, the child needs to be encouraged to develop their observational, intellectual, intuitive, emotional, creative and physical abilities in an enjoyable way, making learning something s/he enjoy and want to do. This needs to be accomplished with as wide a variety of positive experiences for doing so as practical - as fits the child at that time - with protection from what would be harmful to them in general or at their stage of development. Children do need to learn to observe and listen both externally and internally, which in themselves are relatively passive activities. But when the child itself, or with encouragement or guidance, follows up on them, they become experiential and participatory. The extent to which learning can be participatory, generally is, the better.

Also, more and more as the child develops, it is important for his or her stage of development, and relative to who and where s/he is as an individual, to enhance her/his seeing connections, understanding as many aspects of a situation or issue as possible. The child needs to learn to take everything relevant, and the views of everyone concerned, into account. Sometimes it is good to do this interactively in a group, for example asking each child or person how they see or feel about a situation or event. Sometimes it is good to have the child use contemplation, such as, "how would you feel if you were in this situation," or "if you were an electron in an atom with the following properties. how would you behave." Some learning has to come through instruction, but the more that can be discovered through thought or positive experience, the better. Also, some things, like arithmetic tables need to be memorized, but this can be enjoyable, perhaps as a game. And, as with other things, in the course of learning arithmetic one can learn how and why it functions. Indeed, the more one can go beyond the "what" in learning, to the "how" and "why" - as well as the when in application (which is part of the "why") - the better. This takes the person beyond knowing some relatively isolated information, to knowledge which is practical. It allows him or her to function in the world, while encouraging movement toward wisdom: holistic understanding of how to act and live well.

The upbringing of a child needs to aim at his/her developing into a whole person capable, humbly confident, and happy, as an individual and self directed person, who is also a caring,
competent and humbly confident member of community. The child needs to become accomplished in functioning in a variety of contexts and at various levels. For in the contemporary world, most people interact in a variety of social contexts, and at various levels from friendship and family, though neighborhood and municipality to nation and the world. There is a need to enhance the development of the inner person in her or his own terms, to come to know who s/he is, and what his/her values are. While learning and adjusting to new learning, the young person needs to develop the strength to live by those evolving values, and to be confident in what s/he can do. S/he needs to discover his/her limits and have the humility (which is also a strength and kind of confidence) to ask and to learn. At the same time, a person needs to come to be, and enjoy being, a social person - with the values and abilities to be a caring and effective community member.

In a participatory society, this means experiencing participation and learning to participate in a good way. Over time this requires, first caring about others and their views and concerns, being a good accurate and empathetic listener. One needs to hear what others are saying, be able to take it into account, and be supportive of others. This includes making appropriate responses at the right moment, such as "I understand you (whether or not one agrees, which is a different question)." Second, being participatory means having the strength and integrity to express one’s views, at the appropriate moments, to do so clearly, and to do so diplomatically to enhance participation by all in reaching mutual decisions. Thirdly, since in a fully participatory discussion, all are equal and equally concerned participants, everyone needs to learn to be able to help facilitate the dialogue, to suggest redirecting it when the discussion is stuck or off track; to calm it down - and perhaps help mutual understanding - if the discussion gets too heated; and in various ways to help support the process of participatory decision making.

To develop a participatory society it is best if education for participation begins at home, that families are participatory, discussing how they feel about things and deciding together what to do. Children can learn to be good participators, first, by observing it, then by beginning to participate, initially asking how they feel about, something, and as they become more mature having an increasing say in more and more matters. This can be built upon by running schools as democratic communities.

Schools in a Participatory Society

Formal institutions of education play an essential role in all modern and postmodern societies, though they are only a part of life long learning that pervades every moment of living. Doing what is appropriate at each level of schooling, and for each person, following North American Indigenous Principles, what is generally required is child needs centered supportive facilitation, providing protection and guidance to assist the young person's development by inspiring them, and expanding them through as wide a variety of positive experiences as practical. Education, with the proper timing for the individual's development as an effective, caring member of intersecting communities, needs to develop the whole person - in Jung-Myers-Briggs terms - facilitating development of all the ways of perceiving and processing information, to develop knowledge and abilities-skills broadly, aimed at the unfolding of wisdom. This requires depth, as well as breadth, so at the proper times, appropriate for the person, specialized undertakings are necessary, as well as broad scope encompassing the general knowledge and skills to succeed well as an effective citizen, participant in economic life and fellow human being. One needs to learn to
see issues from all sides, and be able to analyze and problem solve well in various fields - having enjoyably gained the basic tools (e.g. reading, writing, math, computer literacy, research ability..., as well as human skills in empathy, communication, collaboration,...). Creativity needs encouragement and opportunity as an art, whether in music, dance, literature, painting... the other creative and performing arts, or in math, science - physical or social - philosophy etc. Education ought not to be considered in a vacuum, but within the context of the interlinking communities in which one lives and needs to become a good citizen participant, from the family, school, various immediate groups; through the neighborhood and municipality, through the state or province; across the region to encompass the Nation and its neighbors and then the world. And indeed, since human beings are part of nature, to encompass our relatives and relationships at every level to include an opportunity to find one's connection with the physical environment, the universe and all there is. Thus education is an inner as well as an outer process of enhanced unfolding.

**Section 2: Examples of American Indian Principles in Contemporary Education:**

**The Putney School**

There are a number of good examples of the principles of Indigenous American education being applied with excellent results in the United States and elsewhere. One of these movements, that of progressive education, has direct American Indian roots, as its founder, John Dewey was part of a tradition of the American philosophy of pragmatism, that developed from interaction of Europeans and later European Americans with Indians, beginning with first contact.¹

John Dewey advocated a progressive education, providing the maximum variety of positive experiences practical in order to develop the full potential and creativity of each young person. Dewey's approach to education was inherently democratic, not only for the best evolvement of each individual, but also as a vehicle for producing the best citizens as a firm base of democratic society. In 1906 Dewey wrote of one of the school systems he had inspired:¹³

Gary Public Schools do not teach civics out of a text book. Pupils learn civics by helping to take care of their own school building, by making rules for their own conduct in the halls and on the play grounds, by going into the public library, and listening to the stories of what Gary is doing as told by the people who are doing it. They learn by a mock campaign, with parties, primaries, booths and ballots for election of their own student council. Pupils who have made the furniture and the cement walks with their own hands, and who know how much it costs, are slow to destroy walks or furniture nor are they going to be very easily fooled as to the value they get in services and improvements when they themselves are tax payers.

A particularly strong application of Dewey's principles for democratic education is the Putney School, a private coeducational high school which has been operating on West Hill above the town of Putney, Vermont since 1936. Putney is a boarding school with day students commuting from their homes in the area.¹⁴ The size of student body has always been limited so that the school could function as a face to face community, with individuated learning and close student-teacher-staff relations. The size of the student body has varied slightly over time. In 1956, when author Stephen Sachs graduated from Putney, there were just over 180 students. In 1992, when Sachs undertook updated research on the school, the number was 153 students, 41 of whom
were day students. In more recent years the student body has expanded slightly, with 215, of whom 45 were day students, in 2014, The student teacher ration was then 5:1, with classes averaging 11 students.

With the assistance of an extensive scholarship program the school has attempted to draw students from as wide a variety of backgrounds as possible. For some years there have been a sufficient number of foreign students, usually around a dozen, so that Putney offers courses in English as a second language. Indeed, diversity has been a core principle of Putney since its beginning, as the school website states,

“To combat prejudices caused by differences in economic, political, racial, and religious backgrounds; to strive for a world outlook, putting oneself in others’ places no matter how far away or how remote.”
-Carmelita Hinton, Fundamental Principles of The Putney School, 1954

The Putney School embraces and encourages awareness, understanding, and appreciation for the expression of diverse experiences. These principles are embedded in the mission and fundamental principles of the school; and we live them in every aspect of school life and programs—in admissions and hiring, in the academic and residential curriculum, and in the moral development and interpersonal relationships of all members of our community.

Putney is committed to educating all members of the community to be active citizens in a multicultural and pluralistic world. This is not a new idea here but a longstanding commitment by the school community. We have three African-American members of the Board of Trustees, all of whom are Putney alumni, and many alumni of color have chosen to send their children here. At Putney, we strive to make all students feel welcomed, comfortable, and included in every aspect of the school culture, and we offer effective support services on campus to affirm and ensure the safety, dignity, and welfare of every individual and group on campus. We support and encourage free expression of a student's own identity in the larger community mix. We offer opportunities for community members to explore cultural differences and commonalities through respectful and civil discussion and reflection in assemblies and presentations as well as through off-campus social events, leadership workshops, and overseas school trips.

The student Diversity Committee and Diversity Committee of the Board ensure that the school promotes diversity through its program and hiring, recognizing that a diverse faculty and staff is crucial to the success of the school and the fullest possible education of its students. Putney was one of the first boarding schools in the Northeast to enroll students of color. Our tradition of active, principled social and political engagement placed the school in the forefront of the drive for social justice in the 1950s, ’60s, and ’70s.

One example of that engagement for social justice that was already taking place on Sachs’ arrival at Putney in 1953 - prior to Brown vs. Board of Education - were between terms integrated
road trips to the segregated south, including examination of the Tennessee Valley Authority (TVA) and a stop at the politically and racially progressive Highlander Folk School. Students who went on the journey noted that when they stopped at segregated gas stations, they would not buy anything unless everyone was permitted to use the "white" restroom - which the gas station owners would usually allow, rather than lose the business. Another of these educational journeys undertaken in collaboration with the Putney School’s close neighbor, the Antioch College graduate education program at Glen Maples, examined conditions and some progressive developments in Porto Rico. A student who had participated in both study tours, and later worked for UNESCO, commented in a Putney Alumni E-mail discussion, in late 2015, in which Stephen Sachs was a participant, commented,

That (Glen Maples) trip was a major contributor to my spending most of my career working to help promote projects in the developing countries.

For me, the two Glen Maples trips (Puerto Rico + TVA) turned out to be more than just flirts with reality; they were real dips into it. Just as Putney itself was very much "learning by doing" and in order to learn to want to DO MORE rather than just passing exams and getting good marks.

That's why Freshman Year at Harvard - with exams and marks galore - drove me to want to take a year off and TRAVEL somewhere by DOING something.

Core Principles

In founding and directing the school until 1955, Carmelita Hinton had many goals which remain central to Putney today. First among them has been developing complete individuals who are conscious citizens of multiple communities. As Mrs. Hinton wrote in a prospectus in 1945.

Underlying these varied aims is the most important aim of all, the one of reaching the inner spirit of the boys and girls, and teaching them to live up to their finest potentialities; we try to have them realize that their attitude towards others is what matters most. Are they interested merely in themselves, adding to their own lives, or are they seeing themselves as part of a community: the school, the town, the United States, the World? Are they going to help pull civilization up or be unmindful of its disintegration? At Putney we are not only discussing these things: we are trying to work them out in our everyday existence.

The Putney website adds,

Fundamental Beliefs

The school's philosophy initiated in 1935 and distilled into eight fundamental beliefs by Putney's founder, progressive educator Carmelita Hinton, reads on the Putney web site as follows:
To work not for marks, badges, honors, but to discover truth and to grow in knowledge of
the universe and in the understanding of men, to treasure the hard stretching of oneself,
to render service.
To learn to appreciate and participate in the creative arts where man gives expression to his
struggle for communication of his inner life and for beauty, and to grant these arts great
prestige.
To believe in manual labor, be glad to do one's share of it and proud of the skills learned in
the doing.
To play just as wholeheartedly as one works, but watching out a bit for the competitive angle,
remembering that play is for recreation and an increased joy in living.
To want to lend a hand to the community at large, not to live in an "ivory tower."
To combat prejudices caused by differences in economic, political, racial, and religious
backgrounds; to strive for a world outlook, putting oneself in others' places, no matter
how far away or how remote.
To have old and young work together in a true comradeship relation, stressing the
community and its need for the cooperation of all.
To wish to live adventurously though not recklessly, willing to take risks, if need be, for
moral growth, so that one definitely progresses along the long slow road toward
achieving a civilization worthy of the name.
- Carmelita Hinton, 1954

Mission Statement

Adopted June 8, 1997

The Putney School stands for a way of life. Putney is committed to developing
each student's full intellectual, artistic and physical potential. Putney students are
encouraged to challenge themselves intellectually, to pursue rigorous learning for its
own sake, to actively participate in and appreciate the arts, to contribute meaningfully
to the work program that sustains the school community and the farm on which it is
located, to engage in vigorous athletics, and to develop a social consciousness and
world view that will provide the foundation for life-long moral and intellectual growth.

The core of the Putney experience is citizenship based upon students being given a wide
variety of opportunities to participate in their own development and in the development of
the community. They can even create many of their own options. But once a choice is made, students
are expected to follow through. The freedom to choose is linked to a duty to participate, for
without concrete development there is no realization of personal potential or practical work.
This principle of positive freedom permeates every aspect of life at Putney, contributing to
making the Putney experience a many-faceted whole. Structurally, it makes sense here to
consider that experience under the topics of community governance, academic program, semi-
academic and other activities, the physical side of life--work and sports, and space for
individual spirit.
The specifics of the Putney system have evolved continually over the years, through an ongoing dialogue about how to develop the school within the context of the experience of doing it. By the 1950s, however, when author Stephen Sachs attended Putney, many of the major outlines of program and structure had become generally settled, so that they are much the same today as they were at that time. The outline of Putney operations set forth here is based upon Sachs experience as a student from 1953-56 and as a very interested alumnus since then who has attempted to keep up with changes in school operations and life.

Community Governance

Putney is above all a participatory community of warm relations based upon mutual respect. The tone is set in informal, concerned relations among faculty, staff, and students. In the Putney culture, faculty and staff are mentors providing friendly help and guidance to students who are full participants in their own development and in the life of the community. Each student is provided with a faculty counselor with whom s/he can discuss concerns and problems, and each new student is welcomed by a student counselor who provides support during the newcomer's first weeks in the community. A week of orientation at which experienced students play a major part in welcoming their new colleagues takes place prior to the opening of school each fall. Relations among students tend to be open, mutually supportive and equalitarian: accepting of each individual for her/his own uniqueness. There are overlapping groups of friends throughout the student body, but rarely (if ever) cliques.

Everyday affairs at Putney are governed by a mostly elected School Council of student, faculty and staff representatives. The Council has evolved over time. The primary change since the 1950s is that the number of students has increased from being a larger group than either faculty or staff to constituting an absolute majority. Voting on the Council, however, has always been on a basis of each individual's view of the issues and never on the basis of one constituency versus another.

The School Council meets regularly in open sessions at which visitors may speak, but not vote. Whenever there is a major issue, prior to the council taking action on the question, it is discussed at the assembly of the whole school, which takes place on several weekday mornings. By the 1990s, community-wide consideration of issues had expanded by the institution of discussions going back and forth between general sessions and small group dialogues facilitated by students in the school's Leadership Program.

The operation of the School Council, with its authority to decide important every day questions with the involvement of the whole community, plays an important role in establishing and maintaining the participatory culture in the community. The head of the school has the power to veto council actions, but at least as of 1960, this power had never been exercised. The head of the school has an extremely important leadership role in community affairs and in setting the general tone of community living, however it is a role of leadership and facilitation, not dominance.

Education in democratic leadership is a core aspect of life at Putney, and is so stated, including on the Putney web site,
Our students do not get taught leadership in a classroom, but rather must practice it and learn it by experience. They run work crews, lead dorms, sit on faculty committees and the Board of Trustees, and debate how to run a community in which individual freedoms must mesh with responsibility to the group. There are nearly fifty leadership positions in which students are responsible for getting work done with other student labor, or in which students are part of the decision-making processes which make the community run. Every student must participate in work that is vital to the school.

Students have opportunities to participate in numerous areas of community decision-making. The elected Student Heads of School set the tone for the school community; upholding the “Fundamental Principles” and the core expectations described in the Student Handbook (integrity, respect, participation and stewardship). They run the student council and lead assemblies.

The Standards Committee, which decides cases of violation of standards of behavior, in the 1950s included three faculty members and two students elected by the community. Nominations of the faculty candidates were made by the faculty while the student nominees were chosen by the community council. More recently the number of students on the committee has been increased as part of the general expansion of student participation in governance. By 1992, the committee consisted of three students elected by the School Council, one faculty or staff member elected by faculty and staff, and one faculty or staff member appointed by the head of the school who served as chairman. When disciplinary cases are heard, which was rare during the three years Sachs attended Putney, the student's counselor is part of the committee, which acts as a counseling body attempting to assist the offender in improving their behavior and attitude. Some punishment is often included in the decision of the committee, with the offender participating in deciding what needs to be done. But punishment is always considered as instrumental for the student's development and never as an end.

Other opportunities for a student governance role include students in each dormitory annually electing a dorm head who serves on the Dormitory Committee, making general policy for dormitories, and working closely with the student/adult dorm heads and the dean of students to help implement and maintain the systems that ensure a safe, fun and educational residential life program. The Work Committee oversees the entire work program and directly manages the student work crew leaders, elected by their work teams. The committee provides a setting in which young adults can further their understanding of the relationships between work, sustainability and community. Each work team in the work job program elects a crew head. The International Ambassadors are a group of domestic and international students dedicated to supporting all new international students during orientation and throughout the year. They help bridge the gap between cultures and provide opportunities for the entire community to benefit from cross-cultural experiences. Particularly important is student input into academic affairs.

Officially in the 1950s, academic matters were decided by a Faculty Academic Committee. Students had (and currently exercise) real influence, however, as they were asked their opinion about such questions as how teaching might be improved and what courses were
offered. By 1992, the committee consisted of the elected student Academic Committee Chairman, five students chosen by the School Council, two members of the Faculty Curriculum Committee and the Academic Dean. As of 2015, the committee was discussing curricular changes, approving courses, and reviewing proposals for project weeks and independent student work.

Two students also are elected to the Board of Directors as full voting members, and serve on some of its committees. They bring their understanding and expertise as current members of the student body to bear on discussions ranging from building plans to investment policy. Admission Committee members help to shape the future of the school by reviewing student applications for the upcoming school year and making admission decisions. These seniors read each applicant’s file, meet with the Admission Committee weekly, publish weekly student blog posts and play a spirited, professional role in sharing the school with prospective families. The Diversity Committee works to educate the school community about the political, social and social justice issues which arise in a pluralistic society, and to support students for whom life in Vermont may be radically outside their previous experience. Day Student Representatives work closely with the Dean of Student’s office to ensure the needs of the day student population are being met. They are also mentors and a vital resource to the day students and their families.

Sustainability is a core Putney principle that is involved in every part of the Putney program, including in academic course work. The community strives to be as environmentally and economically sustainable in all that it does. Its solar powered field house was the first energy neutral school building in the United States. The Sustainability Squad works on projects to improve campus environmental performance, and lead trips off campus to conferences and rallies. Related to that, and the important role of Putneyites being involved with their environment, realizing they are part of nature, The Putney Outdoor Program encompasses afternoon activities, weekend trips, and the longstanding tradition of all-school trips called Long Fall. Most of these are hiking, kayaking, etc. in the woods and countryside, so that students have considerable time, "in nature," in addition to just living, being, and being involved in out door activity on a 1000 acre farm with a great deal of woodland. Two student leaders co-manage the outdoor program with a faculty member, planning and leading trips during the year. In addition, the cabin program is a unique element of the Putney program, demanding a high degree of leadership, responsibility and trust. A few students who are deemed sufficiently responsible can live on their own without an in cabin faculty member in one of several cabins that are completely off the grid, with wood stoves and solar panels. Overall, the Putney the approach to relating with the environment goes beyond the concept of "place based education," which since the 1990s has been used to refer to using local ecosystems and social issues in creating a curriculum. It encompasses seeing the land and what is built upon it as an educational force in itself. Ultimately, as traditional Native people understand, there no separation between oneself and one's environment.

Thus, students have been serving on almost all of the functional committees in the community since at least the 1990s, including the Advisory Council, advising the head of the school, and the Health Committee. Around 1990, a Student Union was formed to organize optional activities that take place on weekends. In 2015, the Student Union was led by the Student Heads of Weekend Activities.
"Academics" are an essential part of what Putney does, but are only one aspect of the curriculum. As is posted on the school web site,

We regard the curriculum as everything we do here, and therefore eschew the word ‘extra-curricular’. The four pillars of the school, vigorous academics, the work program, the arts, and physical activity, all combine and intertwine to create students who understand what it takes to get things done. One of the hallmarks of Putney is our transparency to our students and our willingness to engage them in the running of the school. We allow and often require our students to struggle with the real dilemmas of crafting a community in which rights and responsibilities balance. Much of a student’s life at Putney is experiential education, and they enjoy both independence and responsibility.

The other aspect of our student focus, is our dedication to each individual. We are a small community with a 5:1 student-faculty ratio; there is no “back row” at Putney, and students have unrivalled access to the talented, diverse faculty. Twice a year, students engage in Project Weeks, periods in which students engage in independent, mentored processes of inquiry. By designing and executing these projects, students develop organizational skills, and learn to apply what they have learned.

Every student takes art at least twice a week in the Evening Arts program, which offers everything from Afro-Cuban Drumming to Metalworking to Digital Photography. They are also required to be physically active, by joining a team sport or activity like yoga, mountain biking or alpine skiing.

The heart of democratic education at Putney is in the classroom. The academic emphasis is upon developing each student's ability to question, to think critically, understanding all sides of each issue, and to be creative. A great deal of class time is given to discussion and considering issues from all points of view. Classes are small enough and long enough to allow opportunity for teachers to meet individually with students, while the rest of the class works independently, as well as to provide adequate time for lecture, discussion and other formats (e.g. labs, individual presentations and group projects).

Several times during the year time is set aside for each student to pursue an extensive, independent project that they develop under the guidance of a faculty member of their choice. In order to encourage students to learn for the sake of learning, and to act for reasons of conscience rather than to receive rewards, in the 1950s, and later, students were not told their grades (unless they were not achieving college certifying work, or were flunking, or receiving an unsatisfactory rating for effort), but students are continually given quick and extensive feedback and counseling about their work through oral discussion with the instructor and in
written comments and reports that are tailored to assist each individual in developing according to their own potential.

By the 1990s there was a great deal of discussion at the school about the policy of not telling students their grades. While many continued to support the policy as a means of encouraging studying for its own sake and supporting collaborative rather than competitive relations, others felt that because it matters what one’s grades are, in terms of getting into college, that students should know immediately what grades they are getting. In terms of gaining information about the quality of his work, author Stephen Sachs found that he had more detailed information as to instructors’ views of the work, and how it might be improved, with the detailed reports and comments, but no grades, at Putney, than he received with graded work as a freshman at the University of Virginia in 1956, even in very small honors classes. He also found that when a college admissions officer told him his Putney grades, in the course of estimating the applicant’s chance of being admitted, that he pretty well knew what those grades were. As the admissions officer mentioned a course the applicant guessed his grades and then found that he was very close, and most often exactly correct, in knowing how he had been rated. In those days Putney students never were told any of their grades.

Today, to help with college counseling, beginning in the spring of junior year students and parents are told over-all class grades, but not the grades for individual pieces of work.

This pedagogy encourages independent questioning and thinking to such an extent, that by his third year at Putney Sachs found that if a teacher asked a question with an obvious answer he thought that the apparent answer must be too simple, and that something more profound must be intended.

The school also offers off-campus programs led by Putney faculty with deep local experience, and are designed so that students live and study immersed in local cultures with opportunities to learn language experientially. As learning a language and gaining cultural fluency through immersion-based programs are very much a part of the ethos of progressive education, students are encouraged to apply for a trimester abroad. It’s a transformative experience that positively contributes to their development as global citizens, as feedback from students, reported in "Doing Something Right," in the Putney Post, spring 2016, indicates. Putney offers trimesters abroad in Mexico, Nicaragua, China, England, and France, as well as access to the Network of Complimentary Schools, a two-week exchange with one of many schools across the country.

With its emphasis on student needs oriented learning, focusing on the development of each individual within the context of community, significant support is given to students, including in advising.

At the core of the Putney experience are the strong relationships that form between students and teachers. On a campus as open and interactive as ours, connections between students and teachers are constant and familial, with faculty taking on a range of mentoring roles as classroom teachers, coaches, Dorm Heads, farm workers, and activity sponsors. Most of our faculty and some staff are also advisors, working closely with five or six students to help them (and their families) navigate...
through the trials and triumphs of life at Putney. The advisor-advisee relationship is perhaps the most important at Putney, often lasting far beyond a student’s time at the school.

Advisors and advisees meet regularly, often daily, sometimes just casually to check in at lunch or assembly, sometimes with a more focused agenda during our weekly advisory block. As the primary link between the school and the family, advisors are quick to call or write home with updates, and also write semester-end letters in December and June, and meet with families during Family Weekend twice a year.

Although we sometimes make perfect matches from the start, students do not generally stay with the same advisor for their entire tenure at Putney. After an initial period at school, students are encouraged to approach teachers with whom they feel they can learn and grow most from and to establish an advisory relationship with them. As students and alumni alike will tell you, the advisor-student relationships at Putney are real, substantive, and lasting. (From the Putney web site)

The Center for Teaching and Learning provides significant student services.

The Putney School recognizes that all students learn differently. We have students with a variety of learning styles in every classroom and we do not treat those with diagnosed learning differences as “other.”

Located in the center of campus, the Center for Teaching and Learning (CTL) serves as a resource for all students who want to maximize their learning. The CTL offers structured and comprehensive academic support in the form of executive function coaching, study skills instruction, and content area tutorials. In addition, the CTL provides all students with the opportunity to meet with tutors during drop-in hours and in the evenings during our supervised study labs.

Using a strength-based approach, our program helps students to develop the tools, self-awareness, and advocacy skills necessary to become confident, active, and independent learners. The director of the CTL is available for consultation with parents, students, and faculty. Families who would like to enroll their students in our tutorial program may make arrangements with the director. (From the Putney web site).

Since preparing students to undertake significant research, which they carry out in many of their individual projects, is a major goal of Putney education, Bibliographic instruction and library skills, including ability in searching the internet intelligently, are integrated into the curriculum. Much of the computer and internet learning takes place at the Instructional Technology Center (ITC), located next to the library. The ITC serves as a central site for teachers and students to learn new technologies and to improve their skills on the programs they already use as well as to obtain help from the IT staff. The center provides the equipment and facilities so that students can create with and incorporate technology into an assignment. Beyond the ITC there are a wide variety of technologies available from video production equipment, digital video cameras, digital
still cameras, MIDI controllers and music composition applications, ProTools based digital recording equipment, scanners, photocopiers and network color and black and white printers. The computers in the ITC have a variety of software titles suited for video production, web page design, graphics, digital photography, video conferencing, and desktop publishing.

Putney provides a comprehensive college counseling program, formally beginning in the 11th grade, to match students with institutions of higher learning that fit their interests, career goals and skills, and to prepare them for the application process. Over 60 Colleges and universities visit the school to meet with individual students. In addition, workshops are offered such as: Financial Aid & Scholarship Workshop – Fall Parent Weekend, led by the Hampshire College Financial Aid Director; Senior College Essay Weekend (October), in which students have personalized writing feedback from Putney faculty; Optional October college fair trip to Northfield Mount Hermon School, MA; and Optional May field trip to Colleges That Change Lives college event/fair, Boston.

Semi-Academic and Other Activities

The academic program is supplemented by a wide variety of activities from which students may choose, many of which are offered Monday through Friday evenings by faculty and staff and their spouses as part of the evening activities program. These include such things as a current events discussion group, an applied physics activity building electronic items and doing experiments, putting out the school's literary magazine and newspaper, learning Chinese cooking and reading and discussing poetry and literature. Foremost among these activities, and a prominent portion of the academic program as well, are the arts. These include theatre, dance, painting and drawing, ceramics, sculpture, and above all, music.

Music pervades the Putney experience. In a very important sense music provides an important element of the harmony of the community. For many years the whole school joined in singing each Friday evening. Later, with the increase in the number of day students, singing was moved to Thursday morning so that the entire community, including faculty and staff, could take part. While there are always a few students who complain that they do not like this, in part because it is a required activity, the vast majority have always enjoyed and been inspired by making very fine music together. The madrigal group and the orchestra, which meet as evening activities, perform several times a year including at the major events at the end of each of the three terms in which everyone has an opportunity to join in some of the singing. In addition, four times a year students organize a Saturday evening coffee house featuring student art work and performances by student musicians.

Among the major events of the year are two festivals when parents and alumni are invited to join in the activity of the community. Each October there is a Harvest Festival with booths and displays, contests, a pageant, an evening square dance, and, of course, music. Graduation includes performances and community singing as well as a speaker. Parents are also invited to the school to sit in on classes and other activities two days each fall and spring.

In addition, contact with nature is important to the school's program. Each fall and spring a few days are set aside for a variety of hiking, canoeing, biking and horseback riding
trips. In the winter a day is set aside to go skiing. About once a year there is a surprise, "drop holiday." Often the purpose is for a day of outdoor activity such as hiking or skiing.

Important regular events are the Monday, Wednesday, Friday morning assemblies (the faculty meet each Tuesday morning). The assemblies are used for many purposes. They provide an opportunity for announcements, as do meal times, and are often used as forums for discussion of community issues. For example, on one occasion in 1956, the editors of the newspaper asked the community's advice as to whether to continue to produce a daily one-page summary of world and local news with a short weekly supplement of commentary, or shift to putting out a weekly featuring more extensive analysis and commentary. Current national and world events are discussed fairly frequently, often led by students who have researched the issues. Sometimes presentations are made, or films shown, presenting two sides of a question as an opening for discussion. In addition students often report on their projects and experiences as morning assemblies provide an opportunity for community sharing.

Each Saturday evening offers an optional event open to everyone in the community. Often this is an outside speaker, presentation or performance. About once a month there is a community square dance. Once a year there is a social dance including, a dinner at which faculty replace students in working in the kitchen and waiting on tables.

In addition to the events, there are community projects, which are open to student participation both during the year and over vacations. During the mid-fifties this included a study tour of the South by an integrated group. More recently it has featured putting on a conference on the environment.

The Physical Side of Life: Work and Sports

Full participation in a community involves both the opportunity to be involved in decision-making and the sharing in the carrying out of the work of the community, so that deciding and carrying out of program are intimately linked. Deciding in the abstract lacks the involvement with concrete reality to make for a fully meaningful experience and opportunity for learning. Doing work without a say in its governance may teach skills, but induces subservience rather than citizenship. In addition, the Putney web site states,

The Work Program provides a setting in which young adults can further their understanding of the relationships among work, home and community life. It offers the opportunity for physical growth as well as meaningful participation in the work necessary to sustain a community. It teaches adolescents the importance of sustained effort by providing physical work in a structured educational setting. In doing so it integrates intellectual and physical labor, thus helping to educate the whole child. The result of participation is empowerment. Students learn how to do fundamental human activities that form the foundation of life and the living of it. The objectives of the Work Program are:

To teach students about the value of physical work.

To instill a sense of self-reliance and the importance of providing for oneself.
To foster a sense of pride and dignity in work well done and in making a meaningful contribution to the community as a whole.
To instill a sense of caring for our place and the environment in which we live.
To provide an alternative setting in which adults can mentor students.
To teach self-discipline and responsibility toward others through assignment to a variety of jobs.
To provide instruction in practical life skills: how to manage time and work on a schedule, call in sick, take direction, resolve problems in the work place, work together with others toward a common goal.
To provide instruction in specific job skills, i.e. carpentry, cooking, farming, forestry.
To use the campus as a laboratory in which the students strengthen their understanding of classroom material by application in a real-life setting.
Throughout their stay at Putney, all students must satisfy six work distribution requirements:
  Lunch job
  Dinner waiting
  Barn crew
  Dish crew
  General substitute
  An afternoon job in one of the land-use activities (garden, farm, woods, sugaring, landscaping, trail maintenance, etc.)

Students take an active role in assigning and supervising work at The Putney School. This student Work Committee consists of seven students (each covering a particular area).

Work jobs and sports take place for about two hours each weekday afternoon. The amount of time spent on work jobs or sports depends on each students choice. Students must take part in a work job at least once a year and are assigned to a crew on the basis of their statements of preference by the Work Committee. Work jobs have included such things as maintenance of buildings and grounds, helping build a new dorm, cutting and maintaining hiking and cross country ski trails, and farm work. The school provides much of its own food through its farm, particularly milk, cheese, butter and ice cream (through its student-run dairy barn) and organically-grown vegetables and wheat for its high quality bread. The school also has horses and offers some riding.

A recent development is the Community Outreach Program in which students work in nursing homes and shelters in nearby municipalities. One day each fall and spring the entire school spends the whole day on community work projects. This includes an annual Charitable Work Day, as the Putney web site stated as of June 16, 2017, "the Putney School's way of contributing to the global community by donating our labor towards a cause." The 2016, Charitable Work Day was in support of the Vermont Refugee Resettlement Program. Students offered their labor in the community at $9.60 an hour with the proceeds of over $10,000 going to the program. In addition to supporting a worthy cause, the experience helped students learn about the economic side of public service.
The job programs teach respect for all kinds of work, cooperation and mutual support. One piece of outreach to the surrounding communities, educational rather than service learning oriented, was in place by the 1950’s. Students attended annual town meetings to observe local democracy in action. Students often discussed their experiences at the various meetings. As they usually went to different meetings each year, they often asked those who had attended where they had gone the proceeding year, what had occurred as follow up on some issue of interest.

Putney offers a variety of sports, including both intramurals and competitions with other schools. In the 50s each student was expected, normally, to engage in at least one team sport a year, in large part because this teaches collaboration with others working for a goal. Today taking part in sports is optional, the emphasis being on outdoor exercise and cooperation whether that be through work jobs or sports. Putney has no school songs, cheers or boosters to support sports. The emphasis is on each player giving and developing their best and on team work. During Sachs' tenure at the school he noted that because of the emphasis on collaboration, Putney baseball teams often beat clubs that were individually (player by player) somewhat better and that had more time to practice. Putney is renowned for its ski program, which for years was lead by math teacher and former Olympic cross-country skier John Caldwell. Caldwell has played a major role in the development of cross-country skiing in the United States and Putney annually hosts a major amateur cross-country skiing competition.

The Putney Experience

The overall impact of the Putney experience is profound for most students. Only a few students become unhappy with it, and may decide to go elsewhere. In general, Putney education tends to do very well in developing academic, artistic and other capabilities of each student. But more importantly, it tends to develop the inner-strength and appreciation of life for each participant while encouraging a concern for others, individually and socially. In terms of the character of citizens in a democratic society, the Putney way tends to develop people who are insightful, thoughtful and willing and able to express themselves in public dialogue. They tend to have the capability and independence to express their own views, while having the respect for, and understanding of, others to address themselves to common concerns and to act collaboratively. Also, the deep thoughtfulness and questioning of assumptions that is learned, is a bar against being swayed by propaganda, or by advertising that attempts to create artificial demands, regardless of their personal, social and environmental value. The kind of education that Putney provides tends to make active, thoughtful, caring and knowledgeable citizens, and careful, environmentally oriented, participants in economic life.

Putney education does a great deal to enhance and catalyze the positive development of young people to the extent that major transformations are not unusual. Sachs recalls one new student from a wealthy family who arrived obviously insecure and defensive. He felt that he had to show off to get attention, making a point of stamping his name often, drawing two lines through the "S" of his middle initial to form a"$." That did not last long. Within a very few weeks he felt sufficiently at home to relax and found his own path of development within the flow of the community. Another student at first was quite rebellious, bordering on being anti-
social. In time he became one of the leaders of the community and was elected president of the student body.

Stephen Sachs commented,

For me, coming to Putney provided a remarkable inducement to development. I came to Putney from a "good" suburban high school where I felt quite alienated, performed marginally, and found only a few niches in which to grow creatively. Life at Putney drew me out almost immediately and the quality of my work in virtually every area of my life improved markedly. I found innumerable opportunities to expand joyously, many of which were helpful to the community. A day dream while working on a project at the end of my first term lead to a transformation of the school paper from a once-a-term review into a daily newspaper. A newcomer and a sophomore, I was amazed to be asked by the staff to become the editor just because I had proposed the idea. While it took me years to become fully accepting of myself, Putney quickly made me feel at home as a unique participant in a community, and, in the process, rapidly accelerated the unfolding of my being.

The strength of the Putney experience is seen clearly in the lives of the school's graduates, a remarkable number of whom have been engaged in successful careers involving the betterment of humanity. Perhaps the best known is national and international affairs writer Jonathan Shell ('61), author of seven books including, *The Fate of the Earth*, a 1982 discussion of the nuclear predicament. He wrote a column for *New York Newsday* and authored pieces in the *New Yorker* for two decades. Numerous others could be mentioned, and, to be sure, at least some of these people would have achieved remarkable careers of public service no matter where they attended high school. But it appears likely that in most cases Putney has contributed significantly to their ability and commitment to strive for the betterment of humanity.

It would seem that the Putney School provides an exceptional education for personal development and citizenship in the best tradition of John Dewey, and is an excellent application of American Indian values. For the most part it educates the whole person as a strong individual within the context of being a member of overlapping communities. The one criticism that some advocates of holistic education might have is that it could offer more on the spiritual (as opposed to religious) side. The human spirit of each student is certainly developed, particularly with the emphasis on creativity - individual and collective - including in the arts. Especially the strong role of music can be exceedingly uplifting and deepening. Time in the out of doors - including in the woods - provides some space for inner reflection, and the free time on weekends can be used for this purpose if one chooses. But it might be helpful to the program, and the students, in the midst of all the activity, to add some more direct work in meditation and inner development.

While some of Putney's program is peculiar to its location, history and the fact that it is a boarding school, in principle, there is nothing in its program that can not be applied to public and private day-schools regardless of location. Dewey's success with democratic education Gary Indiana public schools supports this assertion, as do some of the other examples
below, though they are not as holistic as Putney. Many other examples show the broad applicability of the holistic education approach - if properly adopted for the circumstances and people involved - including those discussed in Ron Miller, What Are Schools For?

Section 3: The Instance of East Harlem Public Schools

The case of East Harlem Public Schools, New York City School District 4, shows the effectiveness of child centered education, the importance of schools having a strong and positive relationship with their community, and that democracy in education not only involves student participation, but requires participatory administration and good team work, just as does any other organization to run effectively."

East Harlem in the early 1970's was one of the poorest neighborhoods in the United States, and this has continued, so that in the 1990's, 35% of the population was on public assistance. Not surprisingly, the schools in its school district ranked among the worst in the nation, and on test scores were lowest, 32 of 32, among New York City school districts. Only 15% of the students in the district read at grade level. Physically the schools were dilapidated. They were over crowded, suffering violence, as gangs pervaded the area. Teachers found the school chaotic and struggled just to keep classes orderly.

In 1974, efforts began which transformed the East Harlem school district into one of the best performing in the country. It began with an action out of desperation. Then District Superintendent Anthony Alvarado, John Falco an assistant principal and several teachers decided they had to get the significant number of "trouble makers" out of the classrooms so the other young people could learn. Since they could not expel these "incorrigible, recalcitrant, aggressive kids," they established The Bridge School, an alternative junior high school for them, headed by Michael Friedman. Because making this school work seemed extremely difficult and problematic, the superintendent told Principal Friedman that as long as he could achieve positive results with the school, the Bridge School would be freed from the usual rules and requirements and would receive extra resources. Friedman took a child needs oriented approach, including providing mentoring and counseling, and offering more personalized learning opportunities. Teachers were freed from the usual top down administrative bureaucracy and operated in teams. The Bridge School quickly began to function well, and student interest in learning went up, accompanied by greatly increased student performance.

The initial success of the bridge school led to the launching of two additional alternative schools that year, which also succeeded. That was followed by proposals by teachers for additional alternative schools: The East Harlem Career Academy, The Academy of Environmental Sciences, The Isaac Newton School of Science and Mathematics, and a traditional school whose students wore uniforms. With the alternative schools operating with successful results, parents began demanding that their students be admitted. With little or any improvement in the regular schools, the successful alternative schools could not meet the strong demand. So, the entire district was transformed into set of alternative schools.

Soon there were 50 "schools", actually education programs, meeting in 30 buildings. There were different kinds of schools to meet parents demands. These included a wide variety of possibilities from which parents and students could choose, traditional schools, those with open
classrooms, schools with mentor programs, with heavy tutoring, or with reading for those behind grade levels, or advanced schools for gifted students. Specialized schools had such foci as computer skills and photography, and even a school operated in conjunction with the Big Apple Circus, as well as in science or art. To keep the learning experience personal, and the school functioning well, each school was limited to no more than 300 students. Parents had choice as to where to send their children. If there was demand for attendance at a school that would take it above 300 students, a new school of the same type was formed. If a school became too small, it would be closed and its teachers would transfer to another school that needed them. Thus, there was competition in the system that encouraged teachers to make their program work. But the competition was friendly, as no teachers would be fired because their school lost students or closed.

The schools were run by teams of teachers with input from parents, whose support the school needed. Parent participation and support of their children in learning has long been found to be a major factor in student and school success. Teachers supported and learned from each other both within and among teams and schools. It was found, as is usual with well working participatory work teams, that the teaching teams held their members to high standards, achieving better quality control from mutual support, peer pressure, and the synergy arising from group discussion and decision making, than can normally be achieved from evaluations and top down supervision. John Falco commented that teachers who did not perform well "fall by the wayside on their own, because of the peer pressure that's put upon them within their own collegial group. If you have one rotten apple in the bunch, it impacts the others. They put the pressure on. Those teachers see themselves; they come to me. They say, 'I can't make it here.' Many of them choose to go elsewhere or to leave the system."

In contrast, numerous teachers who had been burned out in the old, chaotic, bureaucratic schools, switched over and thrived in the new system, which was challenging and rewarding, with incentives to succeed. This was in part because to draw students and do well each school had to have a clear mission and a largely achievable set of goals. This was one of the factors in the success of the Putney School, and is generally a major factor in the success of high performing organizations.

In addition, while in East Harlem there was not the student participation in running the school that existed in early Twentieth Century Gary, IN public schools or at Putney, there was a twofold empowerment, at a lower level. First, the supported child centered education gave students who had been struggling, or failing, in the old system a chance to succeed, and from that to gain confidence, enjoying school and the learning process. Meanwhile, more gifted or capable young people who had been bored or frustrated by the cookie cutter approach and chaos of the regular schools, found enjoyable opportunities to learn at accelerated rates, or in specialized programs that fit them. Second, students had the ability to choose their school, and to change schools if they wished. Often it was the parents who officially made the choice, but as parents frequently listen to their children in such matters, especially if there is a direct relationship to their child's performance, the student's were quite regularly involved in the decision, giving them power and ownership. If going to a particular school was their choice and they did well and enjoyed it, it was their school.

And a great many students did do well in the alternative East Harlem middle school system. For instance, reading scores soared from the 15% of young people reading at grade level under the
old system in 1973, to 64% under the alternative approach in 1988. By that time New York State testing rated 75% of eighth graders as competent writers. Similarly, the number of East Harlem middle school graduates who were accepted by New York City's four elite high schools (including Brooklyn Technical and Bronx Science) rose from an average of 10 a year, in the mid 1970s, to 139 - 10% of District 4's middle school graduates - in 1987. This was double the acceptance rate for the City's middle schools over all. Meanwhile, 180 East Harlem graduates were accepted at second tier city high schools. 36 went to highly rated private high schools, such as Andover and the Hill school. Over all, more than a quarter of District 4's graduates went on to outstanding high schools which only a very few gained acceptance to prior to the district's transformation. Moreover, close to 1000 of the district's 14,000 students in 1987 came, by special request, from outside the district. Superintendent Falco noted, "On any given day, I receive at least four or five calls from parents requesting admission from outside the district. I just have to turn them away," Finally, District 4's alternative schooling success was not momentary, but lasted for many years, transcending a change in superintendents.

Section 4: Escuela Nueva - the Cross Cultural Relevance of Holistic Education

Child centered learning and participatory education are not culturally limited, but are applicable globally, though each application must be appropriately adapted to its particular and changing situation. There are many examples of such applications in countries outside the United States, some of which have lead to reforms in North America. A particularly interesting example are the 20,000 Escuelas Nueva schools in Colombia, which have spread to 16 other countries. Escuela Nueva is an educational model designed in Colombia by Vicky Colbert, Beryl Levinger, and Óscar Mogollón, in 1975, to improve the quality, relevance and effectiveness of the schools in the country. To do so, the founders attempted to apply what research had shown to be the most effective educational methods. There has long been a great deal of evidence from the United States that students do well when they are encouraged to think for themselves and collaborate with one another. This was again confirmed in a 2014 report by the American Institutes for Research, *Study of Deeper Learning: Opportunities and Outcomes*, which concluded that students who attended so-called deeper learning high schools — which emphasize understanding, not just memorizing, academic content; applying that understanding to novel problems and situations; and developing interpersonal skills and self-control — recorded higher test scores on standardized tests in mathematics and English; were more likely to enroll in a four year college; and exhibited "higher levels of collaborative skills, academic engagement, motivation to learn and self-efficacy compared with their counterparts in comparison schools." Thus, participatory education was a foundation of the Escuela Nueva model.

The program was initially aimed at rural multi-grade schools in low population areas where one or two teachers simultaneously teach all grades. The Escuela Nueva model has since been applied in a variety of other settings. By the 1980s it was changing the country's rural education, and in 2015 encompassed 20,000 schools in rural Colombia, and a smaller number elsewhere, in twelve other South and Central American Countries, Vietnam, East Timor, Uganda and the Philippines.
The Principles of Escuela Nueva

Escuela Nueva is intended to transform conventional schools and approaches to learning, shifting the educational method from teacher centered to child focused. The teacher is transformed from the authoritative transmitter of knowledge to being a facilitator of student learning, a mentor and a guide for students, and coordinator within the school and between the school and the community. The educational process is changed from an emphasis on passive learning, with much effort on memorization, to "cooperative, constructive, personalized and active learning."

The model has four interrelated components: the curriculum and classroom, community, training, and management, which are addressed simultaneously and holistically.

Each component has strategies and elements that promote:
- Active, participatory, and cooperative learning that is focused on the student.
- A curriculum that is relevant to the daily lives of students.
- A calendar and evaluation system that allows for flexible promotion.
- A stronger and closer relationship between the school and the community.
- An emphasis on developing democratic values and encouraging civic participation.
- Effective and experiential training for teachers.
- A new role for the teacher; from transmitter of facts to facilitator of learning.
- A new "textbook" or learning guide that encourages permanent dialogue and interaction.

Through active and participatory learning, the Escuela Nueva model promotes, among others:
- The ability to apply knowledge to new situations.
- Cognitive skills, learning to think.
- Increased self-esteem.
- Democratic, cooperation and solidarity attitudes and behaviors.
- Teamwork and cooperation—students work in small groups actively dialoguing and interacting.
- Self-paced, self-directed learning.
- Equal opportunities for boys and girls to participate.
- Entrepreneurial and leadership skills.

The Curricular component involves a socially and culturally relevant curriculum, flexibly applied according to the particulars of the school and community, through the vehicle of active, cooperative and participatory learning. The components key elements are the learning guides, learning corners and student government. The learning guides are dialoguing textbooks designed to promote child-to-child collaboration and teamwork. They help create a dynamic where students are continually learning with, and helping, each other as they dialogue among themselves and with the teacher. The guides provide a basis for stimulating the development of critical thinking, especially creative problem solving - individually and collectively. The guides facilitate the advancement of students from one level to another at their own pace -"flexible promotion" - while serving as a planning tool for the teacher. In addition, the learning guides motivate student use of the classroom libraries and learning corners, while encouraging the application of learnings with their families and community, integrating them into the learning process. Because the guides
provide questions to which students find their own answers, they give high value to the school and the local culture.

Participation in active student government and its committees empower students to practice democracy, learning democratic attitudes and behaviors. As students decide important issues together, thoughtfully solving practical problems, peaceful interaction is promoted, while enhancing social and emotional development.

The training component involves prior and ongoing teacher education using the same active, participatory methods that they work with in the classroom. The main objective is to prepare teachers to "guide, facilitate, give feedback and evaluate the learning process of their students, shifting his/her role from transmitter of facts to leader and manager of a process of social construction of knowledge (learning)." Teachers coming to Escuela Nueva participate in effective, practical, inservice learning. They also observe the process by visiting demonstration schools and classrooms. Teacher education continues on the job, as teachers periodically join in microcenters of teacher learning circles, coming together to interact, discuss, exchange ideas and experiences, and reflect on their practice.

The community component of Escuela Nueva facilitates the active participation of the family and the community in school life, for mutual support. This is achieved through collaboration among teachers, children, parents and members of the local community, and in inviting active community participation in school activities. The learning guides link the curriculum and the particular lessons through practical applications at home and in the community. Moreover, understanding and valuing the local culture is incorporated into daily school activities.

The administrative component functions to advise and support teachers and coordinate and empower operations, rather than exercising strict supervision and control of the school. The result has been new, positive attitudes toward the educational process, encouraging administrators to take ownership in their role and catalyzing them to take greater responsibility for producing results.

Escuela Nueva in Practice

David L Kirp described the operation of a small Escuela Nueva school he visited in rural Colombia, with about 30 students aged 5-13.

In most schools, students sit in rows facing the teacher, who does most of the talking. But these students are grouped at tables, each corresponding to a grade level. The hum of conversation fills the room. After tackling an assignment on their own, the students review one another’s work. If a child is struggling, the others pitch in to help.

During my visit to one of these schools, second graders were writing short stories, and fifth graders were testing whether the color of light affects its brightness.
when seen through water. The teacher moved among the groups, leaning over shoulders, reading and commenting on their work. In one corner of the classroom were items, brought to school by the kids, that will be incorporated in their lessons. The students have planted a sizable garden, and the vegetables and fruits they raise are used as staples at mealtime, often prepared according to their parents’ recipes.

In the schools, students elected by their peers shoulder a host of responsibilities. In a school I visited in a poor neighborhood here in the city of Armenia, the student council meticulously planned a day set aside to promote peace; operated a radio station; and turned an empty classroom into a quiet space for reading and recharging. I was there last Halloween, when students put on a costume contest for their pets. 

In rural Colombia teachers do not undergo a great deal of education or teacher training, yet because of how the system works, with what preparation the Fundacion Escuela Nueva can provide them, the schools function very well. Many teachers have come to Escuela Nueva from traditionally run schools. Their Escuela Nueva training gives them a start, but they have not always internalized the approach when they begin teaching. Often, in those instances, it is the experienced students who teach them how to apply the method.

Evidence of the Success of Escuela Nueva

The results have been spectacular, drop out rates and the percentage of students having to repeat classes are lower, especially because, students having difficulties are assisted by their teammates. Academic achievements have been spectacular, making Colombia the only country in the world in which rural schools perform better than urban schools, except in a very few cities, as students at Escuela Nueva schools have out performed students at conventional schools. Strong positive results have also been found concerning student self-esteem, democratic behaviors, solidarity and cooperation. Similarly, Escuela Nueva students relate more peacefully with others. There is also significant evidence that young women achieve as well as young men in multiple dimensions.

A number of studies have shown the efficacy of the Escuela Nueva model that can be accessed through the Escuela Nueva Fundacion web site. Among them, in 1998 UNESCO reported that following Cuba, Colombia provided the best education in Latin America to students in rural areas. In 1989, the World Bank declared that the Escuela Nueva model was one of the three most successful innovations that had impacted public policy world wide, and a 1992 World Bank study found that the Escuela Nueva approach of learning by doing, rather than being endlessly drilled for national exams — generally outperformed their better-off peers in traditional schools. In 2000, the United Nations development report declared that the Escuela Nueva model was one of the three greatest achievements in Columbian history. Other studies found that the parents of Escuela Nueva students apply corporal punishment less often than is the norm in their culture; are more likely to let their youngsters spend time at play or on homework, rather than making them work when they’re not in school; and more likely, along with their children, to become engaged in their communities.
Developing Participatory Education

Ernesto Schiefelbein, rector of the Autonomous University of Chile, who evaluated the schools in Colombia, noted that “Unesco reported the successful diffusion of Escuela Nueva in 20,000 Colombian schools with poorly trained teachers.” He said, “As far as I know, there is no other example of massive educational improvement in a democratic developing country.” The spread of Escuela Nueva outside of Colombia was largely undertaken by governments, which is one way educational transformation can take place. Where governments are quite democratic, if there is sufficient public demand, participatory education may well result. But the extent to which such development will occur in undemocratic regimes is problematic.

In East Harlem, after the success of the first three alternative programs, the system was transformed as a result of strong pressure from parents. In Indianapolis, IN, a quite promising process for improvement of the public schools was initiated at the behest of a new school superintendent with the support of a leading nonprofit organization, the Greater Indianapolis Progress Committee, an organization of leading business leaders.

Section 5: The Promise and Problems of Indianapolis School Reform

The Indianapolis Public School District was one of many school districts in the United States that attempted to undertake school reform in the 1990s, that offers a promising model, if certain key improvements are made. In early 1990, a new Superintendent came to the Indianapolis Public School District (IPS), which had 48,000 students. He began holding public meetings to ascertain public perceptions of IPS, finding there was wide dissatisfaction with many of the schools. This was in part because 40% of students were dropping out, 18% during their senior year in high school. Hoping to turn complaints into positive action he lead the school district into hiring an outside consultant, Cambridge Management Group, to assist IPS in a reform process.

The consultants collaborated with IPS personnel in designing a process to analyze problems in the school system and propose changes, and trained the IPS personnel involved to facilitate the team process involving administrators, parents, teachers, students, and community members. Some of the "community members" were invited, generally because of their expertise, and others volunteered. Community members were brought into the project largely through broad advertising, though no attempt was made to make the community participants broadly representative of the community, which is a necessity to insure good participatory democratic process. However, there is no evidence that this skewed the process in this case. It is critical that the entire setting up of a process of this kind, including the choosing of steering committee members, be representative.

In November 1990, a four day retreat was held with a 35 member steering committee, facilitated by trained staff from Cambridge Management Group. After dialoguing at length, the steering committee decided by consensus on a statement of basic beliefs about people, a mission statement for the process, a set of strategic parameters, a set of objectives, and a list of 13 strategies for change and improvement. In principle (without a detailed review of the retreat), this appears to be quite good participatory strategic planning process.
The belief statement proclaimed, "We believe: Higher expectations yield higher results. It takes a whole community to raise a child. All people have inherent worth and value. Everyone can learn! Examples are the most powerful way people learn values, There is no limit to the excellence people can achieve. Spiritual and/or ethical values are essential for shaping character. Understanding, appreciating and celebrating cultural diversity enriches our common culture. Accountability is crucial to human effectiveness whether it is individual or institutional." The mission statement set forth, "The mission of the Indianapolis Public schools is that all students graduate with a passion and joy for lifelong learning and a superior foundation of knowledge, skills and personal values for a quality life, successful employment, and entry into higher education by transforming its educational services in partnership with our diverse, multicultural and urban community." The four objectives targeted 1997 for achieving: 1) 100% graduation from IPS with all graduates entering a postsecondary education/training program or a vocation within six months. 2) All students participating in interdependent, community-school activities. 3) All IPS students demonstrating a passion for learning. 4) All students graduating with competencies and values essential to making informed decisions relevant to their lives.

The Strategic parameters were a set of limits beyond which IPS would not go: "1) We will not initiate any programs or services which does not contribute to our mission. 2) We will not hire any person who does not contribute to our mission. 3) We will not allow conventional thinking to interfere with the serious considerations of new ideas."

In order to accomplish the objectives, the strategies for "transformation" of the Indianapolis Public Schools were established as follows: 1) We will identify the competencies and values essential to all IPS students and infuse them throughout the curriculum. 2) We will energize and integrate all aspects of our diverse community into full support of the mission and objectives. 3) We will establish and maintain an environment that respects and values the unique circumstances that surround race, gender, socio-economic status and other special needs. 4) We will structure IPS so that IPS will meet the objectives to fulfill the mission. 5) We will develop a system that fosters consensus, and nurtures and rewards innovation and excellence. 6) We will form alliances with public and private human service agencies to better serve students who are at-risk and in need. 7) We will extend the environs of the school to include the community. 8) We will establish a network of community based activities designed to develop a student's character and appreciation of human values. 9) We will establish a program of outreach to all IPS graduates designed to determine their status and to evaluate our success. 10) We will develop opportunities for all students to enroll in programs and schools of their choice [within IPS]. 11) We will establish and continually improve an environment that creates trust, mutual respect and professionalism. 12) We will develop innovative learning experiences designed to create passion and joy for learning. 13) We will implement shared decision-making throughout the organization."

Directly following the retreat the Strategic Planning Committee and IPS staff began advertising and networking to open the process to the community and its personnel, plus a few students, throughout IPS. An "action team" coordinated by two co-leaders, trained by Cambridge Management, was set up to develop concrete proposals for implementing each of the strategies. In January, 1992, following a general meeting to explain the process to the more
than 360 people participating in twelve teams - one for each of the first 12 strategies - the teams began their work. The teams were given wide latitude in interpreting what their strategy involved, but were limited to coming up with proposals to apply that strategy originally, as worded. The teams met approximately once a week until the beginning of May. The team leaders regularly opened sessions with an ice breaking exercise that brought focus to the particular problem of the session. Team meetings went back and forth between general discussions and work in small groups. All decisions were made by consensus. The teams developed their plans through a series of stages: developing a basic approach to their problem based upon an agreed upon set of values, undertaking research to expand their knowledge and to obtain a wide range of views of the issues, and developing a specific set of prioritized proposals, "action plans," accompanied by estimates of costs and benefits. Throughout the process team leaders met periodically with the steering committee, while the internal facilitator circulated among the teams, visiting almost all of the teams at least once. In late May team leaders presented the action plans to the Strategic Planning Steering Committee.

The vast majority of the proposed plans were accepted by the steering committee which attached recommendation for implementation during either the first and second years or the last three of the five year transformation process. The few action plans not accepted, were rejected or modified because they were found not to meet all the criteria for strategic change. Teams 3 (respect for race, gender, socio-economic and other special needs) and 4 (to restructure IPS) were asked to continue working on plan development over the summer, which they did. Their action plans were then considered and approved by the Strategic Planning Steering Committee. During the summer IPS made some administrative changes in preparation for implementing the approved action plans with the idea of beginning implementation in the fall (1992).

Team 13, to design action plans to implement shared decision-making throughout the organization, to be coordinated by the IPS Superintendent and the Indianapolis Education Association, IEA did not meet because IPS and the teachers union were engaged in protracted contract negotiations. IEA declined to be involved in any part of the process until agreement was reached on a new contract, fewer teachers were involved in the process than otherwise would have been the case. Team 13 was to begin meeting as soon as a new contract was negotiated and approved.

The quality of the process among the teams generally was quite good, with the exception of team 3 (respect for race, gender...) and team 4 (IPS Structure), though to different degrees every team experienced some difficult moments, as is generally the case in this kind of group process. The opening exercises usually were helpful in initiating discussion that included much openness and sharing, and cooperative team spirit generally prevailed. With good facilitating the process normally unfolded quite well, without much frustration, despite the fact that most team members felt that it would have been helpful to have another month to complete the work. For example, members of team 12 (Passion and Joy in Learning) only found frustration, being under time pressure near the end of the process. In beginning to turn their findings into concrete proposals. But once the team members began to see how they wanted to do this, the process returned to its normal smooth flow.
The initial processes of developing consensus on basic ideas and approaches and creating a list of categories to include in the planning all moved ahead quite collaboratively with the assistance of fine facilitating. Even with limited time, the various sub groups found that they could design and carry out meaningful and helpful research, largely through some (unscientific) surveys of representatives of all the accessible groups that could be identified that might provide useful perspectives on the issues (e.g. IPS students and former students enrolled in a lower level class at an area university, teachers, parents and university educators).

The two working groups that experienced difficulty with the process, Team 3 (respect for race, gender...) and Team 4 (IPS Structure) got into difficulty because they did not completely follow the process guidelines, particularly the requirement that decisions be made by consensus. In the case of team 3 the depth of concern that a number of its participants felt about racial problems in IPS made it difficult for them to get beyond venting their feelings and move to problem solving and planning by the whole group together in the limited time available. With more time, and good facilitation, this might have been overcome.

Over all, though it had a few flaws, the IPS process was a good example of what can be done in the way of participatory strategic planning, providing that it has a strong representative base, with the participants representative of the concerned community with its diverse concerns and interests. Moreover, there must be responsibility to the community to see that what has been decided is implemented, or if the community is unhappy with the result, amended in a democratic process. It was the lack of accountability to the community - and the participants in the process - on implementation that was the fatal flaw in the Indianapolis school transformation process. After all that work, the IPS Superintendent only put into practice the proposals of one Action team, #10 to provide school and program choice to students within IPS, something the superintendent had favored before the process began. He left IPS not long after the conclusion of the process with no action on any of the other plans. The new superintendent, who came to IPS from outside Indianapolis, and had no part in the process, had her own set of initiatives and did nothing to build on what so many people had been involved in doing. Had most of what had been decided been put into effect, which included plans for continued community-school system dialoguing, it would have encouraged and empowered community members to be further involved, not only in the schools, but elsewhere in civil and community affairs - as successful participation encourages more participation. Instead, the failure to follow up was a discouragement.

Section 6: Education for Participatory Democracy and Economy

One of the main goals in establishing Escuela Nueva in rural Colombia was to provide the necessary educational base and background for development, economically and politically. The kinds of participatory education at Putney and Escuela Nueva are essential to successful participatory democracy. While the values and skills of participation can be learned later - as they have in the process of developing quite a large number of participatory work teams - they are better learned early, especially for building a participatory culture. Participation, though it needs facilitation and guidance in the learning process, is best learned through participation. Continued participation deepens and reinforces learning.
Beyond the teaching of participation, and democratic process, with the values and skills involved, in itself, other skills and knowledge are necessary to realize democracy in practice. Particularly important is knowing how to find out what is occurring in society, and the world, and how to find needed information including alternative views on issues and alternative solutions. Thus learning how to do research is essential, today in libraries, on the internet, and otherwise from people directly and indirectly. Thus Putney's emphasis on learning by doing research, and on learning computer skills and competence in searching on the internet (including how to determine what are good and reliable sources on the web, as anyone can put up a web site), are essential skills for democratic participation, as well as for participating in the economy, and for living more generally.

In addition, it is necessary to know what ongoing issues are, and their background, as well as how political, economic and related systems function. So substantive learning about civics (government, economics and society), history, geography, and the social sciences, and in a technical age with environmental problems: the physical science, is essential. In all these areas, as well as in everything else, learning needs to be appropriate, thoughtful, participatory, and experiential, at each person's level. This also includes, both for good citizenship and personal competence in society, knowing how business, and personal economics function. Thus one needs to understanding credit and financial services, to be able to make good financial decisions, as well as to participate intelligently in public policy discussion about them.

Also, in addition to being able to reason well and to problem solve, seeking out and choosing competently among alternatives, it is important to know how people can be and are manipulated, in order not to be fooled by propaganda and advertising. Indeed if enough people understand how manipulative advertising can be, and today often is, it will become ineffective in creating artificial needs just to make sales. Then, assisted by appropriate regulation to insure honesty and transparency, advertising would mostly serve its legitimate function of providing information. This, combined with environmental knowledge, would make it much easier to develop a sustainable quality of life, rather than a consumption oriented, culture and way of living.

Experience in the arts, and knowing about them, is also important, though more indirect. It teaches creativity, which is necessary for success in any endeavor, is spiritually and emotionally uplifting, and together with the humanities, teaches much about life and human understanding, which is important for citizenship, good social relations, and living well as a whole person.

The physical side of life has its role also, for there is no separation between mind and body. Research shows that being physically active, healthy in body, and in good physical shape, increase mental ability. Moreover, there is a kinetic side of learning, and an element in participatory learning is physical. Achieving with physical skills can be deeply rewarding and empowering. All of the performing arts have a physical aspect, while performing sports and a good deal of physical work well is an art. Further, physical activity in work or sports offer opportunities for learning team work and collaboration, indeed, a whole set of personal and social virtues.
Connecting the School and Society

A major factor in making education relevant is connecting the school to the community, and at times larger society. This has been a major aspect of Escuela Nuevo, and to a lesser extent at the Putney School through service learning and occasional visits to community events. The reverse can also be undertaken, with the school acting as a community center that includes student participation in the onsite community events.

An interesting example is the teaching of Rafe Edwards at Hobart Elementary School in Los Angeles, portrayed in the film *The Hobart Shakespeareans.* Edwards teaches mostly immigrant children and rigorously teaches them English, mathematics, geography, literature, and history. History is made alive through cross-country trips to learn it first-hand. Moreover, for some students the hallmark of his classes, putting on a full length Shakespearean play at the end of each semester, by teaching students about people, and dealing with life, was quite practical. This has been particularly the case for some students from abusive homes who have gleaned better how to deal with domestic difficulties through the drama experience.

Another aspect of connecting the school to the community for students not going directly to college after high school is linking in class learning to apprenticeships in businesses, non-profit organizations and government. This takes John Dewey’s inclusion of work in education, as at early Twentieth Century Garry Public Schools and the Putney School, one step further. For many years, some schools in the United States have followed the German model of having students not immediately bound for college engage during some school time in apprenticeships where they participate in hands on, on the job learning, in the course of work that may lead to a job if both the student and employer wish that. At the same time, in some classes, such as mathematics, students learn relevantly, by having the lessons involve learning that is applicable to their apprenticeships, often doing exercises and problem solving that is directly related to the work of the apprenticeship.

Section 7: Improving Higher Education

Almost all of what is helpful in improving and democratizing schools is also relevant in improving higher education, if one adapts, as is always important, for the level, abilities, needs and circumstances of the students. (Conversely, most of the improvements discussed here in higher education, can be appropriately adapted to K-12 schools).

To begin with, the hierarchical structure of universities, in many cases with an emphasis on professors imparting knowledge through lecturing to students sitting in rows facing the professor, combined with grading based largely upon multiple choice and short answer tests, have tended to put an emphasis on the authority of the expert who has the right answers, which to varying degrees, depending on the style of the instructor (some of whom have employed Socratic, or other forms of, dialoguing to various degrees) discourage the creative thinking of each student to thoroughly think the issues through for themselves, with the benefit of dialogue with the other students and the instructor. In addition, increasingly fragmented specialization has turned “universities” into multiversities, in which students often have difficulty understanding that, and how, knowledge in one area is connected to other areas. This gives student a fractured view of the world, while contributing to the making of narrow policies that have many unfortunate side effects,
especially relating to the environment. A number of effective approaches have been taken to this problem for many years, which are now accelerating as the importance of interdisciplinary approaches and understanding has been gaining energy in the United States and elsewhere.

One long standing approach is the broad great books curriculum, a hallmark of Saint Johns College Liberal Arts Program, that has students reading classic writings in many fields and thoughtfully discussing the issues, to provide a student a thought provoking holistic view of learning, at least from a western perspective. Author Stephen Sachs experienced a version of this approach in a two year honors program at the University of Virginia, in 1956-58, in which students took part in dialogues with faculty members raising deep questions over readings of classic works, in Greek philosophy and other writings; in classics of social, political and economic thought and philosophy; in leading historical works of mathematics and science; and in a sampling of great works of western literature. The emphasis of class discussions was to think deeply about the issues, and to come to one’s own conclusions after probing discussion. Sachs found this fostered creative thinking about life, in all its aspects, while tying together as an interrelated whole what he was studying in his other courses, from mathematics and chemistry, across English and Spanish, to history, political science and economics.

Similarly, Sachs noted while a graduate student at the University of Chicago, 1960-65, that the undergraduate liberal arts program for the first two years there offered thought provoking integrative dialoguing courses introducing various broad fields including social sciences and physical sciences. The introductory physical science course included students repeating important experiments in the history of science to gain an experiential knowledge of the history they were reading about.

Teaching political science at IUPUI (Indian University Perdue University Indianapolis) from 1969-2002, Sachs engaged with other faculty members in a number of projects to make learning thought provoking, experiential, holistic, and in some cases related to the community. Sachs first method was to emphasize discussion, though some lecture was necessary, when practical by having students sit in a circle, with the aim of analyzing and thinking through issues. This involved learning problem solving, often on a group basis, as opposed to students simply expressing unanalyzed and unsupported opinions, or jumping directly from the statement of a problem to a proposed solution without undertaking an analysis of the problem and then generating likely alternative approaches to solving them, which were then analyzed to find the best solution. Grading was primarily on the basis of take home or in class essays, presentations and participatory exercises, and research papers, plus some credit for class participation, with the emphasis on students reaching their own conclusions (except in certain exercises where they had to argue one view) based on thorough reasoning.

One of the approaches developed with other faculty members was to use simulations to increase student involvement with the subject matter. The simulations were of two types, role playing and multiplayer games. One example of a role playing simulation was a U.S. Supreme Court simulation – similar to law school moot court exercises – in constitutional law classes. Each student would participate in two simulations involving fictitious cases designed to illuminate and promote thinking on the main issues in the major aspects of the course. In one simulation students would be members of a team of lawyers researching and preparing arguments, which they
presented before the Supreme Court, whose members would ask them questions. In the second case, the students were the supreme court judges hearing the arguments, asking the lawyers questions, delivering short oral opinions, and a written opinion which could be individual or collective. In all their roles in the simulation, students were graded for their coverage of the issues and reasoning to support their assertions or conclusions, with credit for creativity. As lawyers they were required to make the best argument they could for their side of the case. As judges, they could take any position, or set of positions on the issues, they wished. Following each simulation there would be an open discussion of the issues in the simulation, including any important points the simulation participants might have missed. A similar approach was used in classes involving issues of public policy, such a public administration class on decision making and the carrying out of policy in the executive branch of the U.S. government, and courses on public policy in such areas as the environment and crime, There, students, acting as interest group representatives, once argued their side of a major policy question before a congressional committee, and once were a member of a committee hearing the arguments, asking questions, and individually or collectively writing a majority or minority committee report.

A number of us on the faculty formed the Interdisciplinary Committee on simulation that developed a number of games to give students experience in major aspects of courses. Two of these were used in Introduction to American Politics. The first was a simulation of one house of Congress plus the President (it being assumed, because of time constraints, that the other house would act in the same manner as the house being played, which could be either the Senate or the House). The student roles in the game were first, members of Congress working to be reelected. Their reelection depended on how they voted in committee and on the floor of the chamber compared with the views of citizens in their districts. Interest groups in the game could purchase publicity campaigns, and the President could make speeches, that could change public opinion on the bills and possible amendments. Also effecting the reelection of members of Congress according to final public opinion in their district was what did and did not pass congress, and after the President signed the bill, or his veto was overridden, became law. In addition, members of Congress gained or lost votes according to how much money they had in their campaign funds given them by lobbyists of the various interest groups, and the impact on the particular voting population in their state or district of statements of support or opposition by the interest groups. Second was the President wanting to be reelected on much the same basis as members of Congress. Third were the members of interest groups with various amounts of money to donate to candidates campaign funds or buy publicity campaigns, and varying amounts of public influence from their supporting or opposing the reelection of the President or members of Congress. The game took the students through a shortened version of a session of their house of congress, with each of the major procedures, involved. As this was before the age of computers, after the completion of the session students homework was to calculate from the various tables how many votes they had gained and lost (subject to the instructors review, a “vote recount”), and reporting the election results on the blackboard at the beginning of the next class. Thus through a complex but easy to play game, in which students were informed of the games limitations as a reflection of reality, students learned more fully of what they had been reading of the processes of Congress, in a short and fun game.

The second learning game, Gerrymander, was a simulation of a state legislature redistricting itself after a census indicated a population shift, in which students aim was to get themselves reelected, their party to have as many seats in the legislature as possible. A new
legislative district map needed to be agreed on before class ended, or all would lose in the uncertainty of what a federal court might decide. These games were pre-computer, and with computers a great deal more can be done in the way of individual and group learning simulation games in all fields, including the sciences.

Perhaps the most interesting learning game we worked with was The North Atlantic Game, developed by Sachs while at Indiana South Bend (IUSB) in 1969 (revised in 1971) for a class on international politics, but also applied in a high school class by a teacher who had worked with it in a simulation workshop for teachers. The simulation involved teams of students running the foreign affairs (including trade, military development, deployment, and possible action) of nations stretching from the Rocky Mountains to the Urals in the late 1960’s period of the Cold War. The game mirrored the actual world situation with a simple economy, which could be expanded by internal investment and foreign trade, but required fuel to run (as did the military), while military development (creating armed forces and weapons development) and maintenance of forces, and any military action, had to be paid for. The game included the simulated world powers having the ability to create and deploy atomic weapons, and of a number of other nations to invest to do so over time. After a few runs, the class was expanded from three hours a week to four, with a one hour lab for the simulation, in order to allow sufficient time for the simulation without reducing the class time for discussion of major issues in international affairs. The game was complex enough to be reasonably realistic for the students to apply and experiment with the main principles of international, and related internal, affairs (including the domestic consequences of international actions), but simple enough to be understood and played in the pre-computer age.

Students, very much enjoyed and became highly involved in the game, to the extent that even two years later, former simulators passing each other in the hall greeted each other, “Hello Germany,” Hello France.” As post game session discussions showed, the game was much more than recreation. Students learned a good deal from the experience that added to, and gave depth, to what they had read and discussed in class. Perhaps the most striking experience came on the same day the class discussed problems of arms control. The three major nuclear powers in the game had agreed to put “all” of their nuclear weapons under joint control, so they could not be used with out all three nations consent. But because each had secretly held back a sizable stock of nuclear missiles, none of them had suggested the inspection program that the rules allowed. On that day, each of the nations pulled out their atomic reserve threatening what they thought were nuclear disarmed other nations, only to find they had all done the same. That sudden situation came very close to bringing on a nuclear war which would have destroyed the three main powers, and greatly harmed all the other nations with nuclear fall out, but some quick diplomacy, which also involved some of the other countries, barely prevented the simulated disaster. We could not have had a better introduction for discussing arms control.

Bringing The Case Into the Class Room: One Up on Simulation

As useful learning devices as simulations are, one can do even better with direct relevant involvement of students with the community. This can be done on a small scale by bringing local experts in to discuss actual experience in the community with topics being considered in class. In an IUPUI course on crime policy, for example, among several speakers brought in was a local police officer involved in initiating and carrying out community policing, which the class was then
studying. The officer discussed both the problems the department had in establishing the program, and some major successes when it was properly instituted.

A public administration course on anti-poverty programs, in the midst of the U.S. War on Poverty in the early 1970s, went much further in effectively connecting the community and the classroom, through focusing on ongoing cases involving the local Community Action Program Against Poverty as it related to one of the city’s low income communities and its community organization.43 The course was team taught by a political science professor, who in choosing the course reading, and as a resource person, provided broad background on the issues, and by a community organizer working with the neighborhood organization, who had good relations with people on all sides of issues impacting the neighborhood, and was able to bring them in to discuss their views with the class. Some students were able to attend relevant community events and report back to the class. By the third year of the course, a number of community members had begun taking the class in order to gain more perspective on how they might better succeed in achieving the community organization’s objectives. At that time, the community organization was in the process of obtaining a health clinic, so several students volunteered to help paint it. The new clinic needed a receptionist knowledgeable about medical problems, and an allied health student in the class, in need of a job, took the position. Thus, the relationship between the university and the community through the class provided a very fine and rewarding learning experience for the students to the benefit of the community.

Linking to the Community to Promote Holistic Learning

IUPUI was birthed as a particularly fractured multiversity, in 1969, because the rapid pace of the merger of Indiana University and Purdue University programs in Indianapolis did not allow time and opportunity to develop unifying links between the 26 separate schools, with the School of Liberal Arts, separate from the School of Science, which included the psychology department. Thus a number of School of Liberal Art faculty from several departments were concerned about creating a more integrated and holistic understanding for students.44 The group decided to develop an experimental course, Introduction To Thinking in the Liberal Arts, that would be taught by one faculty member, bringing in members of various departments at appropriate times to introduce students to the approaches and methods of all the humanities and social science disciplines in an integrated manner. If the course was successful, It was to be proposed as a required Liberal Arts course at the freshman level. The plan for the first run of the course was developed as a study of a neighborhood near the IUPUI campus, that students would visit and learn to view from the perspectives, and via the methods, of all of the School of Liberal Arts disciplines. The course received initial approval, with one of its initiators, a professor in the history department, chosen to be the course coordinator on the first run. The structure of the University and the school prevented that from occurring, however, because all budgeting was by departments, and with money tight, the history department decided that it could not give the instructor released time for what it agreed was a worth while undertaking. Thus, it was not until well into the 1990’s that a significant amount of integrative work began to enter the curriculum.

By that time, a growing concern had developed in academia nationally, that steps needed to be taken to overcome the fragmentation of knowledge in its compartmentalization in the academic structure to provide students with a more holistic understanding. Thus, the IUPUI
Executive Dean initiated a number of interschool discussions that led to a minimal set of core required courses that all IUPUI schools were encouraged to include in their undergraduate course requirements, and a joint decision by the School of Science and the School of Liberal Arts to develop sets of entry level and senior level required classes that would include both the physical sciences and the social sciences and humanities. To make these classes a reality, the university provided separate budgeting. Thus it is clear that to fully develop holistic participatory education, the structure of educational institutions also has to change.

Broader Evidence that Student Participation Increases Learning

There is now a good deal of evidence from studies at universities that, consistent with Indigenous views on experiential learning, active participation by students with the material being studied increases learning. This includes examples from the physical sciences.

At the University of California in 2014, the chemistry department tried running two different versions of its introductory chemistry course. The traditional class had hundreds of students quietly hearing a lecture for 80 minutes, with just a few questions asked by students. Most students took notes, while a few slept. In the alternative class, the instructor fired questions at students and asked them to explain their answers, and expand on them. Every few minutes she broke the class into small groups to solve problems. Since any student might be asked a question at any time, there was pressure to do the assigned reading before class. Consistent with other research, students found the alternative participatory class more stimulating and learned more than in the traditional lecture course.

An earlier comparison of two versions of an introductory physics course showed not only the increased student appreciation of a class and greater leaning by greatly increasing student participation in the class, but also the value of engaging students’ imagination, in this case with guided meditation. This is more effective because it makes the learning process more whole brain, and less primarily left brained or primarily intellectual. In the more standard physics course, lecture was supported by very good audio visual presentation. This included charts showing the movements of electrons around the nucleolus of an atom. In the alternative class, in addition to the lecture and the audio visuals, the instructor employed guided imagination meditations to more actively and holistically involve the students with the material. For example, in the study of atomic physics, students were asked to close their eyes and imagine how they would behave if they were an electron with certain properties. Tests demonstrated that students in the alternative guided imagination class attained a deeper understanding of the concepts and had a better short and long run retention of the factual material.

Section 8: Life Long Education

By nature, education – learning – is a life long process. This is not only true for human beings, but of all life; for living beings are by nature adaptive – creative – to changing circumstances. For people to live well, to have deeply meaningful lives, they need to learn continually, and as Native people recognized, those who do that well over time obtain wisdom.
Continual learning beyond formal education is especially important for participatory politics and economics. As situations change and new knowledge becomes known, people need not only additional information – or old information that was not previously known to them – but understanding in order to live well, and adapt to events, in all aspects of their lives. This is especially the case for decision making. Thus ongoing public education is essential for well working participatory democracy. A good deal of learning will take place directly from the discussion and experience which is at the heart of participatory processes. Moreover, the participatory person, educated to think deeply and question will insist upon self-education, and co-education through dialoguing with others. But there is also a need for conscious civic education by government, non-governmental organizations, the media, and fellow citizens. This needs to be in the form of thoughtful and thought provoking presentation – often through dialoguing or otherwise presenting the various aspects and views of issues – and not as propaganda. In a participatory society with participatory citizens, however, pure propaganda is usually not effective, for people will question it, turning initial assertion into discussion. This is not to say that some exhortation is not needed, on moral, health, or safety issues, such as campaigns to discourage smoking, or not to drive while drinking. American Indian elders certainly exorted their fellow tribespersons to act properly. But, in tribal society, and in any participatory society, exhortation is engaged in not on the basis of hierarchical authority, but among equally valued fellow citizens. It is normally undertaken after long discussion, on a basis of reasonable consensus, and if it is not, it is, and ought to be, open to question.

An interesting event in the way of civic education leading to more participation was occurring in the United States in the summer of 2015. As a result of the popularity of a growing body of scientific study indicating that experience and not objects bring about the most happiness, many people, especially those in their twenties and thirties, were buying things less, and spending more on experiences, such as out of town vacations, gym memberships and meals with friends.

As of March 2018, some significant movement toward more holistic and participatory education was in progress in the United States and elsewhere. While the instructive developments of many years at the East Harlem Public School are no longer continuing, the Putney School has become a major player in a revitalized progressive education movement, and has inspired the establishment of a number of private schools and at least one major public school program. Meanwhile, IDEA: Institute for Democratic Education in America is engaged in a number of education reform projects across the U.S., while Democracy in Education was publishing its Volume 27, with readers around the world, in fall 2017. At a winter 2018 meeting, two education faculty members from The University of South Carolina Upstate, shared with author Stephen Sachs that numerous public schools, disenchanted with what has been required by recent federal programs, have begun to adopt aspects of Dewey's progressive education. They have done so because they, and others, have found these approaches work, although in a great many instances they are unaware of their origins in John Dewey and other progressives, or of their older American Indian roots.

What makes progressive and other indigenous oriented education particularly relevant is that a great deal of recent and current research indicates that it is the best way to undertake learning. Escuela Nueva, which has been spreading rapidly across Latin America and Africa, was founded on the basis of this research, as is discussed above.
Overall, good holistic democratic education in institutions of learning and beyond is essential for well working participatory society, and for living well. Conversely, participatory society and culture provide and encourage a high level of holistic participatory education.

End Notes


2. This is the general thrust of Miller, *What Are Schools For?*, but several sections focus on this concern more particularly, including pp. 195-209.


The school district, he said, was facing a crisis. Its students were overburdened and stressed out, juggling too much work and too many demands.

In the previous school year, 120 middle and high school students were recommended for mental health assessments; 40 were hospitalized. And on a survey administered by the district, students wrote things like, ‘I hate going to school,’ and ‘Coming out of 12 years in this district, I have learned one thing: that a grade, a percentage or even a point is to be valued over anything else.’

With his letter, Dr. Aderhold inserted West Windsor-Plainsboro Regional School District into a national discussion about the intense focus on achievement at elite schools, and whether it has gone too far.

At follow-up meetings, he urged parents to join him in advocating a holistic, ‘whole child’ approach to schooling that respects ‘social-emotional development’ and ‘deep and meaningful learning’ over academics alone. The alternative, he suggested, was to face the prospect of becoming another Palo Alto, Calif., where outsize stress on teenage students is believed to have contributed to two clusters of suicides in the last six years.”

8. The greater complexity and inclusiveness of Indian thinking and approaches to problems is shown in the discussion of the application of the Indigenous Leadership Interactive System (ILIS) in Harris, Sachs and Morris, Recreating the Circle, Ch. 4, Part 1, with direct comments about the greater complexity on pp. 247 and 248, and 274 n50 and n51.


10. Reflecting the change away from community concern for the behavior of its children, in the 1970s and 1980s, Stephen Sachs asked several older people in different U.S. cities he visited how life had changed since they were young. Consistently, a central part of the answer was that when they were young, if they did something wrong, a neighbor would often see it and tell their parents, who would confront them, and often punish them about it. But the elders said this did not happen regularly anymore.


14. Author Stephen Sachs was a student at Putney from 1953-56, and his experience there is the core of the discussion of Putney. Sachs has remained interested in the school, and undertook research in 1991-92 for an article, "The Putney School: John Dewey is Alive and Well in Southern Vermont," Democracy and Education, Spring 1992. The discussion of Putney here us an update of that article with additional research in fall 2015 and spring 2016. Many thanks are due to Alison McRae (a member of the Putney School Board of Trustees) at the Putney Alumni office for updated information as of January, 1992. The Putney School website contains a great deal of information about the school, and was one of the research sources: http://www.putneyschool.org. Thus this discussion of Putney focuses on three periods, 1953-56, 1991-92, and 2014-16. For more details, contact the Putney School, 418 Houghton Brook Road, Putney, VT 05346-8675, (802) 387-5566.
Looking beyond the 2014-16 period, the *Putney Post*, Spring 2016, and discussions by author Stephen Sachs with Putney staff in June 2016, reflected the school's continuing innovativeness in seeking to improve its operation and better achieve its goals. As Don Cuerdon, "Moving from 'Chair Time' to Competency in Defining Putney Graduates," *Putney Post*, Spring 2016, noted, since early in public education in the U.S., under the Carnegie Unit System, requirements for graduation had been established according to the time spent on certain topics or activities, leaving competencies developed by students as the variable. Putney was now seeking to develop a viable policy to "standardize what kids learn, and let time be the variable;" (p. 16) to set minimum graduation requirements based on competencies actually attained, rather than on time spent engaged on a topic, with testing on occasion, that might not accurately assess competency. The new academic program, planned to be launched in 2017, would increase student ownership of their academic work, providing greater flexibility to meet the divergent needs of different students.

15. In 1991-92, 42% percent, and in 2015, 43%, of the students received at least some scholarship assistance including a reduction in fees for faculty children. Diversity is not as great as the school would wish, largely for two reasons: first, the limited size of the school's endowment and other sources of financial aid money to cover the tuition, which in 2015 covered about 70% of the cost of a Putney education. At that time, full tuition was $52,900 a year for boarding students and $32,800 for day students. Second, the high academic standards have made it difficult for some potentially interested students from minority backgrounds and disadvantaged education to be able to qualify academically. Thus the Putney student body, compared to the United States as a whole, is over representative of higher income and better education backgrounds. That, plus its ability to have small classes and a low student to faculty ratio, contributes to its success. However, the success of John Dewey's democratic education in Gary Public schools in the early Twentieth Century attests to the viability of applying the principles that Putney follows in less advantaged settings. Further evidence of this is given in Miller, *What Are Schools For?*. 


17. Head of the Putney School, Emily Jones, "Place/Architecture/Education," *Putney Post*, No. 133, fall 2016. Jones discusses that what is put on the land becomes a part of it, effecting the land and everything on and in it, including the people.

The Cabin Program, and the cabins, are mentioned on the Putney web site. Details were provided by Putney Development Associate Brian Cohen, in an E-mail response, November 13, 2017, to a question about the program from Stephen Sachs.

18. Miller, *What Are Schools For?*, in discussing Dewey and some other educators in Ch. 6, comments that to be fully holistic and developmental of the student, more needs to be done in the spiritual aspect, which Dewey and these others do not address directly in their educational theory.

19. The discussion of East Harlem public schools is based on information and analysis in David Osborne and Ted Gaebler, *Reinventing Government: How the Entrepreneurial Spirit is Transforming the Public Sector* (New York: Plume Books, 1993), pp. 5-8, 17-18, 93, 95-96, 100-101, 103-104, 107, 113, 148-149, 169, 267, 271, and 290, and in Hedrick Smith,
Rethinking America (Random House, 1995), Ch. 6. That proper participatory management increases the performance of organizations by every measure, in comparison with hierarchically managed organizations, is discussed in Reinventing Government, especially in Chapter 9.


23. Ibid., Ch. 4, with direct reference to East Harlem schools on p. 113.

24. Miller, What Are Schools For? discusses a number of educational movements from abroad that have been applied in the United States.


28. Ibid.

29. "Components," Fundacion Escuela Nueva: Volvamos a la Gente,


31. Ibid.

32. Ibid.

33. Ibid.

34. Stephen Sachs, Joseph Farah and Richard Frisbie, "Large Systems Non Violent Change in U.S. Public Schools: The View from Indianapolis," *Organization Development Journal*, Vol. 12, No. 4, Winter 1994. Stephen Sachs was a participant in the process, and witnessed some of the related events during and after this article was written that are included here in the discussion of attempted change at IPS. The Greater Indianapolis Progress Committee web site is at: http://indygipc.org.


39. The extent to which institutions of higher learning have employed the top down imparting of knowledge model have varied according to the traditions of the institution, the academic field, sometimes the academic department, and the teacher or instructor. Professional schools, for example, while they may employ lectures, also include practical, often apprenticeship work, as with student nurses and teachers. Vocational schools usually have a strong hands on participatory element in having students learn through doing. Also, though class room relations might vary, some fields are by nature more participatory as they inherently involve learning by doing, such as in painting and sculpting (as opposed to art appreciation, which may, but usually does not, involve the students trying out the artistic techniques of masters or schools). Certainly, many colleges and universities, to varying degrees, have used dialoguing methods, as, for example has St. Johns Liberal Arts program, mentioned below. As a student and a professor at several institutions, Stephen Sachs noted that some departments took a uniform view to at least some testing, which influenced the method of instruction, and others did not, while individual instructors varied in their
styles of teaching, and the kinds of relations they encouraged in their classes.


41. For more on learning simulations, with discussion of some of the simulations referred to here, see, Stephen Sachs, "The Uses and Limits of Simulation in Teaching Social Sciences and History,” Social Studies, Vol X, No. 2, 1973.


44. Author Stephen Sachs was involved in both the earlier and later IUPUI discussions reported here on developing bridging courses to make undergraduate education more holistic.


47. Hiroko Tabuchi, "Stores Suffer From a Shift of Behavior in Buyers," The New York Times, August 13, 2015, http://www.nytimes.com/2015/08/14/business/economy/stores-suffer-from-a-shift-of-behavior-in-buyers.html. Perhaps a mixed blessing, the surveys cited in this article also showed smartphone sales were also up. These are certainly experiential, and a communication device. Moreover, their access to the internet expands access to information and ideas which is helpful for participatory democracy, But, studies also show that too many in the U.S. and elsewhere are too often replacing actual with virtual experience, including texting rather than having direct face to face interaction (For example, see Kids Health from Nemours, 2013, http://kidshealth.org/parent/positive/family/tv_affects_child.html; and Ravichandran, Padma and Brandel France de Bravo, MPH, “Young Children and Screen Time (Television, DVDs, Computer).” National Research Center for Women and Families, http://center4research.org/child-teen-health/early-childhood-development/young-children-and-screen-time-television-dvds-computer/, 2012.

48. Emily Jones, "Letter from the Head of the School," The Putney Post, Fall 2017, p. 25; and Brian D. Cohen, "Progressive Threads: Putney's Legacy Through the Schools It Inspired," The Putney Post,

50. This included Jim Charles, Associate Dean of the School of Education at USC-Upstate, who can be contacted at: jcharles@uscupstate.edu.

Ph.D. Dissertations from Universities Around the World on Topics Relating to Indians in the Americas, Compiled from Dissertation Abstracts

Jonathon Erlen, Ph.D., History of Medicine Librarian, Health Sciences Library System University of Pittsburgh, erlen@pitt.edu

and

Jay Toth, M.A., Professor of Anthropology, SUNY Freedonia, jtoth@atlanticbb.net

IPJ hosts a regularly updated data base of American Indian related Ph.D. from 2006 – the present. The dissertation coverage includes all languages and is international in scope as far as Dissertation Abstracts covers. This includes most European universities, South African universities, and a few in the Far East. They do not cover all the universities in the world, but do a pretty good job covering first world universities. There is no coverage of Latin American universities' dissertations. The data base is updated in each Winter and Summer issue of IPJ, and sometimes between issues. Since ProQuest, the proviser of the lists of dissertations from which Jonathan and Jay find Indigenous dissertations, no longer goes by months/years there will be titles from various years added in the updates.

Dissertation abstracts Data Base 2006 – the present:

Useful Web Sites

Environmental Web Sites


UN NGO Climate Change Caucus, with numerous task forces, is at: http://climatecaucus.net.


Greenpeace engages on many environmental concerns, at: greenpeace.org/usa/ and greenpeace.org/.

Friends of the Earth is involved world wide in environmental advocacy, at: foei.org.

The Union of Concerned Scientists (UCS) works on a variety of environmental, as well as other, issues, at: www.ucsusa.org.

Environmental Action is active on numerous environmental issues, at: environmental-action.org.

Environment America works on environmental issues in the U.S. at: https://environmentamerica.webaction.org.

Food and Water Watch is active on a variety of issues relating to water and food, at: https://www.foodandwaterwatch.org and https://secure.foodandwaterwatch.org.

The Wilderness Society works on environmental issues, particularly concerning preserving "wild places." at: wilderness.org.

Ocean River Institute works on river and other water issues, at: oceanriver.org.

The National Wildlife Federation, at: nwf.org, and The National Wildlife Federation Action Fund, at: https://online.nwf.org/site/SPageNavigator/ActionCenter, are concerned with environmental issues involving wildlife in the U.S.

The Nuclear Information and Resource Service includes in its work nuclear environmental issues, at: nirs.org.

The National Parks Conservation Association (NPCA) includes in its concerns environmental issues relating to U.S. national parks, at: npca.org and https://secure.npca.org/

Earth Policy Institute, dedicated to building a sustainable future as well as providing a plan of how to get from here to there: www.earthpolicy.org.

Wiser Earth lists more than 10,700 environmental and environmental justice organizations at: http://www.wiserearth.org/organization/
Earthwatch, the world’s largest environmental volunteer organization, founded in 1971, works globally to help the people of the planet volunteer realize a sustainable environment: http://www.earthwatch.org/.


The Environmental Defense Fund works on a variety of environmental issues and policy, including global warming induced climate change, primarily in the U.S.: http://edf.org.


SaveOurEnvironemnt.org, a coalition of environmental organizations acting politically in the U.S.: http://ga3.org/campaign/0908_endangered_species/xuninw84p7m8mxxm.

The National Resources Defense Council works on a variety of environmental issues in the U.S.: http://www.nrdconline.org/

Care 2 is concerned about a variety of issues, including the environment: http://www.care2.com/.

Rainmakers Oceania studies possibilities for restoring the natural environment and humanity's rightful place in it, at: http://rainmakers-ozeania.com/0annexanchorc/about-rainmakers.html.

Green Ships, in fall 2008, was is asking Congress to act to speed the development of new energy efficient ships that can take thousands of trucks off Atlantic and Pacific Coast highways, moving freight up and down the costs with far less carbon emissions and more cheaply: http://www.greenships.org.


Planting Peace is, "A Resource Center for news and activities that seek to build a powerful coalition to bring about cooperation and synergy between the peace movement, the climate crisis movement, and the organic community." Their web site includes extensive links to organizations, articles, videos and books that make the connections, at:

The Global Climate Change Campaign: http://www.globalclimatecampaign.org/.

The Audubon Society reports on and works on issues focused on birds, at: audubon.org.


American Indian and International Indigenous Web Sites

Celanen: A Journal of Indigenous Governance is produced by the Indigenous Governance Program at the University of Victoria, at: http://web.uvic.ca/igov/research/journal/index.htm. Celanen (pronounced CHEL-LANG-GEN) is a Saanich word for "our birthright, our ancestry, sovereignty" and sets the tone for this annual publication containing articles, poetry, and commentary.

Native Research Network is now at: www.nativeresearchnetwork.org. Its vision statement is: "A leadership community of American Indian, Alaska Native, Kanaka Maoli, and Canadian Aboriginal persons promoting integrity and excellence in research". Its mission is "To provide a pro-active network of American Indian, Alaska Native, Kanaka Maoli, and Canadian Aboriginal persons to promote and advocate for high quality research that is collaborative, supportive and builds capacity, and to promote an environment for research that operates on the principles of integrity, respect, trust, ethics, cooperation and open communication in multidisciplinary fields". The Native Research Network (NRN) provides networking and mentoring opportunities, a forum to share research expertise, sponsorship of research events, assistance to communities and tribes, and enhanced research communication. The NRN places a special emphasis on ensuring that research with Indigenous people is conducted in a culturally sensitive and respectful manner. Its Member List serve: NRN@lists.apa.org.

The American Journal of Indigenous Studies is a quarterly journal by the American Scholarly Research Association (ASRA), at: www.ASRAresearch.org.

The Enduring Legacies Native Cases Initiative began in 2006 as a partnership between The Evergreen State College, Northwest Indian College, Salish Kootenai College, and Grays Harbor College. Our goal is to develop and widely disseminate culturally relevant curriculum and teaching resources in the form of case studies on key issues in Indian Country: http://nativecases.evergreen.edu/about.html.

The National Indian Housing Council offers a number of reports at: http://www.naihc.indian.com/.
The American Indian Studies Consortium is at:
http://www.cic.uiuc.edu/programs/AmericanIndianStudiesConsortium/.

Some news sources that have been useful in putting the issues of Indigenous Policy together are:
Pechanga Net: http://www.pechanga.net/NativeNews.html
Survival International: http://www.survival-international.org/.
ArizonaNativeNet is a virtual university outreach and distance learning telecommunications center devoted to the higher educational needs of Native Nations in Arizona, the United States and the world through the utilization of the worldwide web and the knowledge-based and technical resources and expertise of the University of Arizona, providing resources for Native Nations nation-building, at: www.arizonanativenet.com
The Forum for 'friends of Peoples close to Nature' is a movement of groups and individuals, concerned with the survival of Tribal peoples and their culture, in particular hunter-gatherers: http://ipwp.org/how.html
Tebtebba (Indigenous Peoples' International Centre for Policy Research and Education), with lists of projects and publications, and reports of numerous Indigenous meetings: http://www.tebtebba.org/.
Andre Cramblit (andrekar@ncidc.org) has begun a new Native news blog continuing his former Native list serve to provide information pertinent to the American Indian community. The blog contains news of interest to Native Americans, Hawaiian Natives and Alaskan Natives. It is a briefing of items that he comes across that are of broad interest to American Indians. News and action requests are posted as are the occasional humorous entry. The newsletter is designed to inform you, make you think and keep a pipeline of information that is outside the mainstream media. “I try and post to it as often as my schedule permits I scan a wide range of sources on the net to get a different perspective on Native issues and try not to post stuff that is already posted on multiple sources such as websites or other lists”. To subscribe to go to: http://andrekaruk.posterous.com/.
Sacred Places Convention For Indigenous Peoples provides resources for protecting sacred places world wide. Including, news, journals, books and publishing online Weekly News and providing an E-mail list serve, as well as holding conferences. For information go to: http://www.indigenouspeoplesissues.com.
Mark Trahant Blog, Trahant Reports, is at:
http://www.marktrahant.org/marktrahant.org/Mark_Trahant.html

UANativeNet, formerly Arizona NativeNet, is a resource of topics relevant to tribal nations and Indigenous Peoples, particularly on matters of law and governance.
The Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development offers a number of reports and its “Honoring Indian Nations” at: http://www.ksg.harvard.edu/hpaied/res_main.htm.

The Seventh generation Fund online Media Center: www.7genfund.org

Native Earthworks Preservation, an organization committed to preserving American Indian sacred sites, is at: http://nativeearthworkspreservation.org/.

Indianz.Com has posted Version 2.0 of the Federal Recognition Database, an online version of the Acknowledgment Decision Compilation (ADC), a record of documents that the Bureau of Indian Affairs has on file for dozens of groups that have made it through the federal recognition process. The ADC contains over 750 MB of documents -- up from over 600MB in version 1.2 -- that were scanned in and cataloged by the agency's Office of Federal Acknowledgment. The new version includes has additional documents and is easier to use. It is available at: http://www.indianz.com/adc20/adc20.html.

Tribal Link has an online blog at: http://triballinknewsonline.blogspot.com.

The National Indian Education Association: http://www.niea.org/.

Climate Frontlines is a global forum for indigenous peoples, small islands and vulnerable communities, running discussions, conferences and field projects: http://www.climatefrontlines.org/.

Cry of the Native Refugee web site, http://cryofthenativerefugee.com, is dedicated to “The True Native American History.”

First Peoples World Wide, focuses "on funding local development projects in Indigenous communities all over the world while creating bridges between our communities and corporations, governments, academics, NGOs and investors in their regions. We facilitate the use of traditional Indigenous knowledge in solving today’s challenges, including climate change, food security, medicine, governance and sustainable development." http://firstpeoples.org.

The RaceProject has a Facebook age that is a forum for the dissemination and discussion of contemporary Race and Politics issues. It includes a continuing archive of news stories, editorial opinion, audio, video and pointed exchanges between academics, graduate students and members of the lay-public. Those interested can visit and sign up to the page at: http://www.facebook.com/RaceProject.

Rainmakers Oceania studies possibilities for restoring the natural environment and humanity's rightful place in it, at: http://rainmakers-oceania.com/0annexanchorc/about-rainmakers.html.
**Oxfam America’s interactive website:** http://adapt.oxfamamerica.org shows how social vulnerability and climate variability impact each county in the U.S. Southwest region. The methodology exposes how social vulnerability, not science, determines the human risk to climate change.


The **Newberry Library** received a grant in August, 2007, from the National Endowment for the Humanities to fund “**Indians of the Midwest and Contemporary Issues**.” The McNickle Center will construct this multimedia website designed to marry the Library’s rich collections on Native American history with state-of-the-art interactive web capabilities to reveal the cultural and historical roots of controversial issues involving Native Americans today. These include conflicts over gaming and casinos, fishing and hunting rights, the disposition of Indian artifacts and archeological sites, and the use of Indian images in the media. In addition to historical collections, the site will also feature interviews with contemporary Native Americans, interactive maps, links to tribal and other websites, and social networking. For more information contact Céline Swicegood, swicegoodc@newberry.org.

The site [www.pressdisplay.com](http://www.pressdisplay.com) has scanned and searchable versions of thousands of newspapers daily from around the world. These are not truncated "online versions". You can view the actually pages of the paper published for that day. There are also 100's of US papers included daily. The service also allows you to set search terms or search particular papers daily. The service will also translate papers into English.

**Native Voice Network** (NVN: www.NativeVoiceNetwork.org), is a national alliance of Organizations interested in collaborative advocacy on issues impacting Native people locally and nationally.


Tribal Court Clearinghouse ICWA Pages, with a brief review of ICWA and links to many valuable resources including Federal agencies and Native organizations. http://www.tribal-institute.org/lists/icwa.htm. Other resource sources are: the Indian Law Resource Center: www.indianlaw.org, the National Indian Justice Center: www.nijc.indian.com. Other sites can be found through internet search engines such as Google. Some research web sites for ICWA include:


Tribal College Journal (TCJ) provides to news related to American Indian higher education: tribalcollegejournal.org.

American Indian Graduate Center: http://www.aigcs.org.

The Minneapolis American Indian Center's Native Path To Wellness Project of the Golden Eagle Program has developed a publication, Intergenerational Activities from a Native American Perspective that has been accepted by Penn State for their Intergenerational Web site: http://intergenerational.cas.psu.edu/Global.html.

The Indigenous Nations and Peoples Law, Legal Scholarship Journal has recently been created on line by the Social Science Research Network, with sponsorship by the Center for Indigenous Law, Governance & Citizenship at Syracuse University College of Law. Subscription to the journal is free, by clicking on: http://hq.ssrn.com/.

The National Council Of Urban Indian Health is at: http://www.ncuih.org/.

Wicazo Sa Review, i an interdisciplinary journal devoted to the mission of assisting indigenous peoples of the Americas in taking possession of their own intellectual and creative pursuits, is at: https://americanindian.clas.asu.edu/review.


contents were made possible by the American Indian Civics Project (AICP), a project initially funded by the W.K. Kellogg Foundation's Native American Higher Education Initiative. The primary goal of the AICP is to provide educators with the tools to educate secondary students - Indian and non-Native alike - about the historical and contemporary political, economic, and social characteristics of sovereign tribal nations throughout the United States.

The Columbia River Inter-Tribal Fish Commission (CRITFC) has a blog as part of its Celilo Legacy project, serving as a clearinghouse for public discourse, information, events, activities, and memorials. The blog is accessible by going to www.critfc.org and clicking on the "Celilo Legacy blog" image, or by simply entering: www.critfc.org/celilo.

The Coeur d’Alene Tribe of Idaho has Rezkast, a Web site of Native affairs and culture at: www.rezkast.com.

A listing of the different Alaska Native groups' values and other traditional information is on the Alaska Native Knowledge website at: www.ankn.uaf.edu.


A list of Indigenous Language Conferences is kept at the Teaching Indigenous Languages web site at Northern Arizona University: http://www2.nau.edu/jar/Conf.html.


The Council of Elders, the governing authority of the Government Katalla-Chilkat Tlingit (provisional government): Kaliakh Nation (Region XVII) has initiated a web site in order to expose crimes against humanity committed upon the original inhabitants of Alaska, at: http://www.katalla-chilkat-tlingit.com/

An interactive website, www.cherokee.org/allotment, focuses on the Allotment Era in Cherokee History during the period from 1887 to 1934, when Congress divided American Indian reservation lands into privately owned parcels that could be (and widely were) sold to non Indians, threatening tribal existence.

The Blue Lake Rancheria of California launched a web site, Fall 2007, featuring the nation’s history, philosophy, economic enterprise, community involvement, and other topics, with many-links. One purpose of the site is to make tribal operations transparent. It is at: www.bluelakerancheria-nsn.gov.

on Indigenous Issues (UNPFII) and its Secretariat 05 is available at:


The Native Studies Research Network, UK, University of East Anglia, Norwich is at: http://www.nsrn-uk.org/.

The World Indigenous Higher Education Consortium (WINHEC) and its Journal are online at: http://www.win-hec.org/. (See the Ongoing Activities Section for more on WINHEC). The WINHEC site includes links to other Indigenous organizations and institutions.

A link on Latin American Indigenous Peoples:


>>>>--(((+))------------<<<